

## Action Summary Minutes

San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

### **GOVERNING BOARD**

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room  
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

**Thursday, December 15, 2016**  
**9:00 a.m.**

***Meeting held via teleconferencing with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield).***

***This meeting was webcast.***

1. CALL MEETING TO ORDER – The Chair, Councilmember Baines, called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL was taken and a quorum was present.

*Present:*

David Ayers, Councilmember	City of Hanford
Oliver L. Baines III, Councilmember, <b>Chair</b>	City of Fresno
John Capitman, Ph.D.	Appointed by Governor
David Couch, Supervisor**	Kern County
Bob Elliott, Supervisor*	San Joaquin County
Buddy Mendes, Supervisor, <b>Vice Chair</b>	Fresno County
William O'Brien, Supervisor*	Stanislaus County
Craig Pedersen, Supervisor	Kings County
Dr. Alexander Sherriffs	Appointed by Governor
Hub Walsh, Supervisor*	Merced County
Tom Wheeler, Supervisor	Madera County
J. Steven Worthley, Supervisor	Tulare County

\* Attended meeting in Northern Region Office

\*\*Attended meeting in the Southern Region Office

*Absent:*

Dennis Brazil, Mayor	City of Gustine
----------------------	-----------------

3. RECOGNITION OF OUTGOING BOARD MEMBERS – SUPERVISOR WILLIAM O'BRIEN, SUPERVISOR HUB WALSH, AND MAYOR DENNIS BRAZIL –

Passing on a message from Mayor Brazil, Mr. Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO, said that Mayor Brazil apologized for not attending the meeting; however, his son was involved in a recent and serious accident that precluded his attendance. Mr. Sadredin said that Mayor Brazil would attend the January meeting to receive his recognition. Councilmember Baines asked Mr. Sadredin to send their regards to Mayor Brazil and his family.

Supervisor O'Brien thanked everyone at the District for all of the hard work they complete each day. He said he has truly enjoyed his 10 years of service on the Board and that when he decided not to run again for County Supervisor, one on his list of cons was giving up his position on the District's Governing Board. He said it was important for him to push on every agenda item with the goal of creating the absolutely best policies for the Valley. He offered a huge thanks to staff for everything they do, noting the progress made towards improving air quality.

Supervisor Worthley commented it was bittersweet to have these changes taking place on the Board. He said this is a very interesting job and the relationships built with folks who work at the District and serve on the Board are the most valuable. He wished Mr. O'Brien well in his new position, and said he would be missed on the Board. Dr. Sherriffs thanked Supervisor O'Brien for his service and said he would miss his largely very wise counsel. Supervisor Wheeler said he would miss Supervisor O'Brien's passion and air quality knowledge on the Board and thanked him for being a friend. Councilmember Baines echoed the comments of his colleagues, saying it was a pleasure to serve on the Board with Supervisor O'Brien as he was certainly one who helped other Board members understand what was happening and keeping them honest. He wished him the best of luck in his new endeavors. Mr. Sadredin expressed his gratitude to Supervisor O'Brien for the guidance and wisdom he brought to the District, noting the "O'Brien Rule" of equal distribution amongst the three regions of the District would continue to be followed. He said he appreciated that Supervisor O'Brien never held a grudge when a policy did not go his way, and that his goal was always to create the best policies for the Valley.

Supervisor Walsh said he appreciates the commitment of staff and Board members to the District goals of improving public health and the Valley's air quality using the most efficient and effective processes. He said he appreciates that focus has never been lost, as well as the willingness of staff to explain the complexities of the issues that the Board is dealing with. He said it was always a pleasure to join with Supervisor O'Brien in advocating for Districtwide representation on programs and issues. He said it has been a pleasure to serve on the Board for the past six years and he looks forward to seeing the District's future accomplishments.

Supervisor Wheeler said he has known Supervisor Walsh for a long time,

including when he worked for Madera County and said it has been a pleasure serving with him on the Board. Dr. Sherriffs expressed his appreciation for Supervisor Walsh's years of service on the Board and thanked him for his wise counsel. Supervisor Worthley said Supervisor Walsh would be missed, not only on the Board but also at the California State Association of Counties.

