

Action Summary Minutes  
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

**ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP (EJAG)**

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room  
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

**Tuesday, January 25, 2011**  
**5:30 p.m.**

*The Environmental Justice Advisory Group Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto*

1. CALL TO ORDER – The meeting was called to order at 5:36 p.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold a meeting.

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Merced	Melissa Kelly-Ortega, At-large Rep.	North
San Joaquin	**Jeremy Terhune, At-large Rep.	North
Stanislaus	Pamela Neronha, At-large Rep.	North
Fresno	*Kevin Hamilton, CAC-Environmental	Central
Tulare	Derek Williams, At-large Rep.	Central
Kern	Marvin Dean, Business Owner	South
Fresno	Sandra Celedón-Castro, At-large Rep.	Central
Fresno	***Sarah Sharpe, CAC-Environmental (Alternate)	Central

\*Arrived at 6:00 p.m.

\*\*Arrived at 6:05 p.m.

\*\*\*Departed at 8:00 p.m.

Staff present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Rick McVaigh, Deputy APCO; Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer; Todd DeYoung, Program Manager, Strategies & Incentives Department; Errol Villegas, Program Manager, Strategies & Incentives Department; Claudia Encinas, Bilingual Public Information Representative.

Staff present in Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Brenda Turner, Public Information Representative.

Staff present in Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Anthony Presto, Public Information Representative.

Members of the public present – Steven Harts...

3. APPROVE MINUTES OF TUESDAY, OCTOBER 26, 2010 AND TUESDAY, DECEMBER 14, 2010 – Minutes for October 26, 2010 and minutes for December 14, 2010 were approved separately.

Approve October 26, 2010 Minutes:

*Moved:* Williams  
*Seconded:* Dean  
*Ayes:* Celedón-Castro, Kelly-Ortega, Neronha, Williams, Dean, Sharpe  
*Nays:* None  
*Abstain:* None

***Motion carried unanimously to approve the Minutes of October 26, 2010.***

Approve December 14, 2010 Minutes:

*Moved:* Celedón-Castro  
*Seconded:* Williams  
*Ayes:* Celedón-Castro, Kelly-Ortega, Neronha, Williams, Dean, Sharpe  
*Nays:* None  
*Abstain:* None

***Motion carried unanimously to approve the Minutes of December 14, 2010.***

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS (FIRST OPPORTUNITY) – None
5. CHAIR COMMENTS – Ms. Kelly-Ortega said she read the APCO’s commentary in the Saturday Merced Sun-Star. She felt it raised public awareness regarding the District’s “Check Before You Burn” program and explained the need for the \$12 increase in DMV fees.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega said while substitute teaching recently at Franklin School in Merced, the school made an announcement that the area was experiencing an orange flag day and it was requested students with health issues remain indoor during recess. She said the notification process was an improvement over past practices.

Regarding the APCO’s commentary, Mr. McVaigh said it also appeared in the Fresno Bee today. He said news concerning air pollution issues for the Valley is posted on the SJVAPCD’s website and the APCO’s commentary has been posted on the site.

Mr. Dean said the APCO’s commentary was in response to negative public comments published in a newspaper; therefore, it is important that EJAG conduct

outreach to inform communities of the District's mission and what the District does, as well as inform them of what EJAG does for EJ communities.

Regarding negative comments published in a Valley newspaper, Ms. Holt said Bakersfield has a group called the "Sounding Board," made up of 40 to 50 community members who have been selected to the board based on a prescribed criterion. Periodically, the Bakersfield Californian newspaper will send this group questions via email and then will publish their responses to these questions. After the Californian published negative responses written by this group concerning the District, comments which were based on misinformation, District representatives and the APCO met with the Editorial Board. The Californian agreed to provide the District time to clarify facts in the future, prior to publishing public comments.

6. APCO/DEPUTY APCO COMMENTS – Mr. McVaigh said the appointment of a CAC City interest group representative to EJAG, replacing Mr. Dhaliwal, is on the CAC agenda. He said there are two additional positions on EJAG that the District is actively seeking to fill: the Madera County At-Large Representative position, previously held by Catherine Garoupa, and the Kings County At-Large Representative position, previously held by Andre Booker.

Mr. McVaigh briefly reviewed the following EJAG ad-hoc committees and what those committees are working on:

- Committee to develop 2011 EJAG objectives (refer to agenda item #9).
- Committee to provide recommendations to the District concerning the District's incentive spending proposals.
- Joint committee between the CAC and EJAG to develop follow-up recommendations for collaboration between the two groups.

Ms. Holt said the District's Annual Report has been published and is being distributed. Additionally, the 2011 Healthy Air Living Kids' Calendar is also available to EJAG members. Ms. Holt also requested EJAG members provide feedback concerning the calendars.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega requested staff provide EJAG members with a list of current EJAG ad-hoc committees and who is on each committee.

