

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP (EJAG)

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

Thursday, October 25, 2012
5:00 p.m.

The Environmental Justice Advisory Group Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto

1. CALL TO ORDER – The meeting was called to order at 5 p.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was not yet present.

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Merced	Melissa Kelly-Ortega, At-large Rep.	Central
Stanislaus	****Rayna Ruiz	North
San Joaquin	***Esperanza Vielma	North
Fresno	Sarah Sharpe, CAC-Environmental (Alternate)	Central
Tulare	Derek Williams, At-large Rep.	Central
Kings	Riley Jones, CAC-Industry/Ag (Primary)	Central
Fresno	*Sandra Celedón-Castro	Central
Madera	***Michelle Garcia	Central
Kings	**Maricela Mares-Alatorre	Central
Kern	Robert Smith, At-large Rep.	South

*Ms. Celedon-Castro arrived at 5:05 p.m.

**Ms. Mares-Alatorre arrived at 5:08 p.m.

***Ms. Vielma and Ms. Garcia arrived at 5:10 p.m.

****Ms. Ruiz arrived at 5:15 p.m.

Staff present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Rick McVaigh, Deputy APCO; David Lighthall, Health Science Advisor; Samir Sheikh, Strategies and Incentives Program Director; Todd DeYoung, Strategies and Incentives Program Manager; Janelle Schneider, Outreach and Communications Representative.

Staff present in Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – None.

Staff present in Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Anthony Presto, Outreach and Communications Representative.

Members of the public present –Jeremy Terhune, Julie Wilson.

3. EJAG 101 SESSION – Mr. McVaigh gave a short presentation for the new EJAG members including information on members, strategy, mission, goals, and by-laws. He also briefly went over the Brown Act and Robert's Rules of Order.

4. APPROVE MINUTES FOR AUGUST 23, 2012

Moved: Garcia
Seconded: Williams
Ayes: Smith, Garcia, Kelly-Ortega, Vielma, Ruiz, Williams, Sharpe, Jones
Abstained: Celedón-Castro, Mares-Alatorre
Nays: None

Motion passed to approve the minutes of Thursday, August 23, 2012.

5. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None.
6. CHAIR COMMENTS – Ms. Kelly-Ortega thanked everyone for applying for the various EJAG seats and the District staff who sat on the interview committee. She is looking forward to working with everyone over the next couple of years. She apologized to Mr. Terhune that he was not notified that he was not reappointed to the EJAG.
7. APCO/DEPUTY APCO COMMENTS – Mr. McVaigh announced that the Governing Board approved an exciting new research project to look at PM2.5 exposure. It will look at the differences in exposure in different neighborhoods and how the locations and locations of emissions sources can affect that exposure. Mr. McVaigh asked David Lighthall, the District's Health Science Advisor, to present more information about the project.

Dr. Lighthall explained that small, passive monitors will be used to collect more data than District monitoring stations currently collect. These monitors are capable of providing chemically speciated results from the individual particles that they collect. Collected particles are scanned with an electron microscope and the size and shape of the particles are measured. The research will focus primarily on Fresno County, but some samplers will be placed in other areas in the Valley. Mr. McVaigh said there is a more complete description and specifics of the proposal in the Board memo from last Thursday's meeting.

Ms. Garcia asked if the findings from this research will tie into the risk-based strategy. Dr. Lighthall replied that it will definitely be part of the evaluation. The group discussed different areas they would like monitors placed. Ms. Celedón-Castro is interested in a list where the communities that will be monitored. Mr. Jones asked how the information is transmitted. Dr. Lighthall

answered that the monitor stub will be retrieved and shipped to the lab. There is only one lab that does this kind of analysis, which contributes to the expense.

Mr. Williams asked if it would be feasible for the District to seek a grant to establish its own program and equipment. Mr. McVaigh said the District has looked into developing its own laboratory capabilities, but this is not feasible.