On behalf of the Board, Supervisor Elliott presented plaques of appreciation to Supervisors O'Brien and Walsh, and commented that both have served as past Chairman of the Board and both have a great legacy of service that they rendered. He noted Supervisor Walsh has always advocated for health, quality of life, and improved air quality for Valley residents while remembering to strike a balance with the need for a robust economy and jobs. He said Supervisor O'Brien will be remembered for his advocacy of an equitable distribution of the District's efforts and funding across all regions of the Valley. He said the "O'Brien Rule" would be a living legacy at the District and it has truly been a pleasure to serve on the Board with both of them and he appreciated not only their wisdom but also their congeniality. Mr. Sadredin also expressed his gratitude to Supervisor Walsh, noting having good Board members and great leaders has been a blessing. He said he enjoyed Supervisor Walsh's judicious efforts at achieving the balance between improving public health, quality of life for residents, while ensuring there is not a severe impact on the Valley's economic well-being.

4. AMENDMENTS TO GOVERNING BOARD OFFICER SELECTION POLICIES AND ELECTION OF OFFICERS FOR 2017 – Mr. Sadredin said this is an item

that the Board appointed an Ad-Hoc Subcommittee to consider whether to continue using the current Chair Rotation Schedule. He expressed his appreciation to the Ad-Hoc Subcommittee members, including Councilmember Baines, Supervisor O'Brien, Councilmember Ayers, Supervisor Wheeler, Councilmember Gurrola, Dr. Capitman and Supervisor Worthley. He said in recognition of the complexity and high stake issues faced by the District the Subcommittee thought it best to assess who might be the best Chair for the Board on an annual basis and unanimously agreed on the following recommendations for amendments to Governing Board Officer Selection Policies:

1. Approve amendments to the Governing Board Officer Selection Policies incorporating the following changes:
  - a. Establish an Ad-Hoc Governing Board Officer Nomination Subcommittee in lieu of a pre-established rotation schedule.
  - b. Ad-Hoc Governing Board Officer Nomination Subcommittee shall have two members from each region. Unless limited by vacancies, appointees to the Subcommittee should be proportional to Governing Board membership categories.
  - c. A Board member may be nominated to serve as the Chair or Vice Chair for no more than two consecutive years.

- d. Annual nominations by the Ad-Hoc Governing Board Officer Nomination Subcommittee shall be those members found to be best prepared and best positioned to help advance the District's interests and objectives.
- e. Members nominated must have a minimum tenure of one year on the Board to be eligible to serve as Chair or Vice Chair. Two or more years of tenure are preferred.
- f. Vice Chair is not automatically nominated to serve as the Chair for the following year.
- g. It is preferred that the Chair position rotate regionally to the extent that such a rotation is consistent with the above guiding principles and preferences.

In accordance with these amendments, he explained the Ad-Hoc Subcommittee nominated Councilmember Oliver L. Baines III to serve as Chair and Supervisor Buddy Mendes to serve as Vice Chair for 2017.

Supervisor Worthley commented that the results of this last election demonstrate the wisdom of this change in policy. When the Subcommittee met, he said they did not know the outcomes of certain elections that had recently taken place, including that the Board would lose four of its members, and that the person who potentially would take the place of the fifth member would lose his reelection in the City of Tulare. Having those types of disruptions in the membership of the Board shows the importance of ensuring the best and most experienced person for the role of Chair is selected. Mayor Ayers said it is important that the composition of the Board makeup be addressed in the Chairmanship, including County and City seats and appointed members.

Dr. Capitman commented that he was initially distressed by the conversation leading toward of exclusion of certain groups; however, he was very pleased with the decision to make this an open electoral process. He said since that meeting, many people have raised questions to him on how members are appointed to the Board, which led him to think the nomination for Chair should be a public process. He said he is delighted that Councilmember Baines would remain in the role of Chair for 2017 but said he worried that the language in the Subcommittee's recommended would reduce the chance of an open and public conversation in the future. Supervisor Mendes congratulated the Subcommittee on their hard work. He said this was not an easy item to consider, but in the end, the person who leads the Board must also have the full confidence of the Board.

