

Action Summary Minutes

San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

GOVERNING BOARD MEETING

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

**Thursday, February 20, 2020
9:00 a.m.**

**Meeting held via video teleconferencing with the Central Region Office (Fresno),
the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office
(Bakersfield).**

This meeting was webcast.

- 1. CALL MEETING TO ORDER – The Chair, Supervisor Pedersen, called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.
- 2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present.

Present:

Drew M. Bessinger, Mayor	City of Clovis
David Couch, Supervisor**	Kern County
Kuyler Crocker, Supervisor	Tulare County
Bob Elliott, Supervisor*	San Joaquin County
Christina Fugazi, Councilmember*	City of Stockton
Buddy Mendes, Supervisor	Fresno County
Lloyd Pareira, Supervisor*, Vice Chair	Merced County
Craig Pedersen, Supervisor, Chair	Kings County
Alvaro Preciado, Councilmember***	City of Avenal
Chris Vierra, Mayor*	City of Ceres
Tom Wheeler, Supervisor	Madera County

Absent:

Monte Reyes, Councilmember	City of Porterville
Kristin Olsen, Supervisor	Stanislaus County
Dr. Alexander Sherriffs	Appointed by Governor

*Attended in Northern Region Office
 **Attended in Southern Region Office
 ***Arrived at 9:06 a.m.

- 3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

4. APPROVAL OF CONSENT CALENDAR – Item Numbers (15 – 22): *These matters are routine in nature and are usually approved by a single vote. Prior to any action by the board, the public was given the opportunity to comment on any consent item.*
15. APPROVE ACTION SUMMARY MINUTES FOR THE SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY UNIFIED AIR POLLUTION CONTROL DISTRICT GOVERNING BOARD MEETING OF THURSDAY, JANUARY 16, 2020
16. RECEIVE AND FILE LIST OF SCHEDULED MEETINGS FOR 2020
17. RECEIVE AND FILE OPERATIONS STATISTICS SUMMARY FOR JANUARY 2020
18. RECEIVE AND FILE BUDGET STATUS REPORTS AS OF JANUARY 31, 2020
19. RECEIVE AND FILE KERN COUNTY EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT ASSOCIATION COMPREHENSIVE ANNUAL FINANCIAL REPORT AND ACTUARIAL VALUATION FOR THE FISCAL YEAR ENDED JUNE 30, 2019
20. APPROVE THE ASSIGNMENT OF A PORTION OF VOLUNTARY EMISSION REDUCTION AGREEMENT FROM MG3 PARTNERS, LLC TO WESTERN PACIFIC HOUSING, INC.
21. APPROVE REAPPOINTMENT OF HEARING BOARD MEDICAL MEMBERS GROUP
22. REAPPOINTMENTS TO THE DISTRICT'S ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP

Public Comment: None

Moved: Wheeler
Seconded: Bessinger
Ayes: Bessinger, Couch, Crocker, Elliott, Fugazi,
Mendes, Pereira, Vierra, Wheeler, Pedersen
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to approve Consent Calendar Item Numbers 18 - 22

5. PUBLIC COMMENT – *The following persons provided public comment at this meeting:*
- Connie Young, Citizens Climate Lobby

- Roger Isom, Western Ag Processors Association and CA Cotton Ginners and Growers Association

6. REPORT ON DISTRICT CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE ACTIVITIES – Kevin Abernathy, CAC Chair, gave a report on highlights from the Citizens Advisory Committee meeting held February 4, 2020.
7. RECEIVE AND FILE THE DISTRICT'S ANNUAL AIR TOXICS REPORT FOR 2019 – Dave Warner, Deputy APCO, presented the Board with the District's Annual Air Toxics Report which details the District's efforts and progress in implementing the District's integrated air toxics program aimed at reducing Valley residents' exposure to toxic air contaminants.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Connie Young, Citizens Climate Lobby
- Lucas Williams, Environmental Democracy Project

