

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP (EJAG)

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA.

Monday, December 15, 2008
11:00 a.m.

The Environmental Justice Advisory Group Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 2700 M Street, Bakersfield and the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto.

1. CALL TO ORDER - Meeting called to order at 11:16 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL - was taken, a quorum was not yet established.

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
San Joaquin	Jeremy Terhune, At-large Rep.	Northern
Stanislaus	Rosenda Mataka, At-large Rep.	Northern
Merced	Melissa J. Kelly Ortega, At-large Rep.	Central
Madera	Catherine Garoupa, At-large Rep.	Central
Fresno	Lourdes Medina, At-large Rep.	Central
Kern	Linda MacKay, At-large Rep.	Southern
	Riley Jones, CAC	Central

Staff present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer; Scott Nester, Director of Planning; Samir Sheikh, Director of ERIP; Dave Warner, Director of Permit Services; Jon Adams, Director of Compliance; Claudia Encinas, Bilingual Public Information Representative; Maricela Velásquez, Senior Public Information Representative

Staff present in the Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Anthony Presto, Public Information Representative

Staff present in the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Brenda Turner, Public Information Representative

3. APPROVE MINUTES OF MONDAY, NOVEMBER 17, 2008 – Lourdes Medina made a motion to approve the minutes as submitted. Second by Melissa Kelly-Ortega. The minutes were approved as submitted.
4. PUBLIC COMMENTS– None.

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None.
6. STANDING COMMITTEE REPORTS – Catherine Garoupa, EJAG bylaws sub-committee member, led the discussion on the bylaws.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega said she will email notes on the discussion for review and the EJAG members can give input and vote on it next month.

Derek Williams, member of the public, suggested changing the quorum requirements to a simple majority of the EJAG.

The EJAG members agreed this was a good idea.

Ms. MacKay thanked Ms. Kelly-Ortega and Ms. Garoupa for doing such a great job with the EJAG bylaws.

7. DISCUSS THE PROCESS AND SUBSTANCE FOR ESTABLISHING GOALS AND OBJECTIVES - Ms. Kelly-Ortega commented that the EJAG bylaws sub-committee has outlined a list of goals, and she suggested they expand on those goals at the next meeting and think about what objectives they can add to those goals in order to make them a reality.

Ms. Mataka asked for clarification on the meaning of process and substance.

Ms. Garoupa explained this item was initially to establish the EJAG's decision making process as an advisory group. However, much of this has already been covered in the bylaws. She asked if this item had been covered or if they need to revisit it as they finalize the bylaws. Ms. Garoupa listed a few options of decision making processes and expressed her opinion that Roberts's Rules of Order are a bit formalized and may be too complicated for members of the public to follow along and participate.

The EJAG briefly discussed various options.

Ms. Garoupa asked District staff to provide an overview of the different decision-making processes so the EJAG can make a well-informed decision.

Jaime Holt said the District uses Robert's Rules of Order and staff will have to consult with District counsel to see what the EJAG's options are. Staff will provide an overview of options prior to the February meeting.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega commented that after the EJAG has a summary of their options, an EJAG sub-committee can then research those options.

Susie Rico Vasquez, American Lung Association, suggested that items likely to have public comment should be moved to the top of the agenda.

Ms. Medina pointed out that public comment is always at the top of the agenda and, if the need is expressed at that time, the Chair has the ability to move agenda items.

8. REVIEW THE DISTRICT'S ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE STRATEGY – The SJVUAPCD Environmental Justice Strategy adopted in August 2007 was reviewed.

Ms. Mataka added that the strategy was put together with the help of an advisory group and was approved by both the Citizens Advisory Committee (CAC) and the Governing Board. She is not sure if the EJAG can make changes because it is a District document.

Ms. Garoupa commented that the last sentence of the strategy says it is a living document, and should be reviewed within a year of its adoption and should be regularly revised as necessary.

Ms. Holt commented that, although it has been a year since the strategy's adoption, it has not had much time to be implemented due to the challenges the EJAG has experienced with getting full membership. If changes are necessary, the strategy would need to go through the full process again of being approved by the CAC and the Governing Board. Ms. Holt suggested the EJAG work with these documents for awhile before making any changes.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega suggested the EJAG go through the document in order to familiarize themselves with the strategy, and they can discuss possible changes if necessary.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega suggested including defining environmental justice communities as one of the goals of the EJAG strategy.

