

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP (EJAG)

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

Thursday, March 22, 2012
5:30 p.m.

The Environmental Justice Advisory Group Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto

1. CALL TO ORDER – The meeting was called to order at 5:40 p.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present.

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Fresno	Sandra Celedón-Castro, At-large Rep.	Central
Merced	Melissa Kelly-Ortega, At-large Rep.	Central
Stanislaus	Pamela Neronha, At-large Rep.	North
Tulare	Derek Williams, At-large Rep.	Central
Fresno	Kevin Hamilton, CAC-Environmental (Primary)	Central
Fresno	Sarah Sharpe, CAC-Environmental (Alternate)	Central
Kings	Riley Jones, CAC-Industry/Ag (Primary)	Central

Staff present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Rick McVaigh, Deputy APCO; Errol Villegas, Strategies and Incentives Program Manager; Samir Sheikh, Strategies and Incentives Director; Dr. David Lighthall, Health Science Advisor; Maricela Velasquez, Senior Outreach and Communications Representative; Ana Reyes, Bilingual Outreach and Communications Representative.

Staff present in Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Brenda Turner, Outreach and Communications Representative.

Staff present in Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Anthony Presto, Outreach and Communications Representative.

Members of the public present – Dennis Fox, Art Pena, Alan Davis.

3. APPROVE MINUTES OF THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 23, 2012

Moved: Hamilton
Seconded: Williams
Ayes: Celedón-Castro, Kelly-Ortega, Neronha, Williams, Hamilton,
Jones
Nays: None

Motion unanimously passed to approve the minutes of Thursday, February 23, 2012.

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – Art Pena, of Pena Disposal, a small refuse hauling company located in Cutler, said his diesel trucks operate eight to 10 hours a day, six days a week, year-round in EJ areas. He thanked staff and EJAG members for looking into providing funding towards replacing diesel trucks owned by privately owned refuse collection companies.

Alan Davis, General Manager of Industrial Waste and Salvage, a small, family-owned refuse and recycling company that operates throughout the Valley, suggested EJAG consider including providing funding for the replacement and/or upgrading of heavy equipment used in recycling operations. He said the company is considering using landfill gas and added there is new technology that converts landfill gas to compressed natural gas.

Dennis Fox suggested the following items concerning improving air quality be looked into: curtailing burning at national parks, coordinating traffic signals, and rail transportation.

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – Ms. Kelly-Ortega asked about the status of the review process for filling EJAG vacancies. Mr. McVaigh said Ms. Holt, Chief Communications Officer, will be able to provide an update upon her return.
6. APCO/DEPUTY APCO COMMENTS – Mr. McVaigh reported on the Lawn and Garden Conference held the previous day. There were approximately 100 participants and most were new to air pollution issues. He said Jessi Fierro, Supervising Air Quality Specialist, provided information on the air pollution problem in the Valley. Tim Tyner, from UCSF-Fresno, talked about the health aspects of air pollution. Samir Sheikh, Strategies and Incentives Director, presented some initial ideas on potential incentive programs, voluntary efforts, and ideas for regulation. Several community groups from southern and northern California talked about their efforts to restrict leaf blower usage.

Mr. McVaigh said there are few items on the agenda for the April Governing Board meeting that may be of interest to EJAG: the District's end of season wood burning report, the annual air toxics report, and laser fireworks.

Mr. Hamilton said EJAG had requested a presentation concerning the Lawn and Garden Conference and Ms. Kelly-Ortega said this item would be on the April EJAG agenda.

Mr. Jones asked what the cost ratio is between laser fireworks and traditional fireworks. Mr. McVaigh said the percentage is not yet known. Mr. McVaigh added that the District is very interested in laser fireworks as there is a very high level of particulate matter every year on July 4-5. Additionally, this new technology could possibly present an outreach opportunity. Mr. McVaigh said District staff hopes to have more information by the Governing Board meeting in April.