Dr. Sherriffs commented that outgoing members have noted one of the distinguishing traits of the Board is the collegiality among members, which he felt was best served by the current rotation schedule. He said it appears the role of the Chair is changing into more of a leadership role, versus more of an administrative role in making sure meetings were conducted efficiently, etc. He voiced preference for a more public process for the Chair nomination in the future and he would be in favor of continuing the process and not moving forward with today's recommendation. Supervisor Wheeler commented that the Ad Hoc

Subcommittee was an accurate reflection of the Board's current make up and completely reviewed both the current and proposed processes. He said the majority of boards that he has served on use a similar process to nominate a Chair and Vice Chair for the following year.

Supervisor Worthley noted that the proposed amendments to the Governing Board Officer Selection Policies include a return by the Ad-Hoc Governing Board Officer Nomination Subcommittee to the Board for action, thereby ensuring a very public process. He said this is a very expeditious way to move the process forward, and voiced appreciation for Supervisor Mendes' comments that it is important that the Chairman have the confidence of the Board as they are considered the spokesperson for the District, including meetings conducted in Washington, DC.

Dr. Capitman suggested amending the proposal, suggesting that at the time of the appointments to the Ad-Hoc Subcommittee, the Governing Board shall communicate to the Subcommittee members the Board's priorities that should be considered in evaluating nominees. Supervisor Elliott echoed Supervisor Worthley's comments that there are currently adequate provisions for public transparency and participation in the process. He voiced agreement with the conclusions reached by the Subcommittee, including the provisions requiring a certain amount of time served on the Board before serving as Chair to ensure the best person is selected for that position. Supervisor Walsh voiced support for the recommendations of both the Subcommittee and Dr. Capitman.

Mr. Sadredin said in terms of the Ad-Hoc Subcommittee, barring any vacancies precluding this, the Subcommittee would consist of 3 County Supervisors, 2 Councilmembers and 1 Governor Appointee for a total of 6 members which is proportional to the makeup of the Board in its entirety. He also voiced agreement with Dr. Capitman's suggestion.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Genevieve Gale, Coalition for Clean Air

Councilmember Baines expressed his deep honor to the Subcommittee for nominating him to serve as Chair for 2017. He said he thinks that all Boards should select their own Chairperson as it is practical especially for those advocating for important issues such as those faced by the District. He also wholeheartedly endorsed Dr. Capitman's recommendation. Supervisor Worthley made a motion to approve the proposed amendments and Election of Officers for 2017, including the recommendation by Dr. Capitman that at the time of the appointments, the Governing Board shall communicate to the Subcommittee the Board's priorities that should be considered in evaluating nominees. Dr. Sherriffs highlighted the guidance that to the extent possible, the Chair position should rotate geographically – amongst cities, counties, and Governor Appointees.

Moved: Worthley  
Seconded: Wheeler  
Ayes: Ayers, Capitman, Couch, Elliott, Mendes, O'Brien,  
Pedersen, Sherriffs, Walsh, Wheeler, Worthley, Baines  
Nays: None

***Motion unanimously carried to approve amendments to Governing Board Officer Selection Policies and Election of Officers for 2017, with an additional amendment that states that at the time of the appointments, the Governing Board shall communicate to the Subcommittee the Board's priorities that should be considered in evaluating nominees***

5. APPROVAL OF CONSENT CALENDAR – (Item Numbers 16 – 20): *These matters are routine in nature and are usually approved by a single vote. Prior to action by the Board, the public was given the opportunity to comment on any consent item.*

16. APPROVE ACTION SUMMARY MINUTES FOR THE SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY UNIFIED AIR POLLUTION CONTROL DISTRICT GOVERNING BOARD MEETING OF THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 17, 2016

17. RECEIVE AND FILE LIST OF SCHEDULED MEETINGS FOR 2017

18. RECEIVE AND FILE OPERATION STATISTICS SUMMARIES FOR NOVEMBER 2016

19. RECEIVE AND FILE BUDGET STATUS REPORTS AS OF NOVEMBER 30, 2016

20. RECEIVE AND FILE THE DISTRICT'S ANNUAL OFFSET EQUIVALENCY REPORT TO THE FEDERAL ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

Public Comment: None

Moved: Wheeler  
Seconded: Mendes  
Ayes: Ayers, Capitman, Couch, Elliott, Mendes, O'Brien,  
Pedersen, Sherriffs, Walsh, Wheeler, Worthley, Baines  
Nays: None