Ms. Mataka commented that it has been previously stated that the entire District is considered an environmental justice community.

Derek Williams, member of the public, commented that environmental justice areas are everywhere and they shouldn't limit the scope of where EJAG can function by defining specific areas.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega commented that there are pockets of environmental justice communities in every city and it would be helpful to get a picture of where they are.

Mr. Sheikh presented a District map showing what is considered an environmental justice area. Mr. Sheikh will work on making this information available to the EJAG as needed. He will bring more information to the January meeting.

Derek Williams, member of the public, asked if those maps can be made available online. He commented that it is a good working model to start with and then the EJAG can make suggestions to the District as to what areas aren't on the map that should be.

Ms. MacKay suggested adding identifying environmental justice communities to the EJAG bylaws.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega asked if the District has a list of EJAG organizations they are providing outreach to.

Ms. Holt said there is not a formal list, but they can get work on putting one together.

Ms. Garoupa commented that it seems the section on community access and involvement needs to be updated. The District has already accomplished many things listed in that section. She asked if staff can update this section.

Ms. Holt announced that Arnaud Marjollet will research this.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega asked about the District's land-use decision guide.

Ms. Holt said this is a 300-page document, and the District is in the process of updating it and incorporating EJAG language into it. This document can be found on the District's website.

Ms. Medina said she would like EJAG to review this document to discuss at a later date and get the public involved.

There was a discussion regarding the vacancies in the EJAG membership.

Ms. Velásquez commented that the four vacancies are still posted on the District website and the District tries to get the word out as much as possible. She also asked the EJAG to email her with any recommendations.

Ms. MacKay suggested that an EJAG member should be on the appointment subcommittee.

Ms. Velásquez said she will check to see if that is possible.

Ms. MacKay commented that the EJAG should be notified about town hall meetings and training opportunities. She asked if there is a process to inform the EJAG about what is being made available through the District.

Ms. Holt answered that the District can inform the EJAG via email. She also mentioned that the District will be launching a new online calendar in January. This will be a unified place on the website to see all District public meetings.

Ms. Garoupa suggested the EJAG review the EJAG strategy and bring it back in January for recommendations or comments.

9. DISCUSS COMMUNITY GROUPS MEETINGS BEING REPLACED BY EJAG MEETINGS - Ms. Holt explained that over the past year, despite their efforts to get the word out, the District has struggled to get people to attend the community groups meetings. There was also a tremendous amount of overlap in the information provided at those meetings and at the EJAG meetings. As a result, those meetings have been discontinued. However, if the EJAG thinks these meetings are necessary and are willing to commit to attending, the District will reinstate them.

Ms. Garoupa commented that those meetings focused primarily on rule updates. She suggested rule updates be on the EJAG agenda every month.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega expressed concern that if community meetings are incorporated into EJAG meetings, EJAG may lose focus. She suggested having community meetings on an as-needed basis.

Ms. Holt said holding community meetings as needed is an option. She also said that EJAG meetings are public meetings which anyone can attend and comment on any issue. If people want to find out what is happening in the District, they can attend EJAG meetings.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega asked if teleconferencing can be available for this meeting.

Ms. Holt said she would check with the Information Technology Department. She also reiterated that if there is a need to hold special meetings, the District is more than willing to do so.

10. PUBLIC COMMENTS (SECOND OPPORTUNITY) - None.
11. EJAG MEMBER COMMENTS AND EJAG SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE EJAG REPORT DURING THE CAC MEETING ON TUESDAY, JANUARY 6, 2009 – Mr. Jones commented on the difficulty of attending evening meetings when there is dense fog. He believes certain factors need to be taken into consideration regarding members missing meetings.

Ms. Mataka agreed there will be times when it will be impossible to attend.

Ms. Garoupa pointed out the bylaws state the Chair can consider the removal of a member due to three consecutive missed meetings because of unjust cause. If there is a good reason why a member is unable to attend, it would not be considered unjust cause.

12. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT EJAG REPORT DURING CAC MEETING, TUESDAY, JANUARY 6, 2009 AT 9:00 A.M. - EJAG previously suggested the Chair attend the CAC meetings and present the EJAG report. Ms. Medina stated she is not able to attend those meetings and asked for a volunteer.

Ms. Garoupa volunteered.

Adjourned at 1:45 p.m.

Next meeting – The next EJAG meeting is scheduled on Monday, January 12, 2009 at 5:30 p.m.