

) **Effective to:** May 8, 2026

1. VITRO operates a flat glass manufacturing plant located at 3333 South Peach Avenue in Fresno, California.
2. The subject equipment is the wet scrubber, electrostatic precipitator (EP), continuous emissions monitoring system (CEMS), and the continuous opacity monitoring system (COMS).
3. The operation of the subject equipment is authorized by duly issued District permits.

Petitioner Vitro Flat Glass LLC
Docket No. C-26-08S
Date April 15, 2026
Page 2

BACKGROUND

VITRO operates a 206 MMBtu per hour Oxy-fuel/natural gas-fired furnace that heats raw material into molten glass to produce flat architectural glass.

Oxides of nitrogen (NO_x) emissions are reduced with an oxy-fuel process that removes the available nitrogen from the combustion air. To control oxides of sulfur (SO_x) and particulate matter (PM) the exhaust gas is routed through a wet scrubber and an Electrostatic Precipitator (EP). The EP operates by establishing a high voltage electrical charge on the discharge plates inside the unit. PM from the exhaust stream passes through the discharge plates, receiving an electrical charge. The charged particulate is then deposited on the grounded collector plates and is periodically knocked off with pneumatic rappers, falling into a hopper and routed back into the glass manufacturing process.

VITRO engineering staff routinely monitor the EP voltage for changes in the field strength, which is an indication of material buildup in the EP that leads to a loss of power. They have determined that an EP cleanout is needed to maintain compliance with District Rules. During the cleanout VITRO also plans to replace the Field 2 electrical transformer and the Variable Frequency Drive (VFD) on the fan motor.

The emission control equipment must be bypassed in order to clean out the EP. District Rule 4354 allows for excess NO_x, VOC, CO, SO_x, and PM₁₀ emissions for up to 144 hours per year during maintenance of emission control equipment. If everything goes as planned, VITRO will complete all the maintenance within 144 hours (six days).

In addition, VITRO's facility wide permit and District Rule 4101 limits visible emissions to no more than Ringelmann 1 or 20% opacity for more than 3 minutes in any one hour. VITRO expects excess visible emissions to be as high as 30% opacity while the emissions control equipment is bypassed. During bypass, the exhaust stream will be diverted to the bypass stack. This will also bypass the continuous emissions monitoring system (CEMS) and the continuous opacity monitoring system (COMS) required by the permit and Rule 4354 which are both located in the main stack.

Therefore, VITRO has requested a short variance to bypass the emission control and monitoring systems, and to operate with excess visible emissions, while they conduct the scheduled maintenance. Variance protection is necessary because the glass-melting furnace, once heated up, operates non-stop for many years in what is known as a "campaign." A shut off or cool down may cause significant damage to the furnace and can take several days. Getting a furnace back to operational temperature can take several weeks.

RULE REQUIREMENTS

1. The equipment subject to this variance is regulated by the following District Rules:
 - A. 1080 – *Stack Monitoring*
 - B. 2070 – *Standards for Granting Applications*
 - C. 2201 – *New and Modified Stationary Source Review Rule*
 - D. 2520 – *Federally Mandated Operating Permits*
 - E. 4101 – *Visible Emissions*
 - F. 4354 – *Glass Melting Furnaces*

Petitioner Vitro Flat Glass LLC
Docket No. C-26-08S
Date April 15, 2026
Page 3

G. CH&SC section 41701

2. District Rules 2070 and 2520 require that the subject equipment be operated in accordance with the conditions of the applicable permits. District Rules 1080, 2201, and 4354 sets applicable emission limits and standards for emissions and require the use of CEMS. Rule 4101 and CH&SC section 41701 sets visible emission limits.

FINDINGS OF FACT

Pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 42352, the following findings have been made:

1. ***That the petitioner for a variance is, or will be, in violation of Section 41701 or of any rule, regulation, or order of the District.***

The Hearing Board finds that when visible emissions exceed 20 percent opacity and the emission control and monitoring systems are bypassed, VITRO will be in violation of District Rules 1080, 2070, 2201, 2520, 4101, 4354, and CH&SC section 41701, as well as applicable conditions of the permits.

2. ***That, due to conditions beyond the reasonable control of the petitioner, requiring compliance would result in either (1) an arbitrary or unreasonable taking of property, or (2) the practical closing and elimination of a lawful business.***

The Hearing Board finds that it is beyond the reasonable control of the petitioner to keep the EP operational at all times. The District requires the equipment to be operated in accordance with the manufacturer's specifications, which requires periodic repair and maintenance. VITRO's engineering staff routinely monitor the EP voltage for changes in the field strength, which is an indication of material buildup that leads to a loss of power. Vitro has determined that an EP cleanout is needed to maintain compliance with District Rules. In order to complete the maintenance, it is necessary to shut down and bypass the emissions control equipment. Because a glass melting furnace is designed to run continuously for a multi-year campaign, requiring compliance would require the glass furnace to shut down and to stop production; this would be the practical closing and elimination of a lawful business.