***Motion unanimously carried to approve Consent Calendar Items 16 - 20***

6. PUBLIC COMMENT – None
7. REPORT ON DISTRICT CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE ACTIVITIES – Manuel Cunha, Citizens Advisory Committee (CAC) Chair, reported on the following highlights from the CAC meeting held on December 6, 2016:
- CAC members received detailed updates on:
    - Efforts at the Bakersfield-Planz air monitoring station located at the Bakersfield Municipal Airport and operated by the State Air Resources Board to mitigate localized dust impacts from nearby sources and to analyze the causes of an abnormally high concentration measured on May 5, 2013.
    - The District’s Presidential Transition efforts
    - Ongoing District efforts to prepare an integrated PM2.5 strategy to address multiple federal PM2.5 standards
  - Members finalized the reinstatement of the Technical Rule Review Subcommittee in light of attainment plans and control measures to be developed in the coming years to address multiple federal PM2.5 and ozone air quality standards.
  - Members received a presentation on potential enhancements to the Healthy Air Living (HAL) Schools program.

Mr. Cunha thanked the outgoing Board members for their hard work and service on the Governing Board. He also congratulated Chair Baines and Vice Chair Mendes on their election as officers of the Board. Supervisor Wheeler congratulated Mr. Cunha on his recent award as 2016 Agriculturist of the Year by the Fresno Chamber of Commerce, and Councilmember Baines for his recent Fresno Leading Young Professionals Award.

Public Comment - None

8. AUTHORIZE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO TO ENTER INTO AGREEMENTS WITH SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY CHAMBERS OF COMMERCE TO IMPLEMENT ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROGRAMS FOR A TOTAL AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$50,000 – Mr. Sadredin said item is another example of the Board leaving no stone unturned to get every possible reduction in emissions and to supplement the District’s very strong regulatory and incentive-based programs with other measures that can reduce air pollution. In 2007, the Board adopted a Fast-Track Action Plan aimed at reaching attainment even sooner than regulatory deadlines under the Clean Air Act and which included voluntary measures that reduce emissions, and this was one program the Board directed staff to pursue in conjunction with the Regional Energy Efficiency Strategy adopted by the Board in 2010.

He said one key point made by the Board was as the District tries to communicate with businesses in particular, it is important to have a messenger that has greater credibility with them and would be more effective in

communicating the things they need to do. Stockton Chamber of Commerce took the lead in this program, putting together a very effective Green Team, which they initially started on their own and the District has supported over the years. He said the Greater Stockton Chamber of Commerce, Modesto Chamber of Commerce and Fresno Metro Black Chamber of Commerce have implemented this successful program with assistance from the District and are requesting funding of up to \$10,000 per entity.

Dr. Sherriffs voiced support for these great programs, and said he was able to participate in the first Green Business Recognition Award in Fresno. He said this is a great way to support the efforts of small businesses in areas such as water conservation and suggested even more funding be made available for this program. Dr. Capitman suggested asking the chambers to provide a short assessment of the program at the end of the year. Mr. Sadredin responded affirmatively, and noted the organizations are required to report regularly to the District as funds are disbursed for each activity as it happens. Supervisor Elliott commented that this is a great program and has worked well for the Green Team San Joaquin. He recognized Frank Ferral, of Green Team San Joaquin for all of his efforts toward this program. Dr. Sherriffs also voiced appreciation for Mr. Ferral's efforts

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Frank Ferral, Green Team San Joaquin
- Dolores Weller, CVAQ
- Genevieve Gale, Coalition for Clean Air and CVAQ

*Moved:* Sherriffs

*Seconded:* Wheeler

*Ayes:* Ayers, Capitman, Couch, Elliott, Mendes, O'Brien, Pedersen, Sherriffs, Walsh, Wheeler, Worthley, Baines

*Nays:* None

***Motion unanimously carried to authorize Executive Director/APCO to enter into agreements with San Joaquin Valley Chambers of Commerce to implement energy efficiency programs for a total amount not to exceed \$50,000***

*Councilmember Baines announced he would be leaving the meeting for a brief period and the Vice Chair, Supervisor Mendes, would run the meeting in his absence.*



9. AUTHORIZE THE EXPENDITURE OF UP TO \$42,000 TO RETAIN LABORATORY SERVICES FOR ANALYSIS OF PM2.5 FILTER SAMPLES FROM THE BAKERSFIELD-PLANZ AIR MONITORING DESIGN VALUE SITE –

Jon Klassen, Program Manager, presented this item which asked the Board to authorize the expenditure of up to \$42,000 to retain laboratory services for analysis of the abnormally high May 5, 2013 measurement at the Bakersfield-Planz air monitoring design value site that is operated by the California Air Resources Board.

