

Action Summary Minutes  
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

**ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP (EJAG)**

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room  
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

**Thursday, February 23, 2012**  
**5:30 p.m.**

*The Environmental Justice Advisory Group Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto*

1. CALL TO ORDER – The meeting was called to order at 5:31p.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present.

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Fresno	Sandra Celedón-Castro, At-large Rep.	Central
Merced	Melissa Kelly-Ortega, At-large Rep.	Central
Stanislaus	Pamela Neronha, At-large Rep.	North
Tulare	Derek Williams, At-large Rep.	Central
Kern	Marvin Dean, Business Owner	South
Fresno	Sarah Sharpe, CAC-Environmental (Alternate)	Central
Kings	Riley Jones, CAC-Industry/Ag (Primary)	Central
Fresno	Kevin Hamilton, CAC-Environmental (Primary)	Central

Staff present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Rick McVaigh, Deputy APCO; Errol Villegas, Program Manager of Strategies and Incentives; Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer; Sheri Bohigian, Outreach and Communications Representative.

Staff present in Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Brenda Turner, Outreach and Communications Representative.

Staff present in Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Anthony Presto, Outreach and Communications Representative.

Members of the public present – Heather Gonzales, Andre Booker, Dennis Fox, Vickie Mitchell.

3. APPROVE MINUTES OF JANUARY 26, 2012 – Ms. Bohigian informed the committee of a correction to the minutes. The day of the Feb. 23 meeting is Thursday, not Tuesday. Mr. Williams commented on item No. 9 that he did not see light-duty passenger vehicle programs on the list of recommendations. The committee had discussed the Tune-in/Tune-up program and this should be added to the minutes.

Moved: Williams  
Seconded: Dean  
Ayes: Celedón-Castro, Kelly-Ortega, Neronha, Williams, Dean, Sharpe, Jones  
Nays: None

***Motion unanimously passed to approve the minutes of Thursday, January 26, 2012, with the suggested changes.***

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – Heather Gonzales, community member and faculty member of Merced College, commented that she recently left a meeting feeling as if her voice was not being heard. She asked the committee to honor everyone's voice. Ms. Kelly-Ortega thought that was a good reminder for everyone. Andre Booker, a concerned citizen of Kings County, commented that EJAG has an obligation to future generations to do everything they possibly can. There are things we can do today that will prevent catastrophes in the future. Ms. Kelly-Ortega thanked Mr. Booker for his comments. Mr. Dean suggested Mr. Booker consider becoming actively engaged with the group. Ms. Kelly-Ortega responded that Mr. Booker is a former member of EJAG.
5. CHAIR COMMENTS – Ms. Kelly-Ortega thanked everyone who came to the collaboration meeting on Tuesday to hear Jonathan London. She appreciated everyone's personal time and commitment. Ms. Kelly-Ortega also noted that Teresa DeAnda was not able to attend the meeting, so item No. 7 is off of the agenda.
6. APCO/DEPUTY APCO COMMENTS – Mr. McVaigh mentioned two upcoming auto repair events. The first one will be held on Feb. 25 at West Hills College in Lemoore. The second event will be held on March 24 at the College of Sequoias in Visalia. Participants will receive free diagnostic testing for their cars. If they fail the smog test, they are eligible to receive a voucher for up to \$500 in repairs. This information can be found on the District's homepage.
7. PRESENTATION FROM TERESA DEANDA, CALIFORNIANS FOR PESTICIDE REFORM ON KERN ENVIRONMENTAL ENFORCEMENT NETWORK (KEEN) PROJECT – Ms. DeAnda was unable to attend the meeting.

8. RULE AND 2012 PM2.5 PLAN UPDATES – Mr. Errol Villegas, Program Manager of Strategies and Incentives, presented the updates. Proposed amendments to Rule 1020 (Definitions) would incorporate dimethyl carbonate and propylene carbonate to the list of exempt compounds. EPA has designated these materials as compounds with very low ozone-forming potential. Mr. Villegas gave the committee a summary for the 2012 PM2.5 attainment plan (in development). This plan addresses EPA's 2006 PM2.5 standard and is due to EPA by the end of 2012. Mr. Villegas gave a summary of the guiding principles that will provide the District with an overall direction for the process. The risk-based plan would include the following:

