

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

December 6, 2022, 2022
10:00 a.m.

Meeting held via video teleconferencing with the Central Region Office (Fresno). This meeting was also webcast.

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Chair, Manuel Cunha, called the meeting to order at 10:02 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold the meeting.

<u>County</u>	<u>Member Name/Interest Group</u>	<u>Location</u>
Fresno	Manuel Cunha / IAIG (P)	Fresno
	Kacey Auston-Tibbetts /EIG (P)	Fresno
Kern	John Sanders / EIG (P)	Bakersfield
	Orchel Krier / CIG (P)	Bakersfield
Kings	Laura Brown / IAIG (P)	Fresno
	Kelly Deming / EIG (P)	Fresno
	Patricia Matthews/ CIG (A)	Fresno
Madera	Donald Horal / IAIG (P)	Fresno
Merced	Julie Connel / EIG (P)	Modesto
San Joaquin	Ned Leiba / EIG (P)	Modesto
	Ben Cantu / CIG (P)	Modesto
	Roger Hoffdahl / IAIG (P)	Modesto
Stanislaus	Chris Savage / IAG (P)	Modesto
Tulare	Derek Williams / IAIG (P)	Fresno

** (P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group*

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR OCTOBER 4, 2022 – Mr. Manuel Cunha, Chair, asked for member comments on the minutes for the previous CAC meeting. With the correction of attendance for Mr. Krier and Mr. Horal, he declared the minutes approved.

Public Comment: none

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – none

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – Mr. Cunha welcomed the board and staff, and took a minute to send well wishes to CAC Member Mr. Les Clark who is recovering in the from a serious illness.
6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Ryan Hayashi, Deputy APCO, provided the CAC members with an update on the following item:
 - The annual residential wood burning curtailment season began November 1st. As part of the District’s comprehensive Residential Wood Smoke Reduction program, in the winter months the District prohibits wood burning on days with conditions that are conducive to the formation of poor air quality. As part of the strategy, the District also operates a successful incentive program to replace older wood-burning stoves and fireplaces with natural gas inserts and other technologies such as electric heat pumps.

Public Comment: none

7. UPDATE ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Jessi Fierro, Director of Air Quality Planning, provided an update on the District’s planning and rule development efforts.

Regarding Rule 4550, Mr. Savage asked for a summary of any anticipated changes. Jessi Fierro responded that consistent with commitments in the 2018 PM2.5 Plan, the District is currently undergoing a rule evaluation process to include CMP requirements in the rule for fallowed land, and identify opportunities to promote the selection of conservation tillage as a CMP.

Public Comment: none

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (CARB) – Laura Carr, CARB representative, gave a brief update on recent and upcoming actions by CARB.

Mr. Cunha asked about the state Truck and Bus Regulation and the final compliance deadline of January 1, 2023. Mr. Cunha stated that the state will have up to 300,000-400,000 trucks out of compliance and unable to register with DMV. He asked if there was any discussion of what CARB will do when people in rural communities will be unable to drive their trucks and move food across the country or state. Ms. Carr responded that she was not aware of any items on upcoming agendas to discuss this matter. Mr. Cunha requested that that CARB provide an update or information regarding the status of Truck and Bus Regulation implementation.

Ms. Brown, Ms. Deming, Mr. Krier, and Mr. Sanders echoed Mr. Cunha’s concerns regarding the impending compliance deadline.

Public Comment: none

9. 2022 PLAN FOR THE 2015 FEDERAL 8-HOUR OZONE STANDARD – Jessi Fierro, District’s Director of Planning, and Laura Carr, Air Pollution Specialist at the California Air Resource Board, presented this item and led a discussion on the 2022 Ozone Plan for the 2015 federal ozone standard. The 2022 Ozone Plan will be considered by the District’s Governing Board in December 2022 and by CARB at their January 2023 meeting.

Mr. Savage commended the comprehensive presentation with a few takeaways and questions. He said the issue of air pollution in the valley is NOx limited driven by transportation. Another takeaway from the presentation is that VOC’s are not an issue we should spend too much time and energy dealing with as it will not have a material effect on whether or not we will come in compliance with the Federal Ozone standard. The third take away he stated was recommending to be very clear to the Board that there is nothing singularly the District can do that will ever achieve the Federal standard. Mr. Savage asked if there is an economic growth projections built into the plan. He also asked if there are two or three key public investment decisions that must occur in order for us to achieve what the model presented said we need to achieve.

Jessi Fierro responded that there are economic growth projections that vary by sector and the economic growth projections are based on the best information available at the time of the projection. Laura Carr and Jeremy Avise, Branch Manager of CARB’s Modeling & Meteorology Branch, stated that the combined reductions from federal, state, and local measures in the plan will generate the emission reductions necessary to attain the standard as demonstrated in the plan.

Mr. Leiba requested that the health benefits of the plan be quantified and included in the presentation to the Board. Ms. Fierro referenced that public health benefits were included in the plan.

Mr. Krier expressed concern that California’s population is decreasing as people are leaving the state due to the high cost of living and regulatory burden.

Mr. Sanders states that federal and state laws are focusing on idle oil-field well policies that will require more equipment to be used to close these wells and asked if these have been considered in the rules presented. Jessi Fierro responded that there are no new regulations regarding idle wells in this plan. Ryan Hayashi expressed that the types of equipment Mr. Sanders was referring to would fall under the categories of portable equipment that would be regulated by the state and mobile sources that are under state implementation plans.

Mr. Williams supported the Ozone plan but said that he strongly opposed the state’s pesticide commitment. Ryan Hayashi clarified that the pesticide commitment is part of

the state's SIP strategy and not part of the local components of the District's Ozone Plan that will be considered by the Governing Board in December.

Mr. Cunha stated that he wants the concerns from CAC members over the state's pesticide commitment to be on the record and that the CAC does not support pesticide component of the state strategy.

Public Comment:

- Mary Fast, Councilmember, City of Reedley

Moved: Savage

Second: Deming

Ayes: Auston-Tibbetts, Brown, Cantu, Connel, Cunha, Hoffdahl, Horal, Krier, Leiba, Matthews, Sanders, Williams

Nays: Deming

Motion passed to support the proposed 2022 Ozone Plan, with emphasis placed on focusing on the NOx-limited nature of the Valley, increasing state/federal funding for clean air measures, ongoing evaluation of economic conditions, ongoing evaluation of potential health benefits, recommend that pesticide measure not be included in CARB State Implementation Plan, and ongoing updates to the CAC on the implementation of measures.

10. PM2.5 STATE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN UPDATE – Mr. Hayashi recommended tabling this item for the next meeting. Hearing no opposition by any members, the Chair tabled this item to the next meeting.

Public Comment: none

11. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS UPDATE – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, provided an update on District outreach activities, including wood smoke reduction and mentioned the AB617 meeting in Lamont that afternoon.

Public Comment: none

12. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS – Manuel Cunha would like to have a discussion of the role of the CAC and Robert's Rules of Order included on a future agenda. Mr. Cunha would like to thank everyone for their attendance today. Mr. Savage would like to have an item on the ERC issue on every agenda.

Public Comment: none

14. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Cunha volunteered to present the report at the Governing Board meeting on December 15, 2022.

Meeting adjourned at 12:12 p.m.