Supervisor O'Brien asked if EPA is willing to look at the analysis and take the results into consideration. Mr. Sadredin responded affirmatively if they are presented with good science. Dr. Sherriffs commented the most important thing in choosing a lab is that the results of the analysis would be accepted. Mr. Sadredin responded this is a highly specialized area and there are not a lot of labs that have the capability to do these analyses. The District has no relationship with any of these labs and they must follow strict industry standards and protocols. Mr. Klassen said both labs have completed similar analyses.

Supervisor Wheeler asked about the process to analyze the filters. Mr. Klassen responded all of the filters are weighed by ARB, and then placed in cold storage to preserve the sample for a period of 5 years. The samples in cold storage would then be sent to the laboratories. Supervisor Pedersen commented that it is unfortunate that the District appears to be viewed with distrust and is being held responsible for an anomaly. Mr. Sadredin responded the Board has always taken pride in using best available science to guide the District's actions and this item is consistent with the Board's guiding principles. Supervisor Elliott said he agrees it is important to have the best reputable laboratory to perform the analysis so there are no questions about the validity of the results. He also agreed with Supervisor Pedersen's comments noting this value is an obvious outlier and the District must spend money to prove it. However, he commented that it is money well spent and goes along with the District's common sense approach. He also commented on the location of the monitor, noting the large amount of dust created when a helicopter hovers and takes off and lands, and said it does not make sense to have a monitor at that location.

Dr. Capitman said he feels it is also important to demonstrate the conditions under which the monitor becomes overwhelmed. Supervisor Walsh stated that the long-term implications are significant and said it is important to let science determine the process. He also voiced support for Dr. Capitman's suggestion. Mr. Sadredin responded that Dr. Capitman's suggestion could be incorporated in the analysis. He noted the high PM2.5 readings occurred in May, which is not typical in the Valley.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Dennis Tristao, Citizens Advisory Committee and Kings County Farm Bureau
- Dolores Weller, CVAQ
- Janet Diets Camay
- Manuel Cunha, Nisei Farmers League
- Jenifer Pitcher, Citizens Advisory Committee and Western States Petroleum Association

*Councilmember Baines returned to the meeting at 10:48 a.m.*

*Moved:* Couch  
*Seconded:* Elliott  
*Ayes:* Ayers, Capitman, Couch, Elliott, Mendes, O'Brien, Pedersen, Sherriffs, Walsh, Wheeler, Worthley, Baines  
*Nays:* None

***Motion unanimously carried to authorize expenditure of up to \$42,000 to retain laboratory services for analysis of PM2.5 filter samples from the Bakersfield-Planz air monitoring design value site, and to authorize the Executive Director/APCO to enter into an agreement with a laboratory on behalf of the District***

10. ADOPT POLICY POSITIONS IN WORKING WITH THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD TO PREPARE THE DISTRICT'S ATTAINMENT STRATEGY FOR PM2.5 – Sheraz Gill, Strategies and Incentives Director, gave the presentation on this item, which asked the Board to adopt various policy positions in working with the California Air Resources Board (ARB) to prepare the District's attainment strategy for PM2.5.

Supervisor Worthley commented on tighter NOx controls for glass plants, noting it appears the District would need to make this adjustment to take credit for the fact that they are achieving more reductions than what the rule says. Mr. Sadredin responded affirmatively, and said EPA sometimes fails to take the District's program into account in its entirety noting glass plants are subject to all of the District's rules and not just the rule specific to glass plants. Supervisor Worthley also asked about wood burning devices used in the State of Washington and the availability and cost effectiveness of them. Mr. Sadredin responded that the District's current rule essentially has the lowest limit on what days that burning is allowed, and he feels the suggestion that ARB adopt point-of-sale particulate emissions standards for residential wood/pellet burning devices equivalent to or exceeding those in place in the State of Washington is a valuable one as opposed to banning all wood burning. Supervisor Worthley commented that 85% of the problem is mobile sources, which could become even larger and EPA needs to step up to the plate. Mr. Sadredin agreed and added that reducing directly-emitted PM is more effective than reducing NOx and

the District is making a good case that they are leaving no stone unturned.