7. RULES UNDER DEVELOPMENT– The "Summary of Draft Rules and Plans" handout was provided to EJAG members. Mr. Villegas, Program Manager, Strategies & Incentives Department, provided a brief overview of rules listed on the summary handout.

*Mr. Hamilton arrived at 6:00 p.m.*  
*Mr. Terhune arrived at 6:05 p.m.*

8. FOLLOW-UP/DEBRIEF ON THE COLLABORATION WORKSHOP – Mr. McVaigh said the District will work on scheduling a follow-up meeting between the EJAG and CAC Joint Ad-Hoc Committee.

Ms. Sharpe said the Collaboration Session developed some good proposals. Ms. Kelly-Ortega agreed and suggested this be discussed further in the upcoming joint follow-up. Mr. Dean encouraged more collaboration workshops with CAC in the future.

9. FORM AD-HOC COMMITTEE TO ESTABLISH EJAG OBJECTIVES FOR 2011 - During the discussion, Mr. Hamilton suggested EJAG form a standing committee instead of forming an ad-hoc committee every year. Per the Brown Act, Mr. Hamilton said there are a limited number of times an ad-hoc committee can be formed for the same purpose, therefore mandating the establishment of a standing committee. He added a standing committee would provide continuity to the process. It was discussed this suggestion could be reviewed by the ad-hoc committee as a possible EJAG objective for 2011.

Due to EJAG being a smaller committee, Ms. Sharpe suggested that EJAG objectives could remain on the EJAG agenda as a standing item instead of forming an ad-hoc committee or standing committee. Then, an ad-hoc committee could take all the suggestions and develop the objectives for the following year.

Ms. Neronha, suggested for the future development of EJAG goals and objectives, this item be placed on EJAG's agenda sometime during the fourth quarter of the preceding year, rather than being addressed in the first quarter of the year in which the objectives are to be accomplished.

Mr. Dean requested District staff solicit EJAG members' suggestions regarding 2011 Goals and Objectives via email, which could then be forwarded to the chair of the ad-hoc committee.

Mr. Dean nominated Ms. Kelly-Ortega to serve as Chair for the ad-hoc committee and volunteered to Co-Chair the committee. Ms. Kelly-Ortega motioned for the following EJAG members to serve on the ad-hoc Committee: Ms. Sharpe, Mr. Williams, Ms. Kelly-Ortega and Mr. Dean.

*Moved:* Kelly-Ortega  
*Seconded:* Williams  
*Ayes:* Celedón-Castro, Kelly-Ortega, Terhune, Neronha, Williams, Dean, Hamilton  
*Nays:* None  
*Abstain:* None

**Motion carried unanimously to approve the following EJAG members to serve on the Ad-Hoc Committee to Establish EJAG Objectives for 2011: Ms. Kelly-Ortega, Ms. Sharpe, Mr. Williams, and Mr. Dean; Ms. Kelly-Ortega will Chair the committee and Mr. Williams will serve as Co-Chair.**

10. DISCUSSION OF POTENTIAL NEW GRANT PROGRAM CONCEPTS -

Todd DeYoung, Program Manager, Strategies and Incentives Department, introduced himself as the District liaison to the Ad-Hoc Committee related to incentive programs. Mr. DeYoung gave a brief overview of why the Ad-Hoc Committee was formed and then provided a PowerPoint presentation on the "District's Emission Reduction Grant Programs."

Mr. Terhune asked if there were programs providing funding for community-based organizations to develop leadership in order to assist community members to engage the District, work with the District, and help other community members to understand air quality matters relating to their communities. Mr. DeYoung said that historically grants for State and Federal funding have been limited to emission reductions projects and this type of funding has not been available, but it could be discussed.

Mr. Terhune said the Stewardship Council's current grant cycle has expired and it has a community catalyst fund and an impact fund, which are geared toward lowering the barriers between youth and the outdoors. He suggested a program to build community leadership from the ground up could be complementary to those types of grants. Mr. DeYoung said the District would be happy to look into possible sources of funding for those programs.

Ms. Sharpe said the District has conducted public outreach and education programs, which have done similar work. She encouraged the District to conduct more programs, in addition to seeking money that the District could sub-grant to community groups, similar to what has been done for the American Lung Association and the flag program. She suggested the District partner with the Central Valley Health Policy Institute, the Central Valley Air Quality Coalition or some similar organization to build air advocacy and leadership.

Ms. Holt said the APCO recently discussed the possibility of the District becoming involved with similar type youth programs, focusing on high school and college students, working with teachers to facilitate certain programs, and also trying to find funding for non-profit organizations. She said if the District does get involved in these type of programs, the District will seek EJAG's assistance in recruiting qualified individuals. Mr. Dean said the smaller, grassroots-type organizations that deal with impacted communities should be targeted for some of these programs.