Moved: Mendes

Seconded: Wheeler

Ayes: Bessinger, Couch, Crocker, Elliott, Fugazi,
Mendes, Pareira, Preciado, Vierra, Wheeler, Pedersen

Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to receive and file the District's Annual Air Toxics Report for 2019

8. UPDATE ON INCENTIVE PROGRAM TO SUPPORT ON-FIELD ALTERNATIVES TO THE OPEN BURNING OF AGRICULTURAL MATERIALS - Morgan Lambert, Deputy APCO, presented Board members with an update on the implementation of the District's Alternatives to Open Burning of Agricultural Materials Incentive Program. He detailed staff recommendations to increase the funding allocation for the Alternatives to Open Burning of Agricultural Materials Incentive Program up to an additional \$3,000,000 for the continued implementation of this program for the remainder of the 2019-20 fiscal year, and to enhance project-specific reporting and data analysis of each recycling/soil incorporation project completed through this program by collecting additional information to allow for more robust evaluation of the overall program effectiveness.

Supervisor Wheeler asked if staff had considered the use of air curtain burn boxes to dispose of agricultural wood waste material. Samir Sheikh, Executive Director/APCO, responded the Board previously put together an action plan for developing short-term and long-term alternatives to the open burning of agricultural waste materials which included the use of air curtain burn boxes. He said the Board amended the District's portable equipment registration program in December of 2018 to allow the use of registered portable air curtain burn boxes

as an alternative to the open burning of agricultural wood waste.

Supervisor Elliott said he received a comment from an orchard grower who was replacing his orchard that the soil incorporation process did not work well. He asked if staff had received similar comments and asked what type of additional research was being conducted to make sure the soil incorporation process works. Mr. Sheikh responded that was a sentiment staff has heard in parts of the agricultural community. However, he added that has not been mentioned for the approximately ten thousand acres that were represented by the projects funded by the District. He acknowledged it was early in the program and said staff would continue to collect information, because some of these issues could take longer to play out. He added there was a general sentiment that questions the ability of soils to break down these materials and what it might mean in terms of nematodes and other concerns. He said staff was very sensitive to those concerns and are very flexible in the program in allowing growers to establish exactly how they would work the material back into the soil. He said so far staff has seen an overwhelming demand in this program and said will be very balanced in how they draw any conclusions from this program and recognize any issues which could impact the viability of the program on a broader scale.

Supervisor Crocker said he appreciated the staff report and said he was very supportive of providing additional funds for this program. He said it should be an all of the above approach as far as providing farmers with additional options. Addressing Supervisor Elliott's comment, he said it depends on the type of equipment that individuals are using because there was certain equipment available that incorporates the woody material into the soil very well, depending on soil type and the type of crop that is being chipped.

Councilmember Preciado said he works around a lot of orchards and has noticed the reduction in burning. He said it made a noticeable difference and he understands the demand for farmers to ask for more funding as they are paying 55% of the costs. He said he supports the additional funding for the program.

Chairman Pedersen said given there were approximately 50 projects in the que for funding and asked about typical turnaround time on these vouchers. Mr. Lambert responded that one an application is complete; staff generally can issue the voucher within a week. He added it was a very streamlined process.

Public Comment – *the following persons commented on this item:*

- Roger Isom, Western Ag Processors Association and CA Cotton Ginners and Growers Association
- Cynthia Pinto Cabrera, Central Valley Air Quality Coalition
- Janet Dietz-Kamei
- Connie Young, Citizens Climate Lobby

Moved: Mendes
Seconded: Crocker
Ayes: Bessinger, Couch, Crocker, Elliott, Fugazi,
Mendes, Pareira, Preciado, Vierra, Wheeler, Pedersen
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to approve staff recommendations for the incentive program to support on-field alternatives to the open burning of agricultural materials

9. UPDATE ON UPCOMING PLANNING EFFORTS FOR ATTAINMENT OF THE 2015 8-HOUR FEDERAL OZONE AIR QUALITY STANDARD - Mr. Sheikh highlighted the importance of this item as the next step in a very long journey of developing plans to clean the air in the Valley. He said in 2018, the Board adopted the PM2.5 Plan which was the latest of a long line of plans adopted by the Board over the years. He said this was a great opportunity to bring the Board up to speed on this latest ozone standard and highlight all the progress the Valley has made with respect to ozone concentrations. He introduced Jon Klassen, Director of Air Quality Science and Planning, who provide an update to the Board on upcoming attainment planning efforts for the 2015 70 parts per billion 8-hour ozone standard.