Supervisor Pedersen asked if the District has an equal say in how disputes about proposed measures such as no farming days are resolved. Mr. Sadredin responded there is a hierarchy in how the regulatory process works and the Board adopts the plans that ARB gets to weigh in on before it is sent to EPA. He said that consistent with the Board's guiding principles it is the District's position to not ask for an extension unless it is absolutely necessary. He commented that he was a little disappointed that when he recently laid out the timelines faced by the District to the Air Resources Board at their October meeting, it appeared to be news to them. At the end of the day, he said there might be no other option other than to ask for an extension.

Supervisor Wheeler asked about the difficulty to convince ARB that the District needs additional funding. Mr. Sadredin said the fact that ARB held their Board meeting in Fresno and heard the voices of Valley residents and District staff actually helped their understanding. He said he hoped they would work with the District to identify new funding sources, which would be presented to the Board as part of the Legislative Platform. Dr. Sherriffs commented on the numerous funding requests received by the Air Resources Board. He said that it highlights the importance of the District working with ARB, other agencies and air districts to identify new funding opportunities. Supervisor Wheeler asked if Dr. Sherriffs is adamant at getting the message to ARB about the District's issue with pass through traffic emissions. Dr. Sherriffs responded that it is his highest priority as it is the health of the Valley's residents. He said ARB is also developing an ultra-low NOx standard for light duty trucks, but a national standard is also needed which depends on the District's work in that arena. He said the District needs to be thinking very collaboratively to get to attainment sooner rather than later.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Genevieve Gale, Coalition for Clean Air and CVAQ
- Janet Diets Camay
- Roger Isom, California Cotton Ginners and Growers Associations and Western Agricultural Processors Association
- Dennis Tristao, Citizens Advisory Committee and Kings County Farm Bureau
- Dolores Weller, CVAQ
- Manuel Cunha, Nisei Farmers League
- Cherylyn Smith

*Moved:* Wheeler

*Seconded:* Pedersen

*Ayes:* Ayers, Capitman, Couch, Elliott, Mendes, O'Brien, Pedersen, Sherriffs, Walsh, Wheeler, Worthley, Baines

*Nays:* None

***Motion unanimously carried to adopt policy positions in working with the California Air Resources Board to prepare the District's attainment strategy for PM2.5***

11. AUTHORIZE THE EXPENDITURE OF UP TO \$55,000 FOR CONSULTANT SERVICES FOR AIR QUALITY MODELING – Mr. Sadredin said over the past couple of years, the Board has authorized significant investment in expanding the District's modeling capabilities in terms of hardware, software and staffing, and the District now has one of the most sophisticated modeling systems in the nation. He said as the District enhances its modeling work in support of planning efforts, it is critical to be able to fine-tune the District's strategy and what are the sources of emissions and their impact. Staff believes they will need some outside and expert help to complete this work.

Public Comments: None

*Moved:* Worthley  
*Seconded:* Mendes  
*Ayes:* Ayers, Capitman, Couch, Elliott, Mendes, O'Brien, Pedersen, Sherriffs, Walsh, Wheeler, Worthley, Baines  
*Nays:* None

***Motion unanimously carried to authorize the expenditure of up to \$55,000 for consultant services for air quality modeling***

12. VERBAL REPORT ON EFFORTS OF THE AD-HOC PRESIDENTIAL TRANSITION SUBCOMMITTEE – Mr. Sadredin reported that last month the Board authorized the formation of an Ad-Hoc Subcommittee of the Board to help District staff put together a white paper for the Presidential transition. He said this white paper did not establish any new policies or initiatives that were not previously subject to numerous hearings, considerations and public meetings before the Board. District staff drafted the proposal and sent it to committee members who in turn provided comments and tweaks to the document.

He said this white paper, which is essentially a summary of policy positions already established by the Governing Board, was sent to advocates in Washington, DC through various channels including the Transition Executive Committee and EPA Landing Team. The District's Presidential Transition White Paper was also sent to various members of Congress, including Congressman Nunes who is on the Transition Team. The District also worked with Senator Inhofe from Oklahoma, who has ties with the new EPA Administrator, which will help get the District's message through to the new Administration. He said as the nomination hearings move forward, the District will develop some questions to ask of the candidates that will be helpful in highlighting some of the issues faced by the Valley. Lastly, he said staff would provide further updates as the transition moves forward.

