

Action Summary Minutes

San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

GOVERNING BOARD MEETING

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

Thursday, April 21, 2022
9:00 a.m.

Given the international COVID-19 pandemic, and consistent with public health recommendations and Assembly Bill 361, this meeting was held via Zoom Webinar and video teleconferencing with the Central Region Office (Fresno). This meeting was also webcast.

1. CALL MEETING TO ORDER – The Vice Chair, Vito Chiesa, called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present.

Present:

Drew M. Bessinger, Councilmember	City of Clovis
Vito Chiesa, Supervisor, Vice Chair	Stanislaus County
David Couch, Supervisor	Kern County
Christina Fugazi, Vice Mayor	City of Stockton
Deborah Lewis, Councilmember	City of Los Banos
Buddy Mendes, Supervisor	Fresno County
Tania Pacheco-Werner, Ph.D.	Appointed by Governor
Lloyd Pareira, Supervisor	Merced County
Alvaro Preciado, Mayor	City of Avenal
Robert Rickman, Supervisor*	San Joaquin County
Alexander Sherriffs, M.D.	Appointed by Governor
Tom Wheeler, Supervisor	Madera County

Absent:

Craig Pedersen, Supervisor	Kings County
Monte Reyes, Councilmember, Chair	City of Porterville
Amy Shuklian, Supervisor	Tulare County

**arrived at 9:18 a.m.*

3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

4. APPROVAL OF CONSENT CALENDAR – Item Numbers (15 - 24): *These matters are routine in nature and are usually approved by a single vote. Prior to any action by the board, the public was given the opportunity to comment on any consent item.*
15. ASSEMBLY BILL 361 AND DISTRICT REMOTE TELECONFERENCING UPDATE
 16. RECEIVE AND FILE QUARTERLY UPDATE TO THE BEST AVAILABLE CONTROL TECHNOLOGY (BACT) CLEARINGHOUSE
 17. APPROVE CONTRACT WITH ATMOSPHERIC ANALYSIS & CONSULTING, INC. TO PROVIDE LABORATORY ANALYSIS OF CARBONYL COMPOUNDS FOR A TOTAL OF \$44,455
 18. APPROVE CONTRACT WITH ATMOSPHERIC ANALYSIS & CONSULTING, INC. TO PROVIDE LABORATORY ANALYSIS OF NON-METHANE ORGANIC COMPOUNDS FOR A TOTAL OF \$112,388
 19. REAPPOINTMENT TO THE DISTRICT'S ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP
 20. CLAIM FOR DAMAGES AGAINST SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY UNIFIED AIR POLLUTION CONTROL DISTRICT
 21. APPROVE ACTION SUMMARY MINUTES FOR THE SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY UNIFIED AIR POLLUTION CONTROL DISTRICT GOVERNING BOARD MEETING OF THURSDAY, MARCH 17, 2022
 22. RECEIVE AND FILE LIST OF SCHEDULED MEETINGS FOR 2022
 23. RECEIVE AND FILE OPERATIONS STATISTICS SUMMARY FOR MARCH 2022
 24. RECEIVE AND FILE BUDGET STATUS REPORTS AS MARCH 31, 2022

Public Comment: None

Moved: Pareira
Seconded: Lewis
Ayes: Bessinger, Chiesa, Fugazi, Lewis, Mendes, Pacheco-Werner, Preciado, Wheeler, Sherriffs,
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to approve Consent Calendar (Items 15-24)

5. PUBLIC COMMENT – *The following persons provided public comments at this meeting:*

- Connie Young, Citizens Climate Lobby (CCL)

6. STAR RECOGNITION (Service, Teamwork, Attitude, Respect) – Chenecua Dixon, Director of Personnel, recognized the following individuals for reaching a service milestone during the 1st quarter of 2022:

Five Years of Service

Thomas Aguirre, Air Quality Engineer
Diseree Alvarez, Air Quality Assistant
Josue Gonzalez, Air Quality Inspector

Ten Years of Service

Annette Ballatore, District Counsel

Fifteen Years of Service

Renee Chavez, Supervising Air Quality Inspector
Nannette Diaz, Senior Office Assistant
Eric Esposito, Air Quality Inspector
Anna Myers, Air Quality Specialist
Catherine Thao, Senior Air Quality Specialist

Twenty Years of Service

Jonah Aiyabei, Air Quality Engineer
Manuel Salinas, Air Quality Engineer

Vice Chair Chiesa congratulated staff and thanked them for their service.