7. RULE AND 2012 PM2.5 PLAN UPDATES – Mr. Errol Villegas, Program Manager of Strategies and Incentives, said there were no past actions, no new rules adopted, and no changes to the definitions of Rule 1020 since February. He said the District is in full swing of developing the 2012 PM2.5 plan and anticipates presenting it to the Governing Board in October and then forwarding it to the EPA in December. He added the first workshop is tentatively scheduled for April. The workshop will be broadcast live on the District's website and questions can be forwarded via email. Mr. Sheikh said drafts of the document will be available prior to the workshop.
8. RISK-BASED STRATEGY AND EPA BEN-MAP – Samir Sheikh, Strategies and Incentives Director, and Dr. David Lighthall, Health Science Advisor, presented a PowerPoint presentation on the District's risk-based strategy. The presentation provided an overview of the risk-based strategy framework, how risk-based strategy fits in with the overall District strategy, health risks associated to ultrafine particles, and the EPA's BenMAP.

Mr. Sheikh said innovative and transformative measures are required to meet the new federal standards. Therefore, plans like risk-based strategies are needed in addition to the mass-based federal standards. Mr. Sheikh said a full range of health science research is needed. He said EPA has a document entitled Integrated Science Assessment that covers a lot of issues regarding a risk-based standard. He said the main goal of developing and implementing the risk-based strategy is to reduce the overall health risk. The strategy's progress will be measured by the improvement in public health. Mr. Sheikh said the District wants to emphasize the reduction in population exposure to pollutants, especially in EJ communities.

Dr. Lighthall said it is important to harness the full range of health science in order to justify the control measures that are going to be necessary. Sacrifices will need to be made in areas not previously affected in order to achieve the required mass reductions. Regarding the intake fraction model, Dr. Lighthall reported that a recent study conducted by Cal Poly showed the impact of residential wood smoke on neighboring homes, specifically that there was a

tremendous amount of infiltration in the interior of homes that were near a residence that burned wood.

Mr. Sheikh said the main priority of the PM2.5 plan is prioritizing strategies that achieve the greatest public health benefits, with emphasis on strategies that will provide benefits in EJ communities. He said some of the items that will be investigated to obtain reductions are: gross polluting vehicles, lawn care, residential wood burning, charbroiling, and urban heavy-duty vehicles. He said an additional component of the plan that is being considered is an analysis of the health benefits due to air pollution controls over time, which the EPA's BenMAP could be used as a tool for this purpose.

In closing, Mr. Sheikh said updates on the risk-based strategy will be provided at future meetings. Additionally, he said there will be a couple items on the Governing Board study session agenda in May related to the risk-based strategy, including the Governing Board considering taking a policy position on indoor air quality control.

Mr. Sheikh provided information on an item not included in the PM2.5 plan that deals with population exposure. This is somewhat of an expansion of the Real-Time Air Advisory Network (RAAN) concept where residents could find information about the types of exposure they face over a certain amount of time, based on their zip codes.

Ms. Sharpe commented that this strategy seems to be continuously evolving and asked if there will be a final policy or written document. Mr. Sheikh said the PM2.5 plan will include a detailed chapter on the risk-based strategy.

Ms. Celedón-Castro asked if it would be beneficial to have more air monitoring stations in EJ communities and other areas. Mr. Sheikh said the District's air monitoring network is pretty robust compared to other areas, however, the District would still benefit from additional stations. He added the District is pushing for more funding in order to expand the monitoring network. Ms. Neronha said expanding the air monitoring network should be a priority for the District.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega thanked Mr. Sheikh and Dr. Lightall for the presentation. She suggested the presentation made to the public should be more concise and in easier to understand terms

9. GRANTS COMMITTEE UPDATE – Derek Williams, Grants Committee Chair, presented the two recommendations approved at the meeting. The Grants Committee recommends allocating \$3 million for on-road heavy-duty vehicles, in addition to the \$3 million allocated by the District, specifically for small business owners in EJ communities, \$1 million per region. The second recommendation is to allocate \$1 million (divided equally between the three regions) for Tune-

In/Tune-Up events in EJ communities with the purpose of making repairs more affordable by matching the \$500 credit provided by the District, for a total of up to \$1,000 credit towards repairs. Mr. Hamilton made a motion to approve the two recommendations made by the Grants Committee.