- Chapter on health risks of emissions and benefits of plan
- New control measures aimed at high-risk emissions
- Incentives aimed at reducing high-risk emissions
- Qualitative evaluation of risk reductions
- Prioritization of measures to reduce high risks
- Quantitative analysis of plan benefits using BenMAP
- Proposals for additional health research

The committee discussed freight trucks travelling through the Valley and the possibility of charging toll fees. Mr. McVaigh expressed it was his understanding that tolls can only be imposed to recover the cost of the road. They cannot be imposed on an existing road. Mr. McVaigh said the District has not yet found a legal measure by which to acquire funds from through traffic. When the District makes its case before EPA, the impact of through traffic is considered when discussing incentive funding.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega said Jonathan London mentioned Rachel Morello-Frosch, who has done much research on risk-based assessment. She suggested looking into Ms. Morello-Frosch's research. Mr. Hamilton requested that Mr. Sadredin present the District's risk-based strategy at the next meeting. Mr. McVaigh responded that the strategy is under development. This is a list of things the District has identified so far to include in a risk-based plan. Getting these items down on paper was just the first step. It is a work in progress.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega suggested the committee would appreciate a presentation specifically on the details of the risk-based approach. Ms. Sharp requested more information about the EPA BenMAP. Mr. McVaigh explained that BenMAP is an EPA computer model. It is part of a geographical information system used to determine health impacts. By comparing the information calculated both with and without the emission reductions resulting from a plan, you can then determine the health benefit associated with that plan.

Mr. Villegas summarized the basic timeline for plan development. The first public workshop will be held in April, the second workshop is planned for June, and the third is planned for August. A draft version of the plan will be presented to the Governing Board in October. The plan will then be forwarded to ARB in November and to EPA in December. The District wants to engage the public and will hold various other meetings throughout this process. The District is looking for feedback from EJAG and the public for suggestions for the plan and outreach ideas.

Public Comments: The following person provided testimony on this matter:

- Andre Booker commented that he did not see anything about truck stops in the list and he thinks truck stops are a major PM2.5 contributor.
- Vickie Mitchell found the presentation very interesting. She then reminded everyone about a healthy clean air community fair on Saturday, 10 a.m. to 2 p.m., at the Veteran's Hall at California and Owens streets.
- Dennis Fox recommended the District "really go after the low-hanging fruit which is being quite often ignored." Mr. Fox believes there is a cultural issue/barrier when it comes to awareness of certain District rules, specifically regarding dust control and track-out. It concerns him that some people are not familiar with the rules and might incur large fines or have their job shut down. Mr. Fox also mentioned a salvage yard that has closed down and is now "an EPA nightmare."

Ms. Kelly-Ortega thanked everyone for their comments and thanked Mr. Villegas for his presentation. At March's meeting, she hopes to have a detailed risk-based strategy presentation and more EPA BenMAP information.

9. CAC/EJAG COLLABORATION UPDATE – Ms. Kelly-Ortega said Mr. Jonathan London, Director of the Center for Regional Change at UC Davis, provided an excellent presentation entitled "Land of Risk, Land of Opportunity." Ms. Kelly-Ortega then provided an overview of recommendations/suggestions she came up with from that presentation that EJAG could discuss, which included:

- Overlaying the District's EJ maps with the Mr. London's maps, and using both maps to develop a policy to give priority to areas that are most impacted
- Putting resources where need is the greatest
- Interagency collaboration
- Existing news about the local government commission (Ms. Kelly-Ortega suggested including community members)
- The APCO's comments regarding using a hybrid approach concerning the risk-based strategy

- Community mapping workshops
- Air monitors

Ms. Kelly-Ortega suggested Rachel Morello-Frosch provide a presentation on the different strategies that would go into mapping out the various stressors/buffers in a risk-based strategy approach.

Ms. Neronha said working with the District's EJ map and the maps used by Mr. London, with community mapping workshops, would create an avenue for community outreach and involvement.

Mr. Dean said the presentation showed the need for agencies to collaborate to maximize effectiveness with the limited resources available, as well as the need for community involvement. He said if community members were more aware of the process, they would become more involved.

