

GOVERNING BOARD

Craig Pedersen, Chair
Supervisor, Kings County

Lloyd Pareira, Vice Chair
Supervisor, Merced County

Drew M. Bessinger
Mayor, City of Clovis

Vito Chiesa
Supervisor, Stanislaus County

David Couch
Supervisor, Kern County

Christina Fugazi
Councilmember, City of Stockton

Deborah Lewis
Mayor Pro Tem, City of Los Banos

Buddy Mendes
Supervisor, Fresno County

Tania Pacheco-Werner, PhD.
Appointed by Governor

Alvaro Preciado
Mayor Pro Tem, City of Avenal

Monte Reyes
Mayor, City of Porterville

Robert Rickman
Supervisor, San Joaquin County

Alexander C. Sherriffs, M.D.
Appointed by Governor

Amy Shuklian
Supervisor, Tulare County

Tom Wheeler
Supervisor, Madera County

Samir Sheikh
Executive Director
Air Pollution Control Officer

Northern Region Office
4800 Enterprise Way
Modesto, CA 95356-8718
(209) 557-6400 • FAX (209) 557-6475

Central Region Office
1990 East Gettysburg Avenue
Fresno, CA 93726-0244
(559) 230-6000 • FAX (559) 230-6061

Southern Region Office
34946 Flyover Court
Bakersfield, CA 93308-9725
(661) 392-5500 • FAX (661) 392-5585

DATE: March 18, 2021
TO: SJVUAPCD Governing Board
FROM: Samir Sheikh, Executive Director/APCO
Project Coordinator: Michelle L. Franco



RE: **ITEM NUMBER 14: APPROVE ACTION
SUMMARY MINUTES FOR THE SAN JOAQUIN
VALLEY UNIFIED AIR POLLUTION CONTROL
DISTRICT GOVERNING BOARD MEETING OF
THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 18, 2021**

RECOMMENDATION:

Approve the attached Action Summary Minutes.

DISCUSSION:

The following Action Summary Minutes summarize the San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District Governing Board Meeting of Thursday, February 18, 2021.

Attachment:

Action Summary Minutes, SJVUAPCD Governing Board Meeting of Thursday, February 18, 2021 (9 pages)

Action Summary Minutes

San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

GOVERNING BOARD MEETING

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

Thursday, February 18, 2021

9:00 a.m.

Meeting held via Zoom Webinar and video teleconferencing with the Central Region Office (Fresno). This meeting was also webcast. Given the international COVID-19 pandemic, and consistent with the California Department of Public Health's recommendations and Governor Newsom's Executive Order N-29-20, no physical location was provided for public attendance.

1. CALL MEETING TO ORDER – The Chair, Supervisor Craig Pedersen, called the meeting to order at 9:03 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present.

Present:

Drew M. Bessinger, Mayor	City of Clovis
Vito Chiesa, Supervisor	Stanislaus County
David Couch, Supervisor	Kern County
Christina Fugazi, Councilmember*	City of Stockton
Deborah Lewis, Councilmember	City of Los Banos
Buddy Mendes, Supervisor	Fresno County
Tania Pacheco-Werner, Ph.D.	Appointed by Governor
Lloyd Pereira, Supervisor, Vice Chair**	Merced County
Craig Pedersen, Supervisor, Chair	Kings County
Alvaro Preciado, Mayor Pro Tem**	City of Avenal
Monte Reyes, Mayor	City of Porterville
Robert Rickman, Supervisor	San Joaquin County
Alexander Sherriffs, M.D.	Appointed by Governor
Amy Shuklian, Supervisor	Tulare County
Tom Wheeler, Supervisor	Madera County

* Arrived at 9:05 a.m.

