

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP (EJAG)

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

Tuesday, October 25, 2011
5:30 p.m.

The Environmental Justice Advisory Group Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto

1. CALL TO ORDER – The meeting was called to order at 5:31 p.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was not present at time of roll call; quorum formed at 5:33 p.m.

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Merced	Melissa Kelly-Ortega, At-large Rep.	Central
Kern	*Marvin Dean, Business Owner	South
Tulare	Derek Williams, At-large Rep.	North
Kings	Riley Jones, CAC-Industry/Ag (Primary)	Central
Fresno	**Sarah Sharpe, CAC-Environmental (Alternate)	Central
Fresno	***Kevin Hamilton, CAC-Environmental	Central
Fresno	****Sandra Celedón-Castro, At-large Rep.	Central

*Departed at 6:46 p.m.

**Arrived at 5:33 p.m. and departed at 6:28 p.m.

***Arrived at 5:55 p.m.

****Arrived at 6:43 p.m.

Staff present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Rick McVaigh, Deputy APCO; Errol Villegas, Program Manager, Strategies & Incentives Department; Dave Warner, Director of Permit Services; Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer; Maricela Velasquez, Senior Public Information Representative.

Staff present in Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Brenda Turner, Public Information Representative.

Staff present in Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Anthony Presto, Public Information Representative.

Members of the public present – Heather Gonzales, Cynthia Sterling

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS (FIRST OPPORTUNITY) – None.

Ms. Sharpe arrived at 5:33 p.m.

3. APPROVE MINUTES OF TUESDAY, August 23, 2011 -

Moved: Dean
Seconded: Jones
Ayes: Kelly-Ortega, Williams, Jones, Dean, Sharpe
Nays: None

Motion unanimously passed to approve the minutes of Tuesday, August, 23, 2011.

APPROVE MINUTES OF TUESDAY, September 27, 2011 –

Moved: Dean
Seconded: Sharpe
Ayes: Williams, Sharpe, Dean, Kelly-Ortega, Jones
Nays: None

Motion unanimously passed to approve the minutes of Tuesday, September, 27, 2011.

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – Ms. Kelly-Ortega thanked the members of the public present for attending.

6. APCO/DEPUTY APCO COMMENTS – Mr. McVaigh said there will be a special CAC meeting to review the District's 2011 Air Alert Program on Nov. 1 at 10 a.m., in order to obtain input from CAC members and the public on the following items:

- Who the target audience should be
- How the District should conduct outreach
- How to get the attention of the target audience
- What should the District's message be
- How can people participate
- How should the District measure success

Also, at the direction of the CAC Chair, due to a suggestion made by CAC member Ms. Sharpe, an additional agenda item will discuss how the Air Alert Program relates to the Flag Program and the Real-Time Air Advisory Network (RAAN).

Public Comment: None.

7. RULES UNDER DEVELOPMENT – Mr. Dave Warner, Director of Permit Services, continued discussion from last month’s meeting regarding Rule 2301 (Emissions Reductions Credit Banking). He provided an overview of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), which requires permitting agencies to evaluate all environmental impacts of projects that require an agency to issue a discretionary approval, and said that per state law, the District is required to include in an analysis the impacts of greenhouse gas emission increases. Additionally, once the analysis is complete, often CEQA will require some type of greenhouse gas emissions mitigation. He explained the problem with this requirement is there are an extremely limited number of ways to mitigate greenhouse gas emission increases; therefore, project proponents will likely turn to existing greenhouse gas credits that are available on a national and international basis through existing markets. Two problems related to this are:

- Quality issues with the credits
- The loss of opportunity to benefit from local reductions

He said the District feels by changing Rule 2301 (Emissions Reductions Credit Banking) and creating a market for those greenhouse gas emission reductions here in the San Joaquin Valley, the benefits would be:

- Increased economic development (associated by the purchase and installation of greenhouse gas emission technology)
- Increase additional criteria and toxic pollutant reductions that would otherwise not be reached
- Cleaner air for Valley residents

Mr. Dean suggested a program be created where the credits remain in the Valley. He asked for an update on where the rule is in the process. Mr. Warner said the rule will be presented to the Governing Board in December.

