

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP (EJAG)

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

Thursday, May 24, 2012
5:30 p.m.

The Environmental Justice Advisory Group Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto

1. CALL TO ORDER – The meeting was called to order at 5:30 p.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was not yet present.

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Merced	Melissa Kelly-Ortega, At-large Rep.	Central
Fresno	*Sandra Celedón-Castro, At-large Rep.	Central
Tulare	Derek Williams, At-large Rep.	Central
Fresno	*Kevin Hamilton, CAC-Environmental (Primary)	Central
Kern	Marvin Dean, Business Owner	South
San Joaquin	Jeremy Terhune, At-large Rep.	North

*Ms.Celedón-Castro and Mr. Hamilton arrived at 5:40 p.m.

Staff present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Rick McVaigh, Deputy APCO; Errol Villegas, Strategies and Incentives Program Manager; Samir Sheikh, Strategies and Incentives Director; Jamie Holt, Chief Communications Officer; Janelle Schneider, Outreach and Communications Representative.

Staff present in Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Emily Gonzales-Demont, Office Services Manager.

Staff present in Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Anthony Presto, Outreach and Communications Representative.

Members of the public present – Esperanza Vielma, Rick Francis, Vicky Sikes.

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – Esperanza Vielma, CEO of the Community Assistance Foundation for Empowerment (C.A.F.E., Inc.) and a guest of Mr. Terhune, said her foundation is forming a cooperative in downtown Stockton, located at 235 N.

San Joaquin Street. The co-op will include various environmental groups, a roasting company, a café, and a multicultural gallery. C.A.F.E., Inc. has two upcoming events: June 22, 5 – 8 p.m. is “ARTicipation” and July 27, 5 – 9 p.m. is “Supper Club.” Ms. Vielma said she hopes to collaborate with the District in the future.

*Ms. Celedón-Castro and Mr. Hamilton arrived at 5:40 p.m.

Richard Francis, Central Valley Recycling, wanted to inform EJAG of the steps that have been taken in regard to the dust complaints coming from the residential housing behind his facility. He said the company has made every good faith effort to address the complaints brought to their attention. They have spent about \$90 thousand to assure their dust is under control. This includes purchasing a water trolley, a water truck, constructing a fence, paving dirt paths, and putting in concrete, just to name a few things. They have had visits from the District and from Stanislaus County Environmental Resources and everything was found to be in good order. Mr. Francis said there is dust coming from surrounding businesses that they cannot control.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega thanked Mr. Francis for all the steps they’ve taken to address these complaints and comply with the rules. Mr. Dean suggested that Mr. Francis reach out to the nearby residents. Mr. Francis said they have tried to contact the residents, but have not received any response. Mr. Hamilton wanted to note that the complaints are regarding two businesses, not just Mr. Francis’ business. He suggested reaching out to the neighboring businesses.

3. APPROVE MINUTES OF THURSDAY, APRIL 26, 2012

Moved: Hamilton
Seconded: Williams
Ayes: Celedón-Castro, Kelly-Ortega, Terhune, Williams, Dean,
Hamilton
Nays: None

Motion unanimously passed to approve the minutes of Thursday, April 26, 2012.

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – Ms. Kelly-Ortega wasn’t able to attend last month’s meeting and did not have a chance to comment on Ms. Neronha’s resignation. She took this opportunity to say how greatly she appreciates Ms. Neronha’s contribution and hopes she will continue to be involved in environmental justice issues. Ms. Kelly-Ortega also encouraged members who need to reapply for their seats to do so right away. She asked that they submit applications by next week.

6. APCO/DEPUTY APCO COMMENTS – Mr. McVaigh provided an update on EJAG’s grant spending proposal. Although the spending plan has not been

officially approved, Executive Director Sadredin has directed staff to ensure that the 2012/13 District budget includes adequate funding for the EJAG proposal. The CAC will also consider the EJAG recommendations in June.

7. RULE AND 2012 PM2.5 PLAN UPDATES – Errol Villegas, Program Manager of Strategies and Incentives, said there were no updates on the modification to Rule 1020 at this time. He gave an update on the District’s 2012 PM2.5 plan, saying they presented a summary to the Governing Board in regard to their outreach efforts, the workshops they held, the comments they received, and how they are working on addressing those comments. Staff is looking to hold another workshop sometime in late June. ARB is looking to hold another workshop as well. The District also held a public meeting with the Central Valley Air Quality Coalition (CVAQ) on April 24. Mr. Villegas said they appreciate the feedback they received and look forward to holding more meetings with CVAQ.