7. APPROVE ENHANCEMENTS TO THE DISTRICT'S TRUCK REPLACEMENT PROGRAM – Brian Dodds, Program Manager, presented this item which asked the Board to approve enhancements to the District's Truck Replacement Program and to direct staff to continue to work with CARB and other air districts to incorporate similar changes into the state Carl Moyer Voucher Incentive Program guidelines for small fleets.

Vice Chair Chiesa asked how applicants were qualified in terms of cost effectiveness and use. Mr. Dodds responded the cost effectiveness and incentive levels were determined by the number of miles driven and applications were considered on a first come first serve basis.

Supervisor Rickman arrived at 9:18 a.m.

Supervisor Couch left briefly at 9:30 a.m.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Manuel Cunha, Nisei Farmers League
- Kevin Abernathy, Milk Producers Council

Moved: Pareira

Seconded: Lewis

Ayes: Bessinger, Chiesa, Fugazi, Lewis, Mendes, Pacheco-Werner,
Pareira, Preciado, Rickman, Sherriffs, Wheeler

Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to (1) enhance the District's Truck Replacement Program by increasing funding caps for near-zero and zero-emission trucks, expand truck model-year eligibility to allow for the replacement of vehicles six model years old or older with zero and near-zero-emission technology, and update administrative requirements to increase flexibility and facilitate more streamlined processing in accordance with recent changes to the state Carl Moyer Program guidelines; (2) direct staff to continue to work with CARB and other air districts to incorporate similar changes into the state Carl Moyer Voucher Incentive Program guidelines for small fleets and incorporate those changes into the District's Truck Replacement Program; and (3) Authorize the Executive Director/APCO to make administrative changes to the program, in order to ensure successful implementation of program funding.

8. APPROVE LAUNCH OF DISTRICT ZERO-EMISSION SCHOOL BUS REPLACEMENT AND FUELING INFRASTRUCTURE INCENTIVE PROGRAM

- Todd DeYoung, Director of Grants and Incentives, presented this item which asked the Board to approve the launch of the District's Zero Emission School Bus Replacement and Fueling Infrastructure Program to replace existing diesel school buses with new, zero emission school buses and associated fueling infrastructure in accordance with established state and District guidelines.

Supervisor Mendes asked about the range of electric buses. Mr. DeYoung responded the range is improving and currently is in the 125 mile range, which is good for most urban settings. He added if the buses came back home between the morning and afternoon runs, they would be able to recharge.

Vice Mayor Fugazi said some school districts have already acquired the buses and asked if they can apply for the charging station incentives independently. Mr. DeYoung responded affirmatively.

Dr. Sherriffs commented this was a wonderful program and said it was so important in terms of a vulnerable population as well as air quality and

greenhouse gas benefits. He said this was a great reminder that we want to help other school districts participate beyond this funding. He asked what the District will do with the information collected about how the finances work because there would be money saved on maintenance and fuel costs. He said it was important to collect that information to share with other school districts that may be looking at this in the future. Mr. Sheikh responded affirmatively and said looking at the demand through prior work with the Volkswagen program and where the technology is today, there is growing interest by school districts to look at this technology. He said this process will hopefully kick start a lot of interest in brainstorming and preparation for what is potentially quite a bit of funding in the new state budget that is still working its way through the process. He added with the recent federal funding that was put into place there is a national program but the funding will not go far either.

Mr. Sheikh highlighted Modesto City Schools which recently put in an order for 30 electric buses, which was the biggest bluebird electric bus order anywhere in the state. He said they estimate to save about \$250,000 per year, per bus in fuel and maintenance costs. He said besides the air quality benefits, an added benefit was reducing noise pollution for students and drivers. He said staff will be collecting specific information from program participants in terms of maintenance, any issues they might experience, annual mileage and other factors. He added signage was important as well, in terms of public education and letting residents know where the funding is coming from.