Concerning the District's EJ map, Mr. Hamilton pointed out that the map originated with EJAG. He added the map was not intended to be static, but was created with the thought process that it would evolve to incorporate new information as it was obtained. He added the new information provided by Mr. London will enable the District's map to be updated. He suggested EJAG take on the task of constructing a relationship between the District and Mr. London, as well as others who are compiling data, and merge that information onto the District's map. Ms. Sharpe suggested reconvening the EJAG mapping committee.

Public Comments: The following person provided testimony on this matter:

- Dennis Fox – Mr. Fox suggested EJAG use the Council of Governments (COG) as a resource, as they do census mapping. He provided the annual report created by COG to EJAG.

10. GRANTS COMMITTEE UPDATE – Mr. Williams said during the last Grants Committee meeting Mr. Todd DeYoung, Program Manager of Strategies and Incentives, discussed and provided ideas concerning the Grants Committee list of recommendations, which consisted of eight items that were presented to EJAG during last month's meeting. He said from that list, the committee voted to make the following formal recommendations to EJAG for EJAG's consideration to present to the District:

- Utilize \$3 million of the AB 2522 funds, \$1 million for each region in the district, to go towards replacing or upgrading school buses.
- Request the District use \$3 million of other funds (not out of the \$10 million from AB 2522), \$1 million for each region in the district, for the replacement or upgrading of refuse trucks that belong to fleets owned by private companies that operate in EJ areas.

Regarding community outreach, since AB 2522 does not provide for funding to be used toward community outreach, Mr. Dean said he will be meeting with District OC staff to discuss other options. Mr. Williams added that Mr. Dean will present any ideas to the Grants Committee for review.

Ms. Sharpe suggested delaying a vote until the Grants Committee presents all items as a whole package to EJAG, rather than voting on the items in a piecemeal fashion. Mr. Williams said the school bus program is a health-driven priority item. Mr. McVaigh said the District would like to receive the recommendations, either one at a time or all together, within the next two to three months. Ms. Celedón-Castro said the Grants Committee discussed prioritizing the items and reiterated Mr. Williams' comment that the committee felt the school bus was a top priority because of the health risk to children. Regarding the two to three month time frame to present items to the District, Mr. Hamilton added that he shared Ms. Sharpe's concern; however, it took the committee, of which he is a member, an entire meeting to get through two items on the list, and if the committee had to go through all the items before presenting recommendations to EJAG, it would take longer than two or three months.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega stated the motion concerning school bus replacement or upgrading was the following: approve, out of the \$10 million provided by AB 2522, \$1 million to each region for school bus replacement or upgrading in EJ communities as designated by the District's EJ map.

Moved: Jones  
Seconded: Hamilton  
Ayes: Celedón-Castro, Kelly-Ortega, Neronha, Williams, Dean,  
Hamilton, Jones  
Nays: None

***Motion unanimously passed to approve, out of the \$10 million provided by AB 2522 designated for EJ, \$1 million to each region for school bus replacement or upgrading in EJ communities as designated by the District's EJ map.***

Ms. Kelly-Ortega stated the motion concerning upgrading refuse trucks was the following: request an additional \$1 million for each region, from the \$29 million provided by AB 2522, for privately-owned refuse collection vehicles operating in EJ communities as designated by the District's EJ maps.

Moved: Hamilton  
Seconded: Jones  
Ayes: Celedón-Castro, Kelly-Ortega, Neronha, Williams, Dean,  
Hamilton, Jones  
Nays: None

***Motion unanimously passed to request an additional \$1 million for each region, in addition to the \$10 million from AB 2522 designated for EJ, for upgrading privately-owned refuse collection vehicles operating in EJ communities as designated by the District's EJ maps.***

Ms. Kelly-Ortega said the concerns about the timeline and the recommendations not being presented in a whole package is taken into consideration.

Public Comments: The following person provided testimony on this matter:

- Andre Booker – Mr. Booker asked about the EJ maps for Kings County, and suggested more outreach focusing on the youth, such as a science fair for air quality.