Mayor Bessinger thanked staff for the very good presentation. He said EPA is required to review standards every 5 years and asked if staff anticipates EPA lowering the ozone standard during the next review. Mr. Sheikh responded the short answer was we do not know. Furthermore, even though EPA is required to review the standards every 5 years under federal law, it can often take much longer. He added they sometimes reaffirm a standard during that review and may not change it. He added EPA is currently conducting a PM2.5 standard review, and it is an extensive multi-year process.

Chairman Pedersen said the District has become very good at developing these plans and asked for a rough estimation of the average costs for these plans. He added it would be good for everyone to hear the costs it takes and effort that goes into developing the plans that ultimately EPA may or may not choose to act on. Mr. Sheikh responded staff have estimated these costs historically at tens of billions of dollars as the District worked with industries, agriculture and others to establish these different control measures. He said as staff now develop measures that go beyond 90, 95, or even 99% reduction in some source categories, the emission reductions are very costly. He added staff is looking at associated costs very closely by conducting socio-economic analyses as part of those different measures.

Chairman Pedersen said education is key as sometimes these numbers may be developed more on a political platform than a data platform. Lastly, he said the astronomical costs to achieve these programs and associated health impacts is going to be the real challenge.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Chris McGlothlin, Western Ag Processors and Growers Association
- Janet Dietz-Kamei

10. SET THE DATE FOR THE 2020 GOVERNING BOARD STUDY SESSION –Mr. Sheikh said it has been a tradition of the Governing Board to hold a two-day Governing Board Study Session which provides a good opportunity for the Board and public to engage in a more relaxed setting on a number of items of strategic interest to the Board. He said staff is proposing to hold the meeting on September 16 and 17, 2020, at the Pines Resort in Bass Lake, CA. Mr. Sheikh asked for Board direction and confirmation of these dates so staff can continue preparations for this meeting.

Supervisor Crocker mentioned these were the same dates as the planned Rural County Representatives of California (RCRC) annual meeting and he would not be able to attend. He suggested at the Board's direction, staff could move forward with these proposed dates, but would look to see if there were alternative dates available. Supervisor Mendes voiced agreement. Chairman Pedersen directed staff to move forward with the proposed dates.

11. APPOINT THE AD-HOC BUDGET SUBCOMMITTEE – Mr. Sheikh said the purpose of this item is to establish an Ad-Hoc Budget Subcommittee to provide direction and input to staff on the District's 2020-21 draft budget. Following the Ad Hoc Budget Subcommittee meeting, staff would present the proposed budget to the Governing Board at a Public Hearing on May 21, 2020. He said final action on the proposed budget would take place at the June 18, 2020, meeting.

Chairman Pedersen appointed himself, Mayor Bessinger, Councilmember Preciado, Supervisor Wheeler, and Supervisor Pareira to the Ad-Hoc Budget Subcommittee.

12. VERBAL REPORT ON CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD ACTIVITIES – In Dr. Sherriffs' absence, Mr. Sheikh referred Board members to the written agenda report on the CARB Board meetings of January 15 and January 23, 2020.

13. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Mr. Sheikh reported on an important CARB public hearing that took place during the past week where they considered adoption of the Community Emission Reduction Programs (CERPs) for the AB 617 communities of Shafter and South Central Fresno, that were adopted by the Governing Board in September, 2019. He said it was a lengthy community engagement process with community steering committees and a number of evening meetings to put those plans together. He added the District has been working to implement a number of those measures since the Board adopted these programs back in September, but it has taken CARB awhile to pull

together their schedule for considering the CERPs for formal approval under AB 617. He said after a lengthy hearing, CARB approved both plans.