Ms. Neronha referred to the presentation provided during the December EJAG meeting on Vehicle Repair, Retirement, and Replacement for Motorist Program (VRRRM). She said information and the application form can be obtained online at vrrrm.org. Ms. Kelly-Ortega said the VRRRM program could be an item on a future agenda.

Mr. Williams requested the ad-hoc committee receive a breakdown of the amount of money that is spent on locomotives, school buses, trucks, etc., in order for the committee to get an idea of how the money is allocated.

Ms. Sharpe asked how ISR (Indirect Source Review) funds would be spent. Mr. DeYoung said primarily those funds have been used in the heavy-duty engine program to fund some of the more cost effective emission reductions. Mr. McVaigh provided background information regarding the ISR program, District Rule 9510 (Indirect Source Review). He said thus far the District has collected \$10 million and has spent a significant portion of those funds to mitigate the increases in emissions from new developments.

11. 2011 EJAG MEETING DATES – Ms. Holt suggested the December EJAG meeting date be changed due to the Christmas holiday. Also, she reminded the group that there are no meetings during July and November.

Ms. Neronha suggested EJAG not have a meeting in December, due to possibly not having a quorum because of vacation schedules. Ms. Holt suggested moving the December meeting to Dec.13 at 5:30 p.m. She said EJAG could discuss whether to have a December meeting during the October meeting or the District could distribute an email the beginning of December to EJAG members. Depending on the responses, it could then be determined whether a quorum could be formed.

By consensus, the group decided to change the December meeting date to **Dec. 13 at 5:30 p.m.**

12. EJAG BUSINESS CARDS – Ms. Neronha said “San Joaquin Valley” on the logo is faint and difficult to read, and suggested “Clerk of the Boards” be clarified. She also said she noticed not every EJAG member has a phone number listed. Ms. Holt said “Clerk of the Boards” could probably be replaced with “Clerk of the EJAG Board” or “Clerk of the EJAG.” Regarding EJAG members’ phone numbers, Ms. Holt said EJAG members need to let the District know if they desire their number to be printed on the card, and if the District does not hear from a member, then that member’s phone number will not be printed on his or her card.

Mr. Dean agreed with Ms. Neronha that the lettering within the logo is difficult to read; however, did not want a change to delay receiving the business cards.

Mr. Williams moved to approve the business cards with the recommended changes. Ms. Kelly-Ortega advised since this is a discussion item, a vote is not required. Ms. Holt said the goal is for EJAG members to receive the business cards prior to the next scheduled meeting.

13. EJAG'S ACTION PLAN TO ENGAGE NORTHERN REGION RESIDENTS PROGRESS REPORT – The “Draft Action Plan to Increase Public Participation in the North San Joaquin Valley” was provided to EJAG members.

Mr. Terhune said he and Ms. Neronha have not yet had the opportunity to meet with community leaders in the northern region; however, a meeting is being organized for late February. Ms. Neronha suggested that the Coalition for Clean Air also be contacted and invited to the meeting. Ms. Sharpe said the Coalition for Clean Air is located in Sacramento and they do not have any staff in the northern part of the Valley. Ms. Neronha said that because their organization is related to clean air, perhaps there may be an opportunity to seek their involvement.

It was discussed that, due to the Action Plan receiving approval, as amended, during the October 2010 EJAG meeting, it is no longer a draft. Ms. Kelly-Ortega said this would be a continuous item listed on future agendas, in order to continue to receive updates. Ms. Sharpe proposed that this item be one of EJAG's first objectives for 2011.

Ms. Neronha and Mr. Terhune then requested a progress report from Mr. Dean and Mr. Williams on their efforts to engage residents in their respective areas. Mr. Dean said he would provide an update during EJAG Member Comments (item #18). Mr. Williams said he recruited community organizing “captains,” who are members of the public and who are stakeholders for their represented communities. He said he met with his captains in Dinuba and in Farmersville, who both wanted to bring members of the public to this evening's meeting; however, Mr. Williams requested they not do so because he felt it was premature and concerns related to driving in the fog. Mr. Williams said he lost his Woodlake community captain and is looking for a replacement. Ms. Kelly-Ortega reiterated this topic would be an ongoing item for future agendas.

14. COMPLAINT PROCEDURES BROCHURE SUGGESTIONS FOR POSSIBLE ENHANCEMENT – The Complaint procedure brochure was provided to EJAG members.

The following suggestions were made by EJAG members:

- Under “Why File a Complaint,” the second sentence, change to “the public can help by noticing possible air quality issues in their neighborhood.”

- In the sentence, “By noticing when something seems to be hurting air quality and then reporting it to the district the public is playing an important role in improving our air quality,” replace the word “hurting.”
- Under the “smoking vehicles” section, include the phone number.

