

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

September 4, 2012
10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 2700 M Street, Bakersfield and the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.

1. Call to Order – The Chair, Amarpreet Dhaliwal, called the meeting to order at 10:04 a.m.
2. Roll Call – was taken and a quorum was present to hold a meeting. A quorum for voting was formed at 10:08 a.m.

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Fresno	Amarpreet Dhaliwal/CIG (P)	Central
	Manuel Cunha, Jr./IAIG (P)*	Central
	Sarah Sharpe/EIG (P)***	Central
	Kevin Hamilton/IAIG (A)****	Central
Kern	Les Clark/IAIG (P)	South
	Nicholas Ortiz/IAIG (A)*****	South
	Brent Green/CIG (P)	South
Kings	Kelly Deming/EIG (P)*****	Central
	Dennis Tristao/CIG (P)	Central
Madera	Donald Horal/IAIG (P)	Central
	Lee Smith/EIG (P)	North
Merced	Tim Durham/IAIG (P)	North
	Mary-Michal Rawling/EIG (P)	Central
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl/IAIG (P)**	North
	Wade Broughton/CIG (P)	North
Stanislaus	David Geer/CIG (A)	North
Tulare	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central

*Mr. Cunha arrived at 10:26 am

**Mr. Hoffdahl arrived at 10:11 am

***Ms. Sharpe arrived at 10:13 am and left at 11:15 am

****Mr. Hamilton arrived at 11:17 am

*****Ms. Deming arrived at 10:08 am

*****Mr. Ortiz arrived at 10:12 am

(P)=Primary, (A)=Alternate, IAIG=Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG=Environmental Interest Group, CIG-City Interest Group

Staff Present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Rick McVaigh, Deputy APCO; Alek Krivobok, Network Systems Analyst; Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards; Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer; Errol Villegas, Strategies and Incentives Program Manager; Samir Sheikh, Strategies and Incentives Director; Jessi Fierro, Supervising Air Quality Specialist; Kevin Wing, Senior Air Quality Specialist; Carol Flores, Operations and Program Support Supervisor

Staff Present in the Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Karen Morris, Office Services Manager

Staff Present in the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) –Nannette Diaz, Senior Office Assistant

4. Public Comments – None
5. Chair Comments – Mr. Dhaliwal reported the concerns regarding CAC attendance were articulated to the Governing Board at their meeting on August 16, 2012 and a new City Primary Representative from Tulare County has been appointed. Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards, announced Frances Ortiz, City of Woodlake Councilmember was appointed to the City Interest Group, representing Tulare County.
6. Executive Director/APCO Comments – Rick McVaigh Deputy APCO reported at the August Governing Board Meeting, the Board approved the revised funding and scoring criteria for the Public Benefit Grant Program which encourages public agencies throughout the Valley to develop cost effective projects to reduce air pollution. He added the Board adopted a position to oppose Senate Bill 1468 that would have allowed fireworks to be sold in the middle of the PM2.5 no burn season. He reported the next Tune In, Tune Up event will be held on September 8th at the Merced Fairgrounds. Mr. McVaigh announced the September Governing Board meeting has been canceled. He added Mr. Sadredin was invited to testify at a hearing on the Federal Clean Air Act in Washington D.C. by Senator Whitfield.

Public Comment: None

3. Approve Minutes of June 5, 2012 and August 7, 2012 –CAC minutes were approved, with no changes.
7. Rule and Plan Updates – Errol Villegas, Strategies and Incentives Program Manager, briefly reviewed Rule 1020 (Definitions) and explained the 2012 PM2.5 Plan update will be presented later in the meeting.

Public Comment: None

8. Verbal Report from California Air Resources Board (ARB) – Elizabeth Melgoza, Air Resources Board (ARB) representative, reported that staff gave a presentation on the Emergency Air Monitoring Program which highlighted how the program supports the State Emergency Plan and the State Emergency Management System. She added the Board approved amendments to the heavy duty onboard diagnostic and medium duty onboard diagnostic requirements. Ms. Melgoza commented that last month, CAC member Derek Williams expressed concern regarding the impact of linking California's Cap and Trade Program with Quebec's and how the impact may affect California industries, specifically agriculture. She explained that on June 28, 2012, the Board adopted Resolution 1228 which directed staff to take the necessary steps to seek review of Quebec's program. She added that linking with Quebec could provide substantial benefits to California Cap and Trade system as it would broaden the market and allow for more opportunities to comply with the regulation. Ms. Melgoza stated agriculture is not a covered sector under the Cap and Trade program and that will not change with the proposed linkage amendments. Ms. Melgoza also reported this month ARB will hold the first set of public workshops to discuss the development of the In-use Off-road Mobile Ag Equipment regulations

Public Comment: *The following persons provided testimony on this item:*

- Evan Shipp, Air Pollution Modeler/Consultant

9. Support Proposed Agreement with UCSF Fresno for Consultation on Health Effects Research – David Lighthall, Ph.D., Health Sciences Advisor, gave an overview of a new agreement between the District and UCSF-Fresno. He explained the rationale for the agreement and qualifications of the Research facility. Dr. Lighthall briefly explained the objectives of the health research.