13. VERBAL REPORT ON AIR RESOURCES BOARD ACTIVITIES – Dr. Sherriffs reported on highlights from the ARB Board meeting of November 17, 2016, including:
- The Board heard an overview of the 2030 Target Scoping Plan objectives, greenhouse gas (GHG) emission sources, GHG modeling results and draft policy scenarios developed to meet the state’s 2030 GHG target.
  - The Board heard an update on the status of California’s Cap-and-Trade Program, including information on recent auctions, compliance events, the offsets program, linkage with other jurisdictions, and the status of proposed amendments to the program brought to the Board in September.

Dr. Sherriffs also reported on upcoming matters before ARB in late 2016 and early 2017.

14. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Mr. Sadredin said there will be five vacancies on the Board as of January 2017, noting the vacant Supervisor positions in Stanislaus and Merced counties should be filled fairly quickly by those respective Boards. For the three city vacancies, Mr. Sadredin reported the individual who was expected to be appointed from City of Tulare did not win re-election and the process will need to be restarted, in addition to filling the other two city vacancies. The League of Cities in the North Valley will be engaged and hopefully provide a candidate from the Large City of Stockton to serve and the other vacancy will be a Small City from Stanislaus County. He said the process to fill the city vacancies would take about three months but staff would try to expedite if possible.

He also asked Board members to consider potential dates for the 2017 Governing Board Study Session in late-April or early-May and said staff would conduct a poll of Board member availability. He noted the Study Session would continue to be used not only for strategic planning but also as a training opportunity for new Board members on issues faced by the Valley. Supervisor Walsh suggested it might be useful to schedule the training for new Board members as a general orientation session to get them up to speed collectively. Mr. Sadredin responded affirmatively, noting the District has held similar sessions in the past.

Lastly, Mr. Sadredin unveiled the District’s new “O’Brien Orb” named in honor of Supervisor O’Brien, which is a working device that will serve as a means to notify the public of hourly air quality status and was designed and manufactured completely in house by District staff. He said for the cost of \$200-300 this orb could be placed at school sites to replace the District’s outdated flags as directed by the Board. He noted the first O’Brien Orbs would be displayed in the lobbies of each of the District’s regional offices. Mr. Sadredin said the signals would be transmitted to school sites through the internet and thanked staff for their hard work to create this device. Councilmember Baines thanked Mr. Sadredin and staff and said it was very appropriate to unveil this device at Supervisor O’Brien’s

last Governing Board meeting.

15. GOVERNING BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS – Supervisor O’Brien commented that he was extremely surprised, noting his son who created the first template of the “O’Brien Orb” a few years ago just left Boston to head home from college for the Holidays and would be happy to see the video of how it has evolved and will be put to use in the Valley. Lastly, he once again thanked the Mr. Sadredin and District staff for all of their hard work.
  
21. ADOPT RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING RECEIPT AND EXPENDITURE OF \$3.7 MILLION IN FUNDING FROM THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD FOR THE ENHANCED FLEET MODERNIZATION PROGRAM – Mr. Sadredin said this item was added after the initial agenda went out as ARB notified the District that they required specific additional language in the resolution. He said the Board previously authorized this \$3.7 million in funding for the Enhanced Fleet Modernization Program and there was no fiscal impact as a result of this action.

Public Comments: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Genevieve Gale, Coalition for Clean Air and CVAQ

*Moved:* Worthley  
*Seconded:* Wheeler  
*Ayes:* Ayers, Capitman, Couch, Elliott, Mendes, O’Brien,  
Pedersen, Sherriffs, Walsh, Wheeler, Worthley, Baines  
*Nays:* None

***Motion unanimously carried to adopt resolution authorizing receipt and expenditure of \$3.7 million in funding from the California Air Resources Board for the Enhanced Fleet Modernization Program***

## **ADJOURN**

The Chair adjourned the meeting at 12:07 p.m.

*The next scheduled meeting of the Governing Board is: Thursday, January 19, 2017. The meeting starts at 9:00 a.m., in the Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC) with the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating via VTC.*