Ms. Holt said the Complaint brochure should be finalized by February. Once finalized, the District will present the brochure to the CAC to provide the CAC an opportunity to comment. After that, the brochure can be provided to EJAG members; however, it may not be a final, high-end quality printed brochure.

In discussing the one-page document, Ms. Kelly-Ortega said the revised document is clear and easy to read. She suggested taking out the first “and” in the following sentence, “The Air District Governing Board consists of 15 members; 8 County Supervisors, 5 city council members, and a doctor and a scientist appointed by the Governor.” Mr. Dean said the one-page document is straight forward and shows how the different groups tie in together, as well as explain EJAG’s mission. Ms. Neronha suggested that the boxes (explaining Governing Board, Citizen’s Advisory Group, and Environmental Justice Committee) could be darker, perhaps black, as there is a lot of light blue and white on the page. Regarding the colors, Ms. Sharpe said the document may be copied on a black and white printer, therefore, it should be considered how the page would look copied in black and white

Ms. Holt suggested EJAG be provided with a resource packet in which to keep outreach materials.

15. EJAG MAP RECOMMENDATIONS – Ms. Kelly-Ortega said the Mapping Ad-Hoc committee has not yet had a chance to get together. She suggested this item be tabled for next month, provided the committee could meet prior to that date.

Mr. Hamilton suggested copies of the map be provided to the Ad-Hoc Committee. Since the maps are available on the EJAG section of the District’s website, and because the online maps have zoom-in and zoom-out capability, it was recommended a laptop computer be used to access these maps and view them on the big monitors. Mr. McVaigh said Mr. Sheikh, Director of Strategies and Incentives, who was providing support for that Ad-Hoc Committee, could also attend the meeting.

It was agreed Ms. Sharpe would serve on the Ad-Hoc Mapping Committee, replacing the position previously held by Ms. Garoupa, who is no longer a member of EJAG.

16. FEBRUARY EJAG MEETING AGENDA ITEMS – It was determined the following items would be placed on the February agenda:



- 2011 Action Plan
- Update on the Action Plan to increase public attendance and participation
- The VRRRM Program
- Grant ideas
- EJAG/CAC Collaboration Session Committee update
- EJAG Ad-Hoc Mapping Committee update

It was discussed that recommendation regarding EJ maps should not be an action item for the February EJAG meeting; however, it could be an action item for March's agenda.

After discussing possible meeting dates for the three ad-hoc committees, it was decided all committees would meet on Feb. 22, prior to the scheduled EJAG meeting at 5:30 p.m., at the following times:

- The EJAG/CAC Collaboration Workshop Committee would meet first, at approximately 10 or 11 a.m.
- The Mapping Committee would meet at 1 p.m.
- The 2011 Objectives Committee would meet at approximately 2 p.m.

Ms. Holt said the District would need to coordinate the proposed schedule of meetings, especially the EJAG/CAC Collaboration Workshop Committee, as CAC members need to be contacted; however, District staff would do their best to accommodate the requested times. Also, Ms. Holt said the meetings would be VTC or by conference call.

Mr. Hamilton suggested each Ad-Hoc Committee have a chair or a lead who would provide updates during the scheduled EJAG meeting.

17. PUBLIC COMMENTS (SECOND OPPORTUNITY) – None

*Ms. Sharpe departed at 8:00 p.m.*

18. EJAG MEMBER COMMENTS – The 4<sup>th</sup> Annual Public Contracting Expo website was displayed for viewing and Mr. Dean discussed the event. He said the Expo is about growth that is coming into the Valley, EJ issues, and contracting issues. The event hosts a series of workshops and panels, and a number of vendors attend. He said EJAG members can register through the "EJAG/San Joaquin Air District Member Panel 5 Event Pass" link. Registration and attendance is free through this link. Mr. Dean said the Fresno Expo is scheduled for April 21 at The Downtown Club.

Mr. Dean suggested EJAG host Panel 5 to introduce the community to EJAG and its mission, discuss the \$10 million, and receive public comments. He suggested

the District could present a PowerPoint presentation and set-up an outreach table at the event.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega requested District staff email EJAG members the website link to the conference.

19. EJAG MEMBER SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE EJAG REPORT DURING THE CAC MEETING ON TUESDAY, FEB 1, 2011 – Ms. Kelly-Ortega thanked the District staff for providing an EJAG highlights handout to CAC members. No items were suggested to include in the presentation during the CAC meeting except what would be included on the EJAG Highlights item.
20. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT EJAG REPORT DURING CAC MEETING, TUESDAY, FEB 1, 2011 AT 10:00 A.M. – Ms. Neronha said she would be attending the CAC meeting as an alternate and could present the report.

## **ADJOURN**

Meeting adjourned at 8:20 p.m.

*NEXT MEETING – The next EJAG meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, February 22, 2011, at 5:30 p.m. Meeting held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.*