Mr. Clark requested clarification of the cost of the contract as it seemed low for new research. Mr. McVaigh clarified the contract is to provide consultation to the District on what types of research should be done and also provide linkage with research that has already been completed.

Mr. Geer asked if research has been conducted on the use of roundabouts by municipalities to lower vehicle idling time and school districts implementing no vehicle idling while waiting for children. Mr. McVaigh responded this research will focus mostly on the health effects of air pollution.

Public Comment: *The following persons provided testimony on this item:*

- Evan Shipp, Air Pollution Modeler/Consultant

Mr. Cunha made a motion to support the proposed agreement with UCSF-Fresno for consultation on health effects research.

Moved: Cunha
Seconded: Sharpe
Ayes: Cunha, Clark, Horal, Durham, Hoffdahl, Williams, Sharpe, Deming, Smith, Rawling, Dhaliwal, Green, Tristao, Broughton, Geer
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to support proposed agreement with UCSF Fresno for Consultation on Health Effects Research.

10. Update on the Development of the 2012 PM_{2.5} Plan – Errol Villegas, Strategies and Incentives Program Manager and Jessi Fierro, Supervising Air Quality Specialist gave the presentation on this item. Ms. Fierro noted the purpose of the plan is to address EPA's 2006 PM_{2.5} standard due in December 2012. She commented there has been extensive effort to involve the public and that information is available on the District website. Ms. Fierro reviewed the enhancements to emissions inventory and modeling future air quality. Mr. Villegas reviewed the Plan control measures including contingency measures under consideration. He explained the challenges of meeting the standard by the 2019 deadline and noted attainment hinges on reasonable transportation conformity budgets. Ms. Fierro added the Valley Metropolitan Planning Organizations (MPO), ARB and the District have been communicating regularly to resolve the issues and set reasonable transportation emission budgets.

Mr. Cunha thanked the staff for their efforts in developing the PM_{2.5} Plan. He asked if ARB staff is working closely with District staff. Samir Sheikh, Strategies and Incentives Director, responded the District staff is working closely with ARB staff. He added the next scheduled workshop will also include ARB staff discussing modeling and research.

Mr. Tristao asked if the High Speed Rail Authority is working with the District staff on the transportation conformity issues. Mr. McVaigh responded staff will determine if high speed rail has any impact on conformity and bring information to the next meeting. Mr. Tristao asked if the District is available to assist Corcoran School District in analyzing the air quality impacts in neighborhood oriented schools. Mr. McVaigh responded affirmatively. Mr. Tristao asked if an appeal to EPA is possible at the point mobile sources are

a major percentage of pollution. Mr. McVaigh stated Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO, will testify before a Congressional committee and this is one of the issues that will be addressed.

Ms. Rawling thanked staff for the presentation. She suggested public may be encouraged to participate more if the workshops were held over multiple days. She asked about the specific quantities of the reduction for PM2.5. Mr. Villegas explained he did not have that information available immediately, and staff will disburse the information via email after CAC meeting. Ms. Rawling asked how the decision was made to include episodic construction measures as a contingency measure. Mr. McVaigh responded staff was focusing on directly emitted PM2.5 due to the greater impact on exposure to people and explained all diesel engines emit diesel particulate, but one of the biggest categories is construction equipment. Ms. Rawling asked how often the MPO's are given their budget allotment. Ms. Fierro responded the time period varies. She added the MPO must demonstrate transportation conformity at least every 24 months and sometimes more often depending on how often an attainment plan is created. Ms. Rawling asked if the budgets for the MPO's are the same. Ms. Fierro explained the budgets are based on a variety of factors including population. Ms. Rawling asked if funding only came from the Federal Government. Ms. Fierro explained transportation conformity is specifically designed to ensure projects conform to federal funding requirements. Ms. Rawling asked how often MPO's exceed their budgets and what are the penalties. Ms. Fierro explained a conformity lapse occurs when the transportation plan does not correspond with the attainment plan. She added a new project cannot begin if a MPO is in a lapse with the exception of projects necessary for safety and certain mass transit projects. Ms. Fierro explained to end the lapses either the MPO's would amend the transportation plan or attainment plan. Ms. Rawling requested information from all MPO's and if they have exceeded their budgets. Ms. Fierro responded the information will be provided at the next CAC meeting.