Mr. Sheikh thanked the Board for the wide ranging and comprehensive measures that were included in those plans. He said there were a number of comments made by individual CARB Board members and others present that these were the best plans out there. He said it was the goal of staff to continue working with the communities while trying to figure out what the best approach is to implement these innovative and wide-ranging measures.

In addition, Mr. Sheikh reported on the great start to the community engagement process for the recently selected Southwest Stockton AB 617 community. He said there was great public participation at the kickoff meeting and the first meeting of the Steering Committee would be held on March 4, 2020. He thanked Councilmember Fugazi for her work and help to launch a very effective initial meeting that had a very positive energy to it.

14. GOVERNING BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS – Supervisor Wheeler voiced appreciation for a recent Fresno Bee article and said it was nice to see a positive story on what we do at the District.

Councilmember Fugazi echoed Mr. Sheikh's comments and thanked him as well as all of the staff members who came to the Stockton AB 617 meeting. She said the kickoff meeting on January 22, 2020, was standing room only and there were people from all segments of their community that participated. She said she was really looking forward to the first Steering Committee meeting on March 4th and said she appreciated staff moving it from March 3rd to accommodate election night. Mr. Sheikh also thanked Supervisor Elliott for being very supportive of this process and noted that county staff were also present at the meeting and are helping recruit Steering Committee members.

Supervisor Crocker thanked staff for recent events in Tulare County, including one at the World Ag Expo, highlighting a partnership between So Cal Gas and Western Milling to create a fleet of vehicles that are using renewable natural gas in Goshen. In addition, he said Self-Help Enterprises opened a new affordable housing multi-family project and the District was able to partner with Cal Vans to help with that project. He noted there was also an upcoming project with the San Joaquin Valley Railroad in Exeter. He said these were examples of a lot of great work being done by staff and he really appreciated the outreach efforts and being able to show our community some of the good work that the District is doing. Lastly, he said the Rural County Representatives of California (RCRC), consisting of representatives of 37 rural counties in California, has taken a position to help increase FARMER funding, and thanked Supervisor Pareira who was also a member, along with Supervisor Darrin McDaniel from Merced County who is the current Chair and has really championed the increase in FARMER funding. He encouraged other Board members to reach out to their own lobbyists and make sure that was a priority on their legislative platforms for this

year.

Councilmember Fugazi thanked staff for providing a letter of support for Stockton as well as the San Joaquin Regional Rail. She said they have the Stockton Diamond where the BNSF and Union Pacific lines intersect and trains are literally idling for 2 to 4 hours on their tracks in one of the most disadvantaged parts of their city. She voiced hope that they would receive the funding needed to create a rail system that goes up and over so cars can get under and through. She added it was a huge undertaking, but Stockton is ready for it, they just need the funding to have it completed. She reported that Motive Power Systems creates zero emission chassis for medium-duty commercial trucks and has recently relocated to Stockton where they have already created 200 of these vehicles.

Supervisor Wheeler thanked staff for the Tune In Tune Up program event held in Madera two weeks prior. He said they had an excellent turnout.

Chairman Pedersen thanked Mr. Sheikh and Tom Jordan, Senior Policy Advisor, for their recent trip to Sacramento to lobby for additional FARMER funding. He said it is always insightful to have a cross-section of people walk into an office, who represent the full spectrum of the community they live in, when talking about how things are funded. He said this new direction was an indication of the administration's lack of history and understanding of how our programs are funded. He said the great part was that administration members they met with were ready, willing and able to jump in by providing names of people who could potentially help which spoke volumes to the advocacy that this region has provided over the many years. He said he enjoyed the trip and thanked staff for doing a great job representing the District.

ADJOURN

Chairman Pedersen adjourned the meeting at 10:52 a.m.

The next scheduled meeting of the Governing Board is: Thursday, March 19, 2020, at 9:00 a.m. The meeting starts at 9:00 a.m., in the Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno. The meeting will be held via videoteleconference (VTC) with the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating via VTC.