Supervisor Couch returned at 9:57 a.m.

Dr. Pacheco-Werner commented that they are continuing to try to refine the state tools to streamline the information for people who may just be looking online before contacting the District. Having attended the Modesto City Schools launch this week, she said it really was a feat to have that kind of record setting in the Valley and it demonstrates how much our Valley can really lean into this effort. She added it was going to take more work because the vision to put all of these funding streams together to make this project happen was quite significant.

Councilmember Lewis said given the supply chain, she wondered what the turnaround time would be for school districts purchasing the buses. She also asked about the cost of the new buses. Mr. DeYoung responded it could be 12 to 18 months to receive a bus. He said what staff have seen new buses cost anywhere from \$385,000 up to just over \$400,000.

Mr. Preciado asked if there would be potential priority for older buses in some of the rural disadvantaged communities. Mr. Sheikh responded the short answer is yes, there is potential for adding some extra consideration or priority as a program like this is considered by the Board. He said staff is recommending to limit it to projects that provide service to disadvantaged or low income communities. He added staff also recommended a limit of ten buses per entity.

Dr. Sherriffs voiced appreciation for the probability that there is more funding in the pipeline and there will be other opportunities to fine tune and narrow the focus and get greater value for the money. He said this launch was also an opportunity to generate widespread interest and said he supported staff recommendations.

Public Comment: None

Moved: Fugazi
Seconded: Sherriffs
Ayes: Bessinger, Chiesa, Couch, Fugazi, Lewis, Mendes,
Pacheco-Werner, Pareira, Preciado, Rickman, Sherriffs, Wheeler
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to (1) approve the launch of the District's Zero Emission School Bus Replacement and Fueling Infrastructure Program to replace existing diesel school buses with new, zero emission school buses and associated fueling infrastructure in accordance with established state and District guidelines; (2) approve up to \$20,000,000 in state Community Air Protection Program funds for zero-emission school bus replacement and up to \$10,000,000 in locally generated motor vehicle surcharge funds for associated fueling/charging infrastructure; and (3) authorize the Executive Director/APCO to make administrative changes to the program as necessary to ensure successful program implementation.

9. DISCUSS PUBLIC FACING AIR QUALITY INFORMATION TOOLS – Jon Klassen, Director of Air Quality Science, and Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, led a discussion on the growing availability of public-facing air quality information and potential opportunities for enhancing air quality communication tools and strategies.

Mr. Sheikh highlighted that the District's air quality information tools are light years ahead of the rest of the country. He said no other air districts are at the level that we are in terms of the way we communicate with schools.

Dr. Pacheco-Werner said this was a great opportunity and said she was glad staff was looking at what would best serve our region, especially with a working group of people like Health Officers, who probably have the most public health expertise on this aspect. She said it would be helpful for staff to seek resident input or work with some of the service organizations and schools to get a sense of how residents think about what the District is leaning towards. She said she wanted to make sure we have a sense of the work cut out for us to help the public understand the tools that the District would be recommending.

Dr. Sherriffs said it would seem that the AB 617 communities would offer a great opportunity to give the District input about what those communities are perceiving as the preferred tools and why. He added they could also provide very important

information on the best ways to interface with communities to get the information out. He thanked staff for their work on this, adding one of our responsibilities is to try and help people better understand all of the information out there and make better sense of it to make the best health decisions. He highlighted the importance of maximizing resident's opportunities to exercise and get outside.

Councilmember Fugazi said she would love to be part of the working group when she transitions off the Board. She said the Stockton AB 617 community had a fabulous event this past weekend where 50 kids built box fan air purifiers and had a discussion about how to get the message out. She said each of the kids that helped build the purifiers got to take one home. On each purifier, in 3 different languages, was the reason why they should use the purifiers due to the disproportionately higher particulate matter and more incidence of upper respiratory and asthma cases in the area. She added the rest of the purifiers were given away at an Earth Day event. She said students from UC Berkeley's Engineering School worked with the kids to build the purifiers and explained how air quality affects their quality of life. In turn, she said these kids become champions for our environment and spread the word to their families and beyond. She said the more activities that the District can do, the more opportunities to engage all levels of education will lead to more champions of the environment who will help spread the District's message.