8. RULE AND 2012 PM2.5 PLAN UPDATES – Samir Sheikh, Strategies and Incentives Program Director, gave a brief update on the PM2.5 Plan. Two workshops were held on Oct. 9. During the morning session, ARB gave a technical presentation about the plan and the modeling they are doing for PM2.5. During the afternoon session, the District held a workshop where they discussed the challenges they are facing, the control measures they are evaluating, and overall, what the plan is shaping up to look like. Mr. Sheikh said there is a lot of material posted on the District's website and showed the group where it could be found.
9. UPDATE ON IMPLEMENTATION OF AB2522 FUNDS – Todd DeYoung, Strategies and Incentives Program Manager, presented the update.
 - **School buses** – EJAG recommended \$3 million for school bus replacement in EJ areas, \$1 million in each region. This money is in the District budget, but there is some concern regarding state-wide funding for school transportation. After the November election, if certain propositions pass and there is funding to continue school transportation, the District will start the program. There is an existing program in place so everything is ready to go.
 - **Refuse-collection vehicles** – The District is developing the program and amending the current heavy-duty program to include the refuse-collection vehicle component. They hope to present the program to the Governing Board in January or February.
 - **On-road heavy-duty vehicles** – EJAG recommended was to provide additional funding for small fleets and single owner/operators that reside or operate in EJ areas. The District operates a couple of different truck programs and is working on implementing the EJAG recommendation into their voucher program.
 - **Light-duty passenger vehicles** – EJAG recommended providing additional funding per voucher for Tune-in/Tune-up events. This recommendation was taken before the Governing Board. The District has had overwhelming success at these events. There has been a 40 percent to 50 percent increase in participation since last year. The District also has to keep an eye on cost-effectiveness. After a lengthy discussion, it was

decided by the Governing Board that the voucher amount should remain at \$500.

Mr. Williams said he was disappointed the voucher amount wasn't increased to \$1,000, but the additional million dollars EJAG recommended will still be used toward this program, and will allow for more events and more cars to be repaired. Mr. Sheikh added that, because of EJAG's recommendation, the District allocated a larger amount to the program than they had anticipated.

Mr. DeYoung announced additional good news regarding refuse-collection vehicles. Last month, the Governing Board accepted approximately \$900,000 in Federal DERA funding for waste-collecting and hauling vehicles. The program will be targeted at those companies contracted to haul waste to facilities in EJ areas. The District will issue a request for proposal in the next few months. Ms. Mares-Alatorre asked if the Governing Board decided to prioritize trucks that stayed within the Valley, which Mr. Sheikh confirmed.

10. BURN CLEANER FIREPLACE AND WOODSTOVE CHANGE-OUT PROGRAM

– Mr. DeYoung commented that the Check Before You Burn season is coming up and it is a good time to give a brief update on the Burn Cleaner Program. The program was established in 2006 to replace non-certified wood-burning devices. The \$125,000 originally allotted to the program was spent in a matter of weeks. In 2009, the Governing Board increased the funding to \$425,000. A minimum of 20 percent of available funds are committed to lower-income residents. To date, over 35 percent of funding has been allocated to low-income residents. Low-income residents receive \$1,500 per voucher compared to \$500 for higher-income residents.

Mr. Jones commented that more higher-income residents are participating in the program than low-income residents, even though they receive a smaller incentive. The group discussed this issue and ways to encourage low-income residents to participate. Ms. Celedón-Castro said if homeownership is a requirement for the program, many low-income residents are renters and therefore ineligible to participate. She mentioned PG&E's weatherization program, which services renters. Ms. Celedón-Castro suggested partnering with this program. The group also discussed the requirement of a 1099 tax form and how that might deter participation. Mr. DeYoung said this is part of a much broader issue the District is looking into.

Ms. Vielma asked which newspapers were targeted, if there is bilingual outreach, and if there is funding for TV ads. She suggested providing EJAG with the media and outreach information they can review it, see what might be missing, and move forward from there with recommendations. Mr. DeYoung will provide a detailed list of media outlets.