Moved: Hamilton
Seconded: Celedón-Castro
Ayes: Celedón-Castro, Kelly-Ortega, Neronha, Williams, Hamilton,
Jones
Nays: None

Motion unanimously passed to recommend allocating \$3 million, in addition to the \$3 million allocated by the District, specifically for small business owners in EJ communities, \$1 million per region; and to allocate \$1 million (divided equally between the three regions) for Tune-In/Tune-Up events in EJ communities to match the \$500 credit provided by the District, for a total of up to \$1,000 credit towards repairs.

10. ONE-PAGE EJAG MILESTONES – Mr. Williams said he would like to see all recommendations made by the Grants Committee added to the list. Mr. Hamilton motioned to approve the updates to the EJAG milestone sheet.

Moved: Hamilton
Seconded: Jones
Ayes: Celedón-Castro, Kelly-Ortega, Neronha, Williams, Hamilton,
Jones
Nays: None

Motion unanimously passed to approve the updates to the EJAG milestone list.

11. COMMUNITY FEEDBACK TOOLS – This item was tabled.
12. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – The group continued the discussion on outreach strategies regarding the air quality forecast, RAAN, and air alerts. Ms. Kelly-Ortega suggested adding air alerts to the District website homepage along with the air quality forecast and RAAN. She suggested adding the word “daily” to “air quality forecast” and adding “flag program” in parentheses. She also made suggestions for possible helpful links such as “know the difference” and “sign up for all.” Ms. Velasquez informed the group that staff is currently working on an informational brochure on these tools. Ms. Celedón-Castro commented that it might be confusing for the general public and suggested it should be made simpler. Mr. Hamilton suggested using symbols that everyone understands. For example, a smiley face when air quality is good, a neutral face when it’s moderate, and a sad face when it’s bad. Ms. Velasquez said the District is developing a smart phone application. Mr. Jones suggested

using billboards along Highway 41 to display air quality information. He agrees that simpler is better and suggested using the image of a stoplight with a red, yellow, or green light, based on the current air quality.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega mentioned three brochures EJAG needs to review. There is a brochure of general air quality information and two brochures in Spanish: "Check Before You Burn" and "Reporting an Air Pollution Complaint." Ms. Kelly-Ortega requested EJAG members take the brochures home to review and bring them back next month.

13. EJ MAPS – Ms. Kelly-Ortega mentioned the presentation by Dr. Jonathan London last month and the overlaying of the District's EJ maps with Mr. London's maps. Mr. Sheikh said District staff has been in discussions with Dr. London and they will report on that progress as it develops. Mr. McVaigh said they should be able to provide an overlay comparison by next month. Ms. Kelly-Ortega also suggested having a presentation on risk-based assessment by Rachel Morello-Frosch.
14. APRIL EJAG MEETING AGENDA ITEMS – Ms. Kelly-Ortega said the following items would be on the April agenda:
 - Map overlay comparison
 - Brochures
 - Teresa Deanda, Kern Environmental Enforcement Network (KEEN)
15. PUBLIC COMMENTS (Second Opportunity) – Dennis Fox had comments regarding residents of EJ communities not having medical insurance, having to go to health clinics or the emergency room, and missing work due to illness.
16. EJAG MEMBER COMMENTS – Ms. Neronha commented on a study done by the Public Policy Institute of California in July 2011. Copies of the study were handed out and Ms. Neronha shared some of the information regarding regional air pollution and public opinions on air quality.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega shared a comment from a Merced resident, Rick McMillion. She reiterated his complaint about a Southwest Trader's truck that idles while delivering to Starbucks and other businesses in Merced. Mr. McMillion has filed complaints about this company with various agencies.
17. EJAG MEMBER SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE EJAG REPORT DURING CAC MEETING ON TUESDAY, APRIL 3, 2012 – None.

18. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING CAC MEETING TUESDAY, APRIL 3, 2012, AT 10 A.M. – Ms. Kelly-Ortega will present the information at the April meeting.

ADJOURN

Meeting adjourned at 7:30 p.m.

NEXT MEETING – The next EJAG meeting is scheduled for Thursday, April 26, 2012, at 5:30 p.m. Meeting held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.