3. ***That the closing or taking would be without a corresponding benefit in reducing air contaminants.***

The Hearing Board finds that VITRO would lose \$200,000 per day due to lost sales, labor costs, and energy costs if they were not allowed to continue to manufacture glass. The closing or taking would also be without a corresponding benefit in reducing air contaminants as the furnace would have to be shut down. The proposed maintenance period is expected to take no more than six days. The shutdown of the furnace would take several days, and the startup would take several weeks. The shutdown could result in damage to the furnace as well. To start the furnace back up, VITRO would have to submit a start-up plan to the District and bring in a specialized crew to bring a glass melting furnace up to temperature without causing any damage. A cold start of the furnace would produce considerable emissions before the furnace comes up to temperature and the EP is hot enough to restart. For these reasons, a closing or taking would be without a corresponding benefit in reducing air contaminants.

Petitioner Vitro Flat Glass LLC
Docket No. C-26-08S
Date April 15, 2026
Page 4

4. *That the applicant for the variance has given consideration to curtailing operations of the source in lieu of obtaining a variance.*

The Hearing Board finds that VITRO considered curtailing operations but found that it would not obviate the need for a variance. Curtailing production will not limit visible emissions to below 20%.

5. *During the period, the variance is in effect, that the applicant will reduce excess emissions to the maximum extent feasible.*

The Hearing Board finds that VITRO will perform the work as expeditiously as practicable.

6. *During the period the variance is in effect, that the applicant will monitor or otherwise quantify emission levels from the source, if requested to do so by the District, and report these emissions levels to the District pursuant to a schedule established by the District.*

The Hearing Board finds that VITRO will monitor visible emissions from the source by using personnel certified in visible emissions evaluations. This information will be provided to the District at the end of the variance.

GENERAL COMMENTS

The Hearing Board also finds that a nuisance as defined in District Rule 4102 is not expected to occur as a result of this variance. Nor would continued operation likely create an immediate threat or hazard to public health or safety.

It should be noted that the United States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), which monitors major sources, might not recognize this variance. VITRO should be aware that the EPA could take enforcement action on this matter if it deems such action is appropriate.

CONCLUSIONS AND ORDER

NOW, THEREFORE, the CENTRAL REGION HEARING BOARD ORDERS that a short variance be granted to VITRO, subject to the following conditions:

1. The variance shall be effective from May 3, 2026, to May 8, 2026, or until the scheduled maintenance is completed and the emission control equipment is returned to compliant operation, whichever occurs first.
2. Relief shall be granted from the requirements of the applicable sections of District Rules 1080, 2070, 2201, 2520, 4101, 4354, and CH&SC section 41701. In addition to the following permit conditions:
 - A. Conditions 6 and 23 of C-948-0-4 and
 - B. Conditions 2, 7, 11, 12, 15, 16, 22 & 34, of C-948-11-22.

Petitioner Vitro Flat Glass LLC
Docket No. C-26-08S
Date April 15, 2026
Page 5

3. The variance shall allow the continued operation of the glass melting furnace and continued glass production with excess visible emissions while bypassing the emission control equipment and emissions monitoring equipment.
4. VITRO shall notify the District 48 hours prior to going into bypass mode. Notification shall be sent by email to Preet Bath at Preet.Bath@valleyair.org.
5. Visible emissions shall not exceed 30% opacity or Ringelmann 3 during the variance period.
6. VITRO shall conduct a visible emissions evaluation 1 time per day during daylight hours. Determination of visible emissions shall be made in accordance with EPA Method 9 with a minimum of 24 consecutive observations recorded in fifteen-second intervals. The person(s) monitoring visible emissions shall be certified by CARB to read visible emissions. A written report of each visible emissions evaluation shall be maintained and a copy shall be provided to the District along with the summary report.
7. VITRO shall document the bypass time and shall count it towards their 144 hours of annual maintenance allowed per Rule 4354, section 5.10.
8. At the conclusion of this variance VITRO must be in compliance with all their permit conditions and applicable District Rules. If VITRO will not achieve compliance prior to conclusion of this variance they must contact the District as soon as possible and before the variance period ends.
9. A Federal Title V deviation report shall be submitted to the District within 10 days of discovery each time a Federal Title V permit condition is violated. It should be noted that multiple deviation reports may need to be submitted during this variance period. The deviation report must be sent to the facility inspector.
10. Should the facility experience operational conditions likely to cause a public nuisance, VITRO shall cease operations causing the problems and take all necessary actions to abate the problem immediately.
11. By May 23, 2026 or no later than 15 calendar days after returning the emissions control equipment to compliant operation, whichever occurs first, VITRO shall submit to the District a summary report. If the report due date should fall on a day the District is closed, it shall be due the next business day. The report shall include the following:
 - A. A summary of all actions