11. ONE-PAGE EJAG MILESTONES – Ms. Kelly-Ortega said this item would be tabled, as she tried to incorporate suggestions made at past meetings, however, she did not have the one-page item with her. She asked District staff to send that item to EJAG members for review and asked EJAG members to review it and send her any further suggestions, in order for this item to be discussed during next month's meeting.
12. DECEMBER EJAG MEETING – After discussion it was decided to change the December meeting to Dec. 13.
13. COMMUNITY FEEDBACK TOOLS – This item was tabled.
14. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Ms. Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, connected to the District's website and showed the 2011 For Reel contest winning entry. She said the District will be launching the For Reel 2012 contest next week. She said the theme for this year's contest is "Healthy air, healthy you," video submissions can be 30 seconds in length, and the contest is open to students and teachers in the San Joaquin Valley. She said it is hoped there will be two categories next year: Kindergarten through 8th grade and 9th grade and up, which will include teachers. She explained the top three videos are posted on the web and the winner is selected by the public. Additionally, the winner receives an iPad and the winning video will be aired in a commercial format during the month of August in the market area where the video was produced.

Ms. Holt said the 2012 Air Quality Conference, focusing on lawn care, landscaping and air quality, is coming up and information is available online. She said the conference is free, but registration is recommended and registration can be completed online.

Ms. Holt said the District is developing outreach tools and strategies to help clarify some of the confusion surrounding the Real-time Air Advisory Network (RAAN), as well the daily air quality forecast, flag program, and air alert program, and how they are used. She asked EJAG to provide ideas at next month's meeting as to the types of tools that could be utilized to get the information out to the public, and requested that budget restraints be considered. Some possible suggestions she made were: a brochure, an online video, and an audio message for radio.

Since the targeted market is students, Ms. Celedón-Castro suggested utilizing Facebook. Ms. Holt said a variety of things, including social media and placing ads in school newspapers, would be utilized. Mr. Hamilton suggested a contest where kids could post a video on YouTube.

In closing, Ms. Holt said the District hired a new full-time bilingual Air Quality Education Representative, Ana Reyes, and that she will start attending EJAG meetings.

15. EJ MAPS – Ms. Kelly-Ortega said this item will be discussed next month.
16. MARCH EJAG MEETING AGENDA ITEMS – Ms. Kelly-Ortega said the following items would be on the March agenda:
  - One-page EJAG milestones
  - Health risk-based strategy presentation, to include EPA BenMAP
  - EJ maps
  - The checklist
  - Ideas for outreach materials
  - Daily air quality forecast, real-time air advisory, and air alerts
  - Grants Committee update
17. PUBLIC COMMENTS (Second Opportunity) – Regarding going into schools, Ms. Heather Gonzales suggested providing resources for the school, such as supplies. Ms. Kelly-Ortega suggested notebooks and Ms. Celedón-Castro suggested having an air quality after school program/activity. Mr. Jones added that the Boys and Girls Clubs in Fresno may be a place to get the word out to school-age children.

Mr. Dennis Fox suggested the EJ maps be utilized as criteria for giving out grants. He also suggested EJAG look into the coordination of traffic lights.
18. EJAG MEMBER COMMENTS – Regarding a public comment made by Mr. Booker concerning Kings County, Ms. Neronha suggested Mr. Booker contact Mr. Rey Leon, who is involved in a mitigation problem concerning emissions from trucks idling near an industrial space in Avenal. She suggested that EJAG look

into the definition of “truck stops” as according to AB 2522, since AB 2522 does not provide funds for truck stops.

Mr. Dean said he would be attending the community fair in Bakersfield and representing EJAG and talking to community members about EJAG.

Ms. Sharpe said the Kern Environmental Enforcement Network will be launching their project in Lamont on Feb. 29. They will be conducting an EJ tour in the morning and then there will be a meeting in the afternoon. She said the head of EPA’s region 9 will be there, as well as the head of the California Department of Toxic Substance Control and a number of people from around the state. Ms. Kelly-Ortega requested Ms. Sharpe forward the information to EJAG members.

19. EJAG MEMBER SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE EJAG REPORT DURING CAC MEETING ON TUESDAY, MARCH 6, 2012 – None.
20. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING CAC MEETING TUESDAY, MARCH 6, 2012 AT 10 A.M. – Ms. Neronha will present the information at the March meeting.

ADJOURN

Meeting adjourned at 7:33 p.m.

NEXT MEETING – The next EJAG meeting is scheduled for Thursday, March 22, 2012, at 5:30 p.m. Meeting held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.