Public Comment: Julie Wilson asked if there was any way to measure the opportunity that exists for homes that haven't been upgraded to participate. Mr. DeYoung said he is not aware of any such research to date, but that's something the District can look into. Mr. Williams commented that would be hard to quantify. It would be hard to get numbers regarding older homes with non-certified units, newer homes that are up to code, and houses that don't have fireplaces.

11. EJAG ACTION PLAN – DEVELOPING GOALS AND OBJECTIVES – Ms. Kelly-Ortega asked the group to review the list of 2012 accomplishments and bring some possible additions to the next meeting. She then led the group in a review of the action plan.

The group discussed having an EJ map overview for the new members at the next meeting. Mr. McVaigh said the District is taking another look at Dr. London's work and work that Cal EPA has been doing on the cumulative risk tool, and will potentially incorporate that information into the District's EJ map. Ms. Sharpe mentioned an upcoming conference by The Central California Justice Network. The conference will be held Nov. 10 and the theme is "Roots of Resistance; Building Environmental Justice for Healthy Communities." She hopes someone from the District will attend.

*Ms. Mares-Alatorre left at 7:05 p.m.

Mr. Williams motioned to approve the 2013 EJAG Action Plan.

Moved: Williams
Seconded: Celedón-Castro
Ayes: Celedón-Castro, Smith, Kelly-Ortega, Vielma, Ruiz, Williams, Sharpe, Jones
Nays: None

Motion passed to approve the 2013 EJAG Action Plan.

*Ms. Garcia was not present for the vote.

12. DECEMBER EJAG MEETING AGENDA ITEMS – The following items will be on the December agenda:

- EJAG 101 Training, Part 2
- PM2.5 Plan Update
- EJ Maps summary and update
- Update EJAG accomplishments

13. PUBLIC COMMENTS (Second Opportunity) – Jeremy Terhune presented copies of a new magazine of which he is on the editorial board. Joaquin Magazine has a reach of about 4,000 Latino readers and is a great source for relaying information

to the Latino community. The magazine includes an environmental section, and next month, he plans to write about air quality and EJAG. Mr. Terhune mentioned the possibility of the District advertising in the magazine. He encouraged members to subscribe and noted that the first six issues are free.

14. EJAG MEMBER COMMENTS – Ms. Vielma introduced her guest, Michael Caponio, executive director of the San Joaquin Bicycle Coalition. Mr. Smith thanked Mr. Caponio for coming and expressed his enthusiasm for biking as the founder of Bike Bakersfield. Mr. Williams asked if EJAG’s action plan can be posted on the District’s website. Mr. McVaigh said the plan will be submitted to APCO Seyed Sadredin for review, the District will consult with CAC in December, and then the plan will be posted on the District’s website. Ms. Garcia shared information and flyers for the Fresno/Madera Medical Society’s event, “Walk with a Doc,” which will be happening all over the Valley for the next several months. The first “Walk with a Doc” will take place on Oct. 27. Ms. Garcia also mentioned a workshop regarding sustainable community strategies on Nov. 7 coordinated by Fresno COG. Ms. Sharpe welcomed the new members and thanked Mr. Terhune for his involvement. Ms. Kelly-Ortega also thanked Mr. Terhune, and said she hopes he continues to be involved with EJAG and considers becoming the alternate at-large representative for San Joaquin County.
15. EJAG MEMBER SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE EJAG REPORT DURING CAC MEETING ON TUESDAY, DECEMBER 4, 2012, AT 10 A.M. – None.
16. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING CAC MEETING TUESDAY, DECEMBER 4, 2012, AT 10 A.M. – Mr. Williams volunteered.

ADJOURN

Meeting adjourned at 7:28 p.m.

NEXT MEETING – The next EJAG meeting is scheduled for Thursday, December 13, 2012, at 5 p.m. Meeting held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.