Ms. Sharpe questioned the District’s involvement with greenhouse gas credits, as it is a huge process and there are other entities that are involved in emission reduction credits.

Ms. Sharpe asked what the process is to ensure extra reductions are not associated to other controls already required by current District rules. Mr. Warner said there are requirements under CEQA guidelines that do not allow a reduction to be used if that reduction was otherwise required.

Mr. Hamilton asked how the District planned to integrate this program with the state’s program and also how it will integrate into the planned federal program.

Mr. Warner indicated that we would expect the credits to be used to provide local reductions as mitigation for local projects under CEQA, which is a state law.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega said she would need to do more research on the matter. Mr. McVaigh said Mr. Warner is available to assist and available to answer further questions.

Mr. Williams requested a cost analysis at the end of 24 months and again at the end of 48 months, showing the amount of reductions in greenhouse gases and the cost to attain those reductions. Mr. Warner said the District publishes the cost of every emission reduction credit transaction that occurs under the District's existing rule on an ongoing basis. He stated this rule does not establish requirements to reduce greenhouse gases, which means there will not be a cost associated with the efforts to actually control greenhouse gases. However, the District will be able to keep track of the costs of the transactions between parties as they trade credits, and that information is updated daily and made available on the District's website.

Public Comments: None.

Mr. Errol Villegas, Program Manager Strategies and Incentives Department, then covered the information provided on the "Summary of Rules and Plan" dated Oct. 20, 2011.

Mr. Dean requested the District keep EJAG updated regarding Rule 1020 (Definitions).

Public Comments: None.

Mr. Hamilton arrived at 5:55 p.m.

8. CAC/EJAG COLLABORATION UPDATE – Mr. Kelly-Ortega said Jonathan London, Director of the Center for Regional Change at UC Davis, was available to provide an EJ 101 presentation on Feb. 2 or Feb. 9, 2012. After discussion it was decided the meeting would be on one of those dates at 4 p.m., and Governing Board members would be invited. It was also discussed that Mr. London could be asked to attend a Governing Board meeting sometime in the future. Ms. Holt would contact Mr. London regarding accommodations and travel expenses.
9. GRANT COMMITTEE UPDATE – Mr. Williams said the committee established three items to focus on at the next grant committee meeting, which are:
 - Outreach and community development
 - Acquisition of a mobile education unit for public outreach

- Establish an application process for the \$10 million, which could include applications for members, public education outreach, and economic development with clean air implications for businesses.

Regarding the mobile education unit, Ms. Kelly-Ortega suggested the proposal also include the cost of additional staff that would be needed to utilize the vehicle for five years.

Public comments: None.

10. CONSIDER CHANGING MEETING DATES AND TIMES FOR THE REMAINDER OF 2011 AND CALENDAR YEAR 2012 – Ms. Kelly-Ortega said a Doodle poll was sent out to EJAG members regarding dates and times and eight out of 18 people responded. The responses indicated the fourth Thursday of the month was the best time for EJAG to meet. After discussion, it was decided EJAG will begin meeting the fourth Thursday of every month in January (Jan. 26) at 5:30 p.m.

Mr. Williams asked if the new meeting schedule would allow enough time for District staff to provide the information for CAC meetings, which meet the first Tuesday of every month. Ms. Velasquez said the highlights of the EJAG meeting would be provided to the Clerk of the Boards for those meetings.

Mr. Dean suggested checking with other EJAG members to see if anyone has a scheduling conflict with the new date.

Ms. Sharpe departed at 6:28 p.m.

12. DEVELOP TOOLS FOR COMMUNITY FEEDBACK – Ms. Kelly-Ortega said this item was added to the agenda in order to stay on schedule with the established goals and objectives; this item addresses goal and objective #4.

