2023 PM2.5 Plan for Attainment of the Federal 2012 Annual PM2.5 Standard

Public Workshop

March 23, 2023

webcast@valleyair.org
2012 PM2.5 Standard

• EPA established 2012 PM2.5 standard January 15, 2013 (12 µg/m³)
  - District initially designated as Moderate nonattainment in 2015 by EPA
  - District submitted 2016 PM2.5 Plan with request to be reclassified to Serious nonattainment
  - EPA approved Moderate Plan and reclassified District to Serious effective December 2021
  - Serious Plan was due to EPA December 31, 2023

• District addressed 2012 standard along with other PM2.5 standards as part of integrated 2018 PM2.5 Plan, years earlier than required to achieve early emission reductions
  - EPA proposed full approval of Serious Plan for 2012 PM2.5 Standard in December 2021
  - However, EPA reversed decision and proposed disapproval in October 2022
  - In response to EPA reversal, CARB withdrew plan with District concurrence in October 2022

• District/CARB updating Plan for 2012 standard, by due date of December 2023
  - Updated Plan will rely on 2018 PM2.5 Plan, and include revisions as necessary incorporating latest guidance, feedback from EPA in latest proposals, and meet federal Clean Air Act requirements
  - Plan may also include additional analyses for 2006 PM2.5 standard to address EPA comments

• Today’s workshop initiates public process for the 2023 PM2.5 Plan
What is PM2.5?

Particles with a diameter of 2.5 microns and smaller

A mixture of solid particles and liquid droplets in the air

Emitted directly or formed indirectly through chemical reactions between gases
Health Effects of PM2.5

• Premature death in people with heart or lung disease
• Aggravated asthma
• Increased respiratory symptoms – irritation of the airways, coughing, difficulty breathing
• Decreased lung function in children
• Irregular heartbeat and nonfatal heart attacks
• Increased respiratory and cardiovascular hospitalizations
• Chronic bronchitis
• Lung cancer
Protecting Public Health

The District’s mission is to improve health and quality of life for all Valley residents through efficient, effective and entrepreneurial air quality management strategies

• District shall continue to strive to protect health of Valley residents through efforts to meet health-based state and federal ambient air-quality standards, based on science and prioritized where possible using health-risk reduction strategies
• 2023 PM2.5 Plan will demonstrate District/CARB’s ongoing efforts to improve air quality in Valley through a comprehensive strategy
• Through this public process, District and CARB will work to identify opportunities to quantify health benefits of Plan strategy
Valley’s Air Quality Challenges

• Valley’s challenges in meeting federal air quality standards unmatched due to unique combination of topography and meteorology
• Valley faced with variety of challenges including role as major goods movement corridor, high population growth, pollution transport from other areas, wildfires, drought
• Conditions require substantially greater emissions reductions in Valley to meet clean air targets than other regions
Foundation for 2023 PM2.5 Plan to Build On Strategies Already in Place

• 2007 PM10 Maintenance Plan (1987 PM10 standard)
• 2007 Ozone Plan (1997 8-hour Ozone Standard)
• 2008 PM2.5 Plan (1997 PM2.5 Standard)
• 2012 PM2.5 Plan (2006 PM2.5 Standard)
• 2013 Plan for the Revoked 1-hour Ozone Standard (1979 1-hour Ozone Standard)
• 2015 PM2.5 Plan (1997 PM2.5 Standard)
• 2016 Ozone Plan (2008 8-hour Ozone Standard)
• 2016 PM2.5 Plan (2012 PM2.5 Standard)
• 2018 Plan for the 1997, 2006, and 2012 PM2.5 Standards
• 2022 Ozone Plan (2015 8-hour Ozone Standard)
Adopted Controls Are Improving Air Quality

• District has adopted numerous attainment plans and air quality control strategies to address federal standards
  – Stationary source ozone and PM-forming NOx emissions reduced by over 90% through hundreds of regulatory actions
• CARB has adopted numerous mobile source emissions controls
• District/CARB combined efforts represent nation’s toughest emissions control program
• Strong incentive programs ($5 billion in public/private investment)
• Through significant clean air investments, Valley continues to make major improvements with respect to air quality
• While significant improvements have been made, more reductions needed
Progress in Improving Valley PM2.5
Progress Toward Attainment of 2012 Standard

2022 PM2.5 Annual Average by Site

2020-22 PM2.5 Design Value by Site

Impacts from 2020-2022 wildfires removed
## Recent Regulatory Actions Under Plan Commitments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rule 4901 (Wood Burning Fireplaces and Wood Burning Heaters)</td>
<td>Adopted Jun. 2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rule 4311 (Flares)</td>
<td>Adopted Dec. 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rules 4306/4320 (Boilers, Steam Generators, Process Heaters)</td>
<td>Adopted Dec. 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rule 4692 (Commercial Underfired Charbroiling)</td>
<td>Strategy Adopted Dec. 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rule 4103 (Ag Burn Phase-out)</td>
<td>Adopted Jun. 2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rule 4702 (Internal Combustion Engines)</td>
<td>Adopted Aug. 2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burn Cleaner Incentive SIP Measure</td>
<td>Adopted Nov. 2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rule 4354 (Glass Melting Furnaces)</td>
<td>Adopted Dec. 2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rule 4550 (Conservation Management Practices)</td>
<td>Rule development ongoing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rule 4401 (Steam-Enhanced Crude Oil Production Wells)</td>
<td>Rule development ongoing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rule 4409 (Components at Light Crude Oil Production Facilities, Natural Gas Production Facilities, and Natural Gas Processing Facilities)</td>
<td>Rule development ongoing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rule 4455 (Components at Petroleum Refineries, Gas Liquids, Processing Facilities, and Chemical Plants)</td>
<td>Rule development ongoing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rule 4623 (Storage of Organic Liquids)</td>
<td>Rule development ongoing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rule 4624 (Transfer of Organic Liquid)</td>
<td>Rule development ongoing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rule 4402 (Crude Oil Production Sumps)</td>
<td>Rule development ongoing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Example: Significant Emissions Reductions from Industrial Boilers