Councilmember Lewis commented on the lack of air monitoring stations in the Los Banos area, which was impacted by a recent fire in the San Jose area. She asked if additional air monitoring can be placed on Interstate 5 near Pacheco Pass. Mr. Sheikh responded that the District works with CARB and EPA to deploy monitoring stations that meet federal standards and there is the possibility of adding temporary monitoring for research purposes, perhaps leading to additional monitoring, with Board action. He added the District has monitoring in Tracy, Manteca and other areas that are good indicators of what is going on. He said he would continue to work with Councilmember Lewis to identify potential opportunities for additional monitoring.

Supervisor Mendes asked if the Purple Air Monitors were calibrated instruments. Mr. Klassen responded they cannot be calibrated after they leave the factory. He said some concerns with these monitors is that over time they can drift and become more inaccurate. He added there is a lot of effort by groups to try to correct the data after is collected.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Cynthia Pinto-Cabrera, Central Valley Air Quality Coalition (CVAQ)
- Clare Statham, Fresno Resident
- Tim Tyner, Central CA Asthma Collaborative and UCSF Fresno

10. DISCUSS DISTRICT'S ZERO-EMISION VEHICLE FLEET TRANSITION – Ryan Buchanan, Interim Director of Administrative Services, provided an informational updated and asked for input on the District's planned transition to a zero-emission vehicle fleet, in accordance with the District's Green Procurement and Sustainable Practices Policy.

Vice Chair Chiesa said he did not see any issues with the plan as it was a natural transition to change over the fleet. He said it was important for the District to show residents they are willing to do it.

Dr. Sherriffs agreed and said it was important to walk the walk. He said this transition is innovative and aggressive. He added it was important to share this model with other public entities with fleets because this is the direction we have to go.

Councilmember Bessinger commented on two hybrid police vehicles funded by the District and suggested it would be a great opportunity for them to make a presentation and get the word out to other agencies.

Public Comment - None

11. REPORT ON 2021-2022 WINTER RESIDENTIAL WOODSMOKE REDUCTION STRATEGY – Mr. Klassen, Ms. Holt, and Mr. Sheikh reported on implementation of the residential woodsmoke reduction strategy in the 2021-22 winter season.

Public Comment – *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Clare Statham, Fresno Resident

12. VERBAL REPORT ON CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD ACTIVITIES – Dr. Pacheco-Werner reported on highlights of the CARB meetings on March 10, 2022 and March 24, 2022.

13. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Mr. Sheikh wished everyone a happy Earth Day, and said it was a particularly busy time for District staff in terms of partnership and outreach. He said they were working with a number of organizations throughout the Valley to be out there and provide information about the various grants and other opportunities and information around air quality and public health. He announced May 2nd through May 5th is National Air Quality Awareness Week. Lastly, he announced that the American Lung Association released their State of the Air Report. He said based on the tough grading methodology used in the report most of the counties throughout the state receive very low grades, particularly due to the wildfire impacts that we have seen recently. He said on the positive front, there is recognition that there has been ongoing progress as well. He said the District would continue to address wildfires as they continue to be very impactful to air quality and public health in the Valley.

14. GOVERNING BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS – Councilmember Bessinger said he was pleased to see that Fresno State had chipped their recent orchard removals instead of burning them, which was much healthier for the many residents in the surrounding area. He also expressed concern about CARB’s Truck and Bus Regulation that is phasing out a number of trucks by the end of this year. Mr. Sheikh said staff is continuing to communicate these concerns to staff at the state level in the hopes that they can start thinking about solutions to meet the goals to transition these vehicles into cleaner technologies and provide a feasible way for that to happen.

Vice Chair Chiesa said he continues to be extremely impressed with District staff members. He said the amount of information and quality of the information that they provide to the Board and Valley residents is just outstanding.

ADJOURN

Vice Chair Chiesa adjourned the meeting at 11:51 a.m.

The next scheduled meeting of the Governing Board is: Thursday, May 19, 2022. The meeting starts at 9:00 a.m., in the Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno. The meeting will be held via Zoom audio and video teleconference (VTC).