Ms. Celedón-Castro asked for a brief summary on the feedback received at the workshops. Mr. Villegas said the verbal comments were regarding wanting more information about ammonium nitrate and how it contributes to PM2.5 emissions. This information will be included in the appendix of the next version of the plan. It will also include responses to the two written comments they received. Mr. Sheikh said the summary provided at the Governing Board meeting includes the kinds of comments that were received along with some preliminary responses. This summary can be found on the District’s webpage.

Mr. Dean asked about the status of the ERC bank for greenhouse gases. Mr. McVaigh responded that the modifications have been approved by the Governing Board and the bank is open for business. So far, the District has received one application for banking greenhouse gas credits, which is under review. Mr. Dean asked Mr. McVaigh to keep EJAG apprised of any further activity.

8. ELECT VICE CHAIR – Mr. Dean made a motion to re-elect Ms. Celedón-Castro.

Moved:	Dean
Seconded:	Williams
Ayes:	Celedón-Castro, Kelly-Ortega, Terhune, Williams, Dean, Hamilton
Nays:	None

Motion unanimously passed to re-elect Sandra Celedón-Castro as EJAG vice chair.

9. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT– Jamie Holt, Chief Communications Officer, asked for feedback on the following District brochures:

a. CHECK BEFORE YOU BURN AND REPORTING AN AIR-POLLUTION COMPLAINT – SPANISH VERSIONS

Ms. Holt said these brochures were revised after suggestions were made by EJAG. Ms. Celedón-Castro said the tagline in Spanish doesn't make sense. Ms. Holt said the tagline is a play on "Healthy Air Living," which doesn't make literal sense in English either. Mr. Terhune mentioned that Ms. Vielma is a professional translator and she was looking over the brochure. Ms. Vielma agreed that the tagline does not make sense. They discussed the message they were trying to convey with the tagline and how best to convey that message in Spanish.

Ms. Celedón-Castro asked Ms. Holt to email the brochures so she could look them over once more. Ms. Holt agreed and suggested Ms. Celedón-Castro have a final phone conference with Senior Outreach Representative Maricela Velasquez regarding the translation. Ms. Holt asked Ms. Vielma if she would be willing and comfortable with assisting as well. Ms. Vielma agreed to help. Ms. Holt suggested EJAG approve the brochures, pending the final revisions. Ms. Celedón-Castro made a motion to approve the Spanish brochures pending the final revisions.

Moved: Celedón-Castro
Seconded: Hamilton
Ayes: Celedón-Castro, Kelly-Ortega, Terhune, Williams, Dean, Hamilton
Nays: None

Motion unanimously passed to approve the two Spanish brochures pending the final revisions.

b. GENERAL AIR QUALITY BROCHURE

Ms. Holt said, after receiving suggestions from EJAG, they removed about 20 percent of the wording from the draft version of this brochure. This brochure is focused on information about who the District is, pollutants, and how to get involved. Staff is working on another brochure titled "Air Quality and You," which will include information on RAAN, the flag program, and air alerts. Ms. Celedón-Castro suggested the line "as a Valley resident, you play an important role" should be under the heading "Get Involved."

Ms. Holt said this was first opportunity for comments from EJAG on this brochure. Revisions will be made and the brochure will be brought back for a final review. She also mentioned that a small number of the draft brochure had been distributed throughout the Valley. The District ordered a small print run of the draft version in order to get through Earth Day, Bike to Work Week, and the end of the school season. They will do a full print run after the final version is approved.

10. EJ MAPS: EJ MAP COMPARISON – Mr. Sheikh gave a brief PowerPoint presentation regarding the November 2011 report by Dr. Jonathan London and the UC Davis Center for Regional Change: “Land of Risk/Land of Opportunity.” UC Davis’ report presents “vulnerability action zones” based on a number of factors, some of which the District has not looked at. When identifying EJ areas, the District considers the percent of minorities in the population and the percent of the population living in poverty. UC Davis looked at other social indicators including location of health care facilities, percent of population older than 25 without a high school diploma, and percent of population younger than 5 or older than 60. The Social Vulnerability Index presented in the report gets into the social issues that contribute in making a community an EJ community. The District is looking at UC Davis’ report to provide useful information that could potentially enhance the District’s EJ grant program efforts.

Mr. Hamilton commented that the District’s EJ map is a living thing. As time goes on and more data is compiled, the map should be updated. EJAG’s map committee’s purpose is to update the map and to help the District target more specifically the areas that are the most vulnerable. The existing map is too broad. Mr. Hamilton said Dr. London’s maps provide a remedy for that. Dr. London identified different zones expanding out from the central zone, where the highest need is.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega asked if there are areas covered by the District’s map that aren’t covered by Dr. London’s map. Mr. McVaigh said 52 percent of the population is covered by the District’s EJ map, and 28 percent is covered in Dr. London’s map. Mr. Hamilton said that wasn’t entirely accurate due to vast areas of empty farmland and the difference between how the maps show the actual population of those areas. Mr. Hamilton suggested the map overlay would be clearer if different colors or patterns were used to show what areas are covered by both Dr. London’s map and the District’s map. Ms. Kelly-Ortega liked Mr. Hamilton’s idea and suggested also using a light color for the majority of the map, a darker color for the medium vulnerability areas, and an even darker color for highly vulnerable areas.