NOx Emission Limit Decrease | -80% | -94% | -96% | -98%

% NOx Emission Limit Decrease | -100% | -90% | -80% | -70% | -60% | -50% | -40% | -30% | -20% | -10% | 0%
Federal Clean Air Act Requirements

- Attainment Demonstration
- Reasonable Further Progress (RFP)
- Quantitative milestones
- Contingency Measures
- Precursor Demonstration
- Requirements for Major Sources
- Emissions Inventory
- Best Available Control Measures (BACM)/Most Stringent Measures (MSM)
Public Process and Engagement

• District and CARB are committed to conducting robust public process for development of updated Plan
• Strategy for public engagement will include multiple opportunities for public participation to guide plan development
  – Public workshops and technical workgroup meetings to allow for more interaction and engagement
  – Multiple opportunities to provide input/feedback during workshops/commenting periods
  – Opportunities to request specific subjects to be discussed at future workshops/meetings
  – Regular updates to be provided at District Governing Board, Citizens Advisory Committee, and Environmental Justice Advisory Group meetings, other public engagement opportunities

CHECKPOINT & DISCUSSION
The District and CARB are seeking input and suggestions on meaningful public engagement process for plan development
## Timeline of Public Process for 2023 PM2.5 Plan

**June Requirements**
- BACM/MSM
- Emissions Inventory
- Precursor Demonstration
- New Source Review (NSR)

### March
- Workshop #1 (March 23rd)

### April-May
- Additional Workshops

### May
- 30-Day Publication of Proposed Initial SIP Requirements
- District/CARB Public Hearings for Adoption of Initial SIP Requirements And submittal to EPA

### July-September
- Additional Workshops

### October-November
- Publication of 2023 PM2.5 Plan for Public Review and Comment
- District Public Hearing for Adoption of 2023 PM2.5 Plan

### November-December
- CARB Public Hearing for Adoption of 2023 PM2.5 Plan and submittal to EPA

---

**December Requirements**
- Emission control strategy
- Modeling analysis
- Attainment demonstration
- Other plan elements
# Potential Workshop Subjects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposed Topic(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Plan Requirements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emissions Inventory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACM/MSM Analyses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Measure Opportunities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Precursor Demonstration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contingency Measures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Updated Modeling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attainment Demonstration/Target</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reasonable Further Progress</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CHECKPOINT & DISCUSSION**

The District and CARB are seeking input and suggestions on other subjects for discussion.
District BACM/MSM Control Measure Analyses

- Plan must provide for implementation of all BACM, including best available control technologies (BACT), plus MSM included in attainment plan of any state that can be feasibly implemented in the area
- District conducting robust control measure analyses for all PM2.5 and NOx rules
- Ensures implementation of maximum degree of emissions reductions achievable, considering technological and economic feasibility
CARB SIP Elements

1. Emissions Inventory
2. Precursor Analysis
3. State Control Measure Analysis
Emissions Inventory Updates

2022 Ozone Plan

1. EMFAC 2017 → EMFAC 2021
2. Actual pesticide emissions 2017-2020
3. Prescribed fire emissions correction

2023 PM2.5 Plan
Soil NOx Public Process

- Estimated as natural in current modeling platform
- Numerous public comments and papers
- Updated inventory will be included in next SIPs
- Robust public process critical to developing updated manmade soil NOx inventory
Precursor Analysis

- PM2.5 precursors: directly emitted PM2.5, NOx, ammonia, SOx, VOCs
- Model changes in precursor emissions to assess the impact on PM2.5 air quality
- EPA provides guidance on analysis
Role of Ammonia in PM2.5 Formation
## Precursors Analyzed

### Not Included in Analysis
- Directly emitted PM2.5
- NOx

SIP will include PM2.5 and NOx controls

### Included in Analysis
- Ammonia
- SOx
- VOCs

Analysis will determine if ammonia, SOx, and VOC controls are needed in the SIP
Other Considerations Allowed by EPA Guidance

• Emissions trends
• Anticipated growth or loss of emissions sources
• Severity of nonattainment at relevant monitors
• Available emissions controls
State Control Measure Analysis

- Analysis of CARB’s measures for the Most Stringent Measure (MSM) requirements
  - Currently being implemented in other States
  - Assesses stringency and feasibility of control measures
  - Includes measure suggestions during public process
- CARB has previously demonstrated MSM
- Complements District MSM Analysis
CARB Contact

• Please provide your comments on the State’s control measure analysis or other issues to: SIPPlanning@arb.ca.gov

• CARB looks forward to your feedback
Contact

Contact:  Molly Boyett
Mail:  San Joaquin Valley APCD
       1990 E. Gettysburg Ave
       Fresno, CA 93726
Phone:  (559) 230-6000
Fax:  (559) 230-6064
Email:  molly.boyett@valleyair.org
       airqualityplanning@valleyair.org

Visit https://ww2.valleyair.org/about/sign-up/
to sign up for the District’s PM Plans Listserv
Comments/Questions

webcast@valleyair.org