Public Comment: *The following persons provided testimony on this item:*

- Bob Smith, Bakersfield resident
- Colby Morrow, Southern California Gas Company
- Evan Shipp, Air Quality Modeler/Consultant

Ms. Sharpe left at 11:14 a.m.

Mr. Green left at 11:40 a.m.

11. Additional U.S. EPA Funding for the District's Technology Advancement Program – Mr. Sheikh introduced Kevin Wing, Senior Air Quality Specialist, who gave the presentation on this item. Mr. Wing reviewed the history of the Technology Advancement Program (TAP) and what technologies were

funded. He added EPA has provided funding support and would be made available in the upcoming Request For Proposal (RFP). Mr. Wing reported the RFP recommendations will be presented to the Governing Board in early 2013 and encouraged outreach assistance from CAC members.

Mr. Cunha requested clarification that the funding will be for projects to improve the Valley's air pollution. Mr. Sheikh responded affirmatively.

Public Comment: None

Mr. Cunha made a motion to support the additional U.S. EPA funding for the District's Technology Advancement Program.

Moved: Cunha
Seconded: Hamilton
Ayes: Cunha, Clark, Horal, Durham, Hoffdahl, Williams, Hamilton, Deming, Smith, Rawling, Dhaliwal, Tristao, Broughton, Geer
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to support the additional U.S. EPA funding for the District's Technology Advancement Program.

12. Environmental Justice Advisory Group (EJAG) Business –

- a. **Verbal Report on EJAG Activities:** Mr. Derek Williams, Tulare County At-Large Representative, reported the Annual Goals and Objective Action Plan were discussed.

Mr. McVaigh reported that due to there not being a Governing Board meeting in September, the EJAG members cannot be appointed/reappointed so there will be an orientation meeting for new and existing members of EJAG on September 27, 2012, instead of the regular EJAG meeting. (This meeting has since been cancelled because several new members were not able on that date)

- b. **Reappoint Kevin Hamilton, Environmental Interest Group Alternate Member, to EJAG –**

Public Comment: None

Moved: Dhaliwal

Seconded: Williams
Ayes: Cunha, Clark, Horal, Durham, Hoffdahl,
Williams, Hamilton, Deming, Smith, Rawling,
Dhaliwal, Tristao, Broughton, Geer
Nays: None

***Motion unanimously carried to reappoint Kevin Hamilton,
Environmental Interest Group Alternate Member to EJAG.***

The remaining sub-items were combined for purposes of voting:

- c. Reappoint Riley E. Jones, Industry/Ag Interest Group
Primary Member, to EJAG**
- d. Appoint CAC City Interest Primary Member to EJAG – Mr.
Williams nominated Dennis Tristao as the CAC City Interest
Primary Member to EJAG. Mr. Tristao accepted the nomination.**
- e. Approve Recommendations to Reappoint/Appoint Members
to EJAG:**
 - At-Large Representatives:
Esperanza Vielma, San Joaquin County
Rayna Ruiz, Stanislaus County
Melissa J. Kelly Ortega, Merced County
Michelle Garcia, Madera County
Sandra Celedon-Castro, Fresno County
Maricela Mares-Alatorre, Kings County
Derek Williams, Tulare County
Robert Smith, Kern County
 - Ethnic, Small-Business Owners:
Marvin Dean
Praveen Buddiga, M.D.

Public Comment: None

Moved: Cunha
Seconded: Williams
Ayes: Cunha, Clark, Horal, Durham, Hoffdahl,
Williams, Hamilton, Deming, Smith, Rawling,
Dhaliwal, Tristao, Broughton, Geer
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to reappoint Riley E. Jones, Industry/Ag Interest Group Primary Member, to EJAG; appoint Dennis Tristao, City Interest Primary Member to EJAG; Approve Recommendations to Reappoint/Appoint Members to EJAG.

13. Outreach and Communications Report – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, reported the District is actively seeking more entries for the Kid's Calendars. Ms. Holt reported the Tune In, Tune Up event at the Fresno Fairgrounds was a success.

Mr. Cunha asked if another Tune In, Tune Up event will take place in Fresno. Ms. Holt responded affirmatively.

Public Comment: None

14. CAC Member Comments; CAC Member Suggestions To Be Included In The Presentation Of The CAC Report During The Governing Board Meeting on September 20, 2012 – None

15. Volunteer to Present Report During Governing Board Meeting – Mr. Dhaliwal volunteered to present the report during the Governing Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 12:05 a.m.

Next Meeting – The next meeting is scheduled on October 2, 2012. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.