Mr. Hamilton said in developing tools of how to accomplish this goal, the following items should be considered:

- Who EJAG is trying to reach
- The language the target group prefers to learn in
- The activities the community attends
- Create a tool for gathering information, i.e. a questionnaire

Mr. Williams suggested adding a detachable flap to EJAG brochures that have prepaid postage, asking a couple of questions that could be completed, torn off and mailed back.

Mr. Dean said he supported going out into the communities to hear directly from EJ members and to explain EJAG and how EJAG can be a resource for them. Ms. Kelly-Ortega said the mobile education unit could be utilized for this purpose and for the purpose of educating the public. Ms. Celedón-Castro suggested using iPads and iPhones as a survey tool and making the tools available online for those community members who have access to the internet.

Suggestions concerning questions to ask were:

- How can EJAG better reach you or serve you
- What's the best way possible to keep you informed and get you or keep you involved
- What does clean air mean to you
- How can we communicate best with you
- What is the best time to hold meetings
- What would help you attend a meeting

Public Comment: the following persons provided testimony on this matter:

- Heather Gonzales – Ms. Gonzales suggested using a Tella Novela through Facebook or YouTube as a tool to get word out to community members.

Ms. Holt said the District has utilized YouTube on a variety of different levels to post short videos in order to promote District programs. She said the District recently used it for the For Reel Video Contest, posting the three top videos, which received thousands of votes.

Ms. Celedón-Castro suggested using future VRRRM events as an opportunity to conduct public outreach. Ms. Holt said even though the initial funding source is running out there is a recommendation for the District to find funds to continue this event into 2012.

Ms. Celedón-Castro arrived at 6:43 p.m.

16. EJAG MEMBER COMMENTS - Mr. Dean passed out a flier regarding the Annual Public Contracting Expo that will be held on Jan. 18 and 19 at the Radisson Hotel in downtown Fresno. He asked that District staff and EJAG members setup an information table at the event on Jan. 19. The activities on that day will start at approximately 7:30 a.m. and go until approximately 5:30 p.m.

Mr. Dean departed at 6:46 p.m.

11. REVIEW OF CHECK BEFORE YOUR BURN BROCHURE AND DISCUSS AIR ALERT PROMOTIONAL ITEM AND HEALTHY AIR LIVING FOTONOVELA –

Ms. Kelly-Ortega thanked Ms. Gonzales (member of the public) for her information during last month's meeting about YouTube links in the FotoNovella and for her input regarding the Check Before You Burn brochure.

EJAG members were going to provide edits for the Check Before You Burn brochure to Ms. Holt prior to leaving this evening.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega asked for any further comments/suggestions for the FotoNovella and ideas on promotional items that can be handed out. Ms. Celedón-Castro suggested magnets and Mr. Hamilton said they should be big enough to hold items on a refrigerator.

Public comments: None.

13. EJ MAPS (IF ANY UPDATES) – There were no updates for this item.
14. DECEMBER EJAG MEETING AGENDA ITEMS – The following items will be on the December agenda:
 - EJAG maps update
 - Grant committee update
 - View the winning For Reel Video submission (that was posted on YouTube)
 - Checklists for the committees
 - One-page success sheet
 - Edited Check Before You Burn brochure
 - EJAG new schedule (to ensure new schedule does not create a scheduling conflict for EJAG members who did not respond to the poll)
 - Annual review of bylaws, duties and responsibilities
15. PUBLIC COMMENTS (2nd OPPORTUNITY) – None.
18. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT EJAG REPORT DURING CAC MEETING, TUESDAY, DECEMBER 6, 2011 AT 10 A.M. – Ms. Celedón-Castro volunteered.
17. EJAG MEMBER SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE EJAG REPORT DURING THE CAC MEETING ON TUESDAY, DECEMBER 6, 2011 – No suggestions were made.

ADJOURN

Meeting adjourned at 7:13 p.m.

NEXT MEETING – The next EJAG meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, Dec. 13, 2011, at 5:30 p.m. Meeting held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.