Mr. Terhune said he would like to see a map showing where the District spends its funding. Dr. London stresses focusing on the highly vulnerable 28 percent. It would be interesting to see how much District funding goes to that 28 percent. He said EJAG could make better decisions on how to spend funds if they knew where funds have previously been spent. Mr. Sheikh said they do track funding, but it’s not all in regards to physical location. It would take some time and effort to produce such a map.

Mr. Williams expressed his concern regarding small areas in the middle of cities that could be considered EJ areas. He commented that city resources should be used for those areas. Mr. Sheikh said there are different funds for different kinds of places and different approaches that can be taken. Ms. Celedón-Castro said

she would argue to include such areas in the EJ map. Some of these areas are not incorporated in the cities and are very much EJ communities. Sometimes resources are not allocated to those areas by the city or county. Mr. Williams clarified that city resources should be used for areas in the heart of a city that are fully incorporated. But there are areas in pockets in between towns that are EJ communities. Mr. Sheikh said if there is a small area they agree they want to focus on, there are different ways that can be done. They can do targeted outreach and host events in those areas, and take a special approach to make sure that community is aware of available programs. Mr. Sheikh said Ms. Holt is always looking for new and creative ideas and opportunities for outreach.

Mr. Dean asked if incentive program applications are first come first served, or if vulnerability factors are weighed. Mr. Sheikh said vulnerability factors are considered in program design, but other factors must be considered as well. Mr. Sheikh said if there are areas they feel need extra effort, special attention and funding allocation, the District is open to that idea. Right now, the District is in the process of putting together an application for federal funding specifically for Kettleman City. Mr. Sheikh commented that it's a big valley and there are many different kinds of grant programs. There's not a one-size-fits-all solution. Mr. Dean said he would like to see more money put into those highly vulnerable areas in EJ communities and would also like to see funding data tracked on a map.

Mr. Williams asked if the overlay could be presented at the August meeting. It would aid further discussion of additional areas to possibly include in the District's EJ map. Mr. Sheikh commented that we want to find ways to identify highly impacted communities, but the District doesn't want to exclude any areas without going through a methodical process. Mr. Williams agreed and said they aren't looking for areas to cut out. They are looking for more information that will help identify additional areas that should be included. Mr. Hamilton asked if it was possible to see the overlay in June. Mr. Sheikh said it could be presented at the next meeting.

11. JUNE EJAG MEETING AGENDA ITEMS – The following items will be on the June agenda:

- Map overlay
- Discussion/action regarding EJAG Reappointments
- Presentation by Teresa DeAnda
- Brochures

Mr. Williams asked if the reapplication process could be made simpler. If no one else is applying for the seat, it should be automatic. Mr. McVaigh said he will review the bylaws to see what options they have. Mr. Williams also said he thought they might get more volunteers if meetings were held every other month.

12. PUBLIC COMMENTS (Second Opportunity) - Vicky Sikes, A. Philip Randolph Community Development Corporation, asked if her application for the Kern County seat was received. Ms. Holt said she will check on Ms. Sikes' application and will get back to her. Ms. Holt mentioned the challenges they have had putting together the selection committee. Mr. Hamilton suggested the District send a courtesy card to confirm when applications are received.

Ms. Sikes invited everyone to attend an upcoming community meeting scheduled for June 20, 6 - 8 p.m. This meeting will be an opportunity for the community to comment on clean air incentive programs. The meeting will be held at 999 E. California Avenue in Bakersfield.

13. EJAG MEMBER COMMENTS – Mr. Dean said he volunteers with A. Philip Randolph, and at their meetings on the third Wednesday of every month, they have a guest speaker. He would love to have District staff attend these meetings. Mr. Sheikh said he will make an effort to be at the next meeting. If he is unable to attend, Todd DeYoung will attend the meeting.
14. EJAG MEMBER SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE EJAG REPORT DURING CAC MEETING ON TUESDAY, JUNE 5, 2012 – None.
15. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING CAC MEETING TUESDAY, JUNE 5, 2012, AT 10 A.M. – Mr. Hamilton volunteered.

ADJOURN

Meeting adjourned at 7:17 p.m.

NEXT MEETING – The next EJAG meeting is scheduled for Thursday, June 28, 2012, at 5:30 p.m. Meeting held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.