**Arrived at 9:06 a.m.

***Arrived at 9:12 a.m.

3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

4. APPROVAL OF CONSENT CALENDAR – Item Numbers (17 – 20): *These matters are routine in nature and are usually approved by a single vote. Prior to any action by the board, the public was given the opportunity to comment on any consent item.*

17. APPROVE ACTION SUMMARY MINUTES FOR THE SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY UNIFIED AIR POLLUTION CONTROL DISTRICT GOVERNING BOARD MEETING OF THURSDAY, JANUARY 21, 2021

18. RECEIVE AND FILE LIST OF SCHEDULED MEETINGS FOR 2021

19. RECEIVE AND FILE OPERATIONS STATISTICS SUMMARY FOR JANUARY 2021

20. RECEIVE AND FILE BUDGET STATUS REPORTS AS JANUARY 31, 2021

Public Comment: None

Moved: Bessinger

Seconded: Mendes

Ayes: Bessinger, Chiesa, Couch, Lewis, Mendes, Pacheco-Werner, Reyes, Rickman, Sherriffs, Shuklian, Wheeler, Pedersen

Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to approve Consent Calendar (Items 17-20)

5. PUBLIC COMMENT – *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Connie Young, Citizens Climate Lobby
- Clare Statham
- Thomas Helme, EJAG Vice Chair
- Sabrina Lockhart, CA Independent Petroleum Assoc.
- Janet Dietz-Kamei
- Matt Holmes

Chairman Pedersen welcomed the District's newest Governing Board member, Councilmember Deborah Lewis, City of Los Banos, to the Board. Councilmember Lewis briefly introduced herself and said she looked forward to having some input into the organization and how things move forward for the future of the San Joaquin Valley.

Chairman Pedersen also announced that former Governing Board member Jerry O'Banion recently passed away and asked Supervisor Pareira to share a few words of remembrance. On behalf of the Governing Board, Chairman Pedersen sent his condolences to the family of Mr. O'Banion.

6. REPORT ON DISTRICT CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE ACTIVITIES – Kevin Abernathy, CAC Chair, reported on highlights from their meeting on February 2, 2021.
7. EXTEND AGREEMENT TO ADMINISTER CARL MOYER MEMORIAL AIR QUALITY STANDARDS ATTAINMENT PROGRAM FUNDS ON BEHALF OF GREAT BASIN UNIFIED AIR POLLUTION CONTROL DISTRICT – Todd DeYoung, Director of Grants and Incentives, presented this item which asked the Board to extend the existing agreement with Great Basin Unified Air Pollution Control District (GBUAPCD) to administer Carl Moyer Memorial Air Quality Standards Attainment Program funds on behalf of GBUAPCD for an additional five years (fiscal years 2021-21 through 2024-25); authorize Executive Director/Air Pollution Control Officer to sign letter to the California Air Resources Board designating the transfer of Carl Moyer Program funding for the next five years from GBUAPCD to the District; and authorize Board Chair to sign letter of appreciation to GBUAPCD, on behalf of the Board, in recognition of their continued partnership in this important program.

Dr. Sherriffs thanked staff and said it was a great recognition by CARB and the other air districts of the great work by District staff along with the transparency in District operations. He said this program was very important to public health because diesel particulates is one of the unhealthiest pollutants out there. He added that upgrading the Moyer Program will also help drive technology, which is another critical aspect of these incentive programs in that they help promote cleaner technologies and bring them to market. He said he was very much in favor of this action and that he appreciated the hard work of staff.

Public Comment: None

Moved: Mendes
Seconded: Bessinger
Ayes: Bessinger, Chiesa, Couch, Fugazi, Lewis, Mendes, Pacheco-Werner, Pereira, Preciado, Reyes, Rickman, Sherriffs, Shuklian, Wheeler, Pedersen
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to extend agreement to administer Carl Moyer Memorial Air Quality Standards Attainment Program funds on behalf of Great Basin Unified Air Pollution Control District

8. APPROVE VOLUNTARY EMISSION REDUCTION AGREEMENT WITH FRIANT WATER AUTHORITY TO MITIGATE AIR QUALITY IMPACTS – Brian Clements, Director of Permit Services, gave the presentation on this item that asked the Board to approve and authorize the Chair to sign the Voluntary Emission Reduction Agreement (VERA) with Friant Water Authority to receive funds in the amount of \$101,908 to mitigate air quality impacts from the Friant-Kern Canal Middle Reach Capacity Correction Project located in Tulare and Kern County.

Dr. Sherriffs said that although this seems like a small project, all reductions matter, and 10 tons of NOx makes a difference. He said this highlights the challenges and the importance of the task at hand.

Supervisor Wheeler said this project was very important right now, as we cannot afford to lose a drop of water and redoing some parts of that canal is so important.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Christine Zimmerman, Western States Petroleum Association

Moved: Mendes

Seconded: Pareira

Ayes: Bessinger, Chiesa, Couch, Fugazi, Lewis, Mendes, Pacheco-Werner, Pareira, Preciado, Reyes, Rickman, Sherriffs, Shuklian, Wheeler, Pedersen

Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to approve Voluntary Emission Reduction Agreement with Friant Water Authority to mitigate air quality impacts

9. UPDATE ON DISTRICT'S RESPONSE TO COVID-19 PANDEMIC – Morgan Lambert, Deputy APCO, provided an update to the Board on the District's response to the COVID-19 pandemic to date.

Chairman Pedersen expressed frustration regarding the vaccine rollout and the recent shift to the third-party administrator and My Turn application. He said in his county they are already experiencing some major difficulties with this app, which is allowing people from outside the area to flood their region and sign up for the vaccine. He said statewide every agency that has been responsible is really frustrated with the state rollout.

Dr. Pacheco-Werner thanked staff for all of the work they continue to do during the pandemic to move things forward. She noted that the Center for Disease Control (CDC) published a report this month that found that the U.S. life expectancy actually lowered by a whole year due to the pandemic, which is very significant when you are talking about the entire country and such a short period of time. She added for non-Hispanic, black individuals, it actually lowered 2.7 years and 1.9 years for Hispanic individuals. She said she was mentioning this because it brings even more urgency to the work that we are doing at the District because of the detrimental impacts that the pandemic has had on individuals. She said anything we can do to mitigate the air quality effects on health will be of great help to the entire communities that we serve. In closing, she said this report was a call to double down on all of our efforts for attainment of the air quality standards.

Dr. Sherriffs thanked Dr. Pacheco-Werner for being here and magnifying the disparities that relate to air pollution and climate impacts on health. He asked staff what lessons are to be learned about all of this remote work and how different will the District look in a year in terms of how we are providing services. In addition, he asked what was learned about how much space we need, and about the value of people doing work remotely.

Mr. Sheikh thanked Dr. Sherriffs for his great question, and reaffirmed the point made by Dr. Pacheco-Werner. The District has been using these points in advocacy efforts with the Governor and the budget process to highlight the importance of doubling down and making the connection to the importance of funding as it relates to air quality.

On the issue of remote work, Mr. Sheikh added we definitely want to ramp operations back at our offices and allow for in person interactions once it is safe to do so. He added telecommuting will definitely be more of an option for staff. He said we have proven that it works very effectively, on the other hand, we are local government and service providers and will need to strike the appropriate balance. He said he hoped this would provide an opportunity for District staff to share, not only our successes in this space, but others that have also been coming up with innovative measures, perhaps creating forums where we can information share with other agencies and employers.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Matt Holmes
- Manuel Cunha, Nisei Farmers League
- Janet Dietz-Kamei

10. DISCUSS NEXT STEPS FOR ATTAINMENT PLANNING EFFORTS FOR FEDERAL PM 2.5 AND OZONE STANDARDS – Jon Klassen, Director of Air Quality and Analysis, and Jessi Fierro, Assistant District Counsel, provided an update to the Board on the District's status and next steps for attainment planning efforts for federal PM2.5 and ozone standards.

Chairman Pedersen thanked staff and said this presentation was an excellent resource to help the new Board members understand the challenges faced by the Valley in meeting the air quality standards.

Mayor Bessinger commented when we put things in this black box, we also need to speak to the areas that we have no control over that caused us not to be in attainment and quantify those so that if we get to the point in some future situation where EPA wants to implement draconian measures, that we can point out these areas.

Supervisor Wheeler thanked staff for the excellent summary and presentation. He asked Mr. Sheikh to share previous experiences with the difficulty of lobbying

in Washington, D.C., and explaining the Valley's air quality issues to Congress.

Dr. Sherriffs gave hats off to staff for putting this together and helping make sense of such a complicated subject. He asked for more information on the commitment to public engagement, because that is so important and critical in terms of public trust about what we do. He said with the challenging things we have to put forward to achieve these health and scientific based standards, if public engagement is not until mid-2022 that will be too late.

Mr. Sheikh said the Board has always gone above and beyond in public engagement, noting that the Board has always made that a guiding principle and staff have always tried to come up with innovative ways to get the public involved in the process. He said we will be leaning on that experience, along with some of the more recent experiences we have had in coming up with even new public engagement opportunities through AB 617. In addition, he said there would continue to be workshops and scoping meetings to talk about some of the things covered today, in addition to meetings that are a bit more focused on some of the really important categories of issues.

Supervisor Chiesa complimented staff on the great presentation. He thanked Mr. Sheikh for always setting time ahead of these meetings to prep Governing Board members. He said staff is preparing an orientation session for newer Governing Board members, and he was looking forward to participating.

Supervisor Mendes commented this was a very in-depth explanation of a very complex topic. He said staff was extremely knowledgeable in this area and know it forwards and backwards, no matter how complicated it is, which is really refreshing. He said he was happy that Chairman Pedersen suggested more orientation on this subject because the Board needs to have a very in depth understanding of the subject matter.

Dr. Pacheco-Werner reiterated Dr. Sherriffs' comments about public engagement and said while non-traditional, the District's increased use of social media could also be an added tool for engagement on this issue. In terms of speaking about the guiding principles, including efforts to assess public health impacts, she said she was wondering if staff have some initial thoughts on how they are doing that or anything more they can provide on that aspect.

Mr. Sheikh responded, in the past, staff uses a variety of tools too really highlight not only the importance of the plan and the reductions in achieving the public health benefits, but also trying to quantify in various ways, what could be achieved or what would be achieved though meeting attainment. In this case of the federal standard, he said there are some models that are available and studies have been done that try to provide estimates of some of the various health-related benefits related to premature mortality, reduced emergency room visits, or other health-related points that we can try to quantify.

Dr. Pacheco-Werner thanked Mr. Sheikh and said that CARB will be funding a study and perhaps the District can leverage some of what they are already funding to help inform our estimates as well.

Mayor Pro Tem Preciado thanked staff for a very concise report with a lot of history and thanked Mr. Sheikh for being open to comments in reaching out to rural disadvantaged communities. He said he was very proud to be a Board member at the District.

Public Comment – *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Matt Holmes
- Janet Dietz-Kamei
- Thomas Helme, EJAG Vice Chair

Dr. Sherriffs highlighted the tone of collaboration in this report, which is important. He added this report emphasizes not finger pointing and saying it is not our responsibility but how do we work together and get out of our silos. How we look for the commonalities to achieve these scientifically determined, health related goals. He added he liked this report because it points us in the direction of collaboration with EPA on working for better mileage and emissions standards, for working to support CARB's waiver authority, because that is how we can have a positive impact on mobile sources, and working with the Bay Area on how to collaborate and find common incentive money that helps us both achieve our goals.

In closing, Chairman Pedersen thanked staff for this important and informative presentation. He added that being able to bring EPA and CARB to the table with respect to mobile sources is critical given our responsibility lies with stationary sources.

11. AUTHORIZE CONTRIBUTION OF UP TO \$37,500 IN FUNDING TO COUNCIL OF FRESNO COUNTY GOVERNMENTS TO SUPPORT PHASE 2 INLAND PORT FEASIBILITY STUDY – Tom Jordan, Senior Policy Advisor, presented this item which asked the Board to approve a contribution of up to \$37,500 in funding, leveraged with \$212,500 in public and private match funding from the South Coast Air Quality Management District, Sacramento Air Quality Management District, Ports of Los Angeles and Long Beach, to conduct a study on the feasibility of developing new transportation infrastructure to shift shipping containers from trucks to rail via an inland port system; and, authorize the Executive Director/APCO, with Board Chair signature, to negotiate and enter into agreement with the Council of Fresno County Governments, pending adequate funding commitments from other funding partners, for this project and make administrative changes to the project as necessary on behalf of the Board.

Supervisor Wheeler commented that this is a prime example of how we could help on the previous presentation, as most of our PM2.5 comes from trucks

going up and down Valley roads. He said this was a great plan.

Supervisor Mendes commented this was a great deal. He added there would be red tape with the Railroad Commission as there is not a lot of cooperation with railroads, but this will help.

Supervisor Pereira voiced his support for the District's involvement in this study.

Public comment: *None*

Moved: Mendes
Seconded: Bessinger
Ayes: Bessinger, Chiesa, Couch, Fugazi, Lewis, Mendes,
Pereira, Preciado, Reyes, Rickman, Sherriffs, Shuklian,
Wheeler, Pedersen
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to authorize contribution of up to \$37,500 in funding to Council of Fresno County Governments to support Phase 2 Inland Port Feasibility Study

12. APPOINT AD HOC BUDGET SUBCOMMITTEE – Mr. Sheikh said the purpose of this item was to ask the Chair to appoint an ad hoc subcommittee to review and provide direction on the draft 2021 District Budget.

Supervisor Chiesa left at 12:03 p.m.

Chairman Pedersen appointed Supervisor Shuklian, Councilmember Lewis, Mayor Pro Tem Lewis, Mayor Pro Tem Preciado, Supervisor Wheeler, and himself to the ad hoc budget subcommittee.

13. APPOINT AD HOC SUBCOMMITTEE FOR HEARING BOARD REAPPOINTMENTS AND APPROVE INTERIM REAPPOINTMENTS OF PUBLIC MEMBERS GROUP – Mr. Lambert gave a brief overview of the District's Hearing Boards. He said the terms of the current public members are set to expire at the end of this month and staff recommended appointing two Governing Board members from each region to consider and evaluate reappointment. In addition, he said staff recommended the Board authorize a 3-month extension for the public members' terms to ensure there are sufficient Hearing Board members to satisfy meeting quorum requirements as we go through the reappointment process.

Chairman Pedersen appointed himself, Supervisor Mendes, Supervisor Chiesa, Supervisor Pereira, Mayor Reyes, and Supervisor Couch to the ad hoc subcommittee for Hearing Board reappointments.

Public comment: *None*

Moved: Bessinger
Seconded: Mendes
Ayes: Bessinger, Couch, Fugazi, Lewis, Mendes, Pacheco-Werner,
Pareira, Preciado, Reyes, Rickman, Sherriffs, Shuklian,
Wheeler, Pedersen
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to approve interim reappointments of Hearing Board Public members group

14. VERBAL REPORT ON CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD ACTIVITIES – Mr. Sheikh said that CARB did not hold a meeting in January, 2021.
15. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Mr. Sheikh said that staff is planning to hold a series of two orientation sessions for the five newer Governing Board members to provide additional information on the District’s role and operations to help prepare and accelerate the learning curve for the newer Board members.
16. GOVERNING BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS – Supervisor Mendes said he, Supervisor Pacheco, and Mr. Cunha would be meeting with Fresno County Department of Public Health Director, David Pomaville, to discuss getting residents vaccinated under the My Turn website because a lot of residents in the community will need help navigating this program. Dr. Pacheco-Werner offered to help wherever she could.

Chairman Pedersen expressed frustration with the inability to integrate the old vaccine list to the My Turn system.

Mayor Reyes commented that today was a sad day for the City of Porterville as it marked one year since their library fire and the tragic loss of Captain Figueroa and Firefighter Jones.

Chairman Pedersen adjourned the meeting at 12:12 p.m.

ADJOURN

The next scheduled meeting of the Governing Board is: Thursday, March 18 2021, at 9:00 a.m. The meeting starts at 9:00 a.m., in the Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno. The meeting will be held via Zoom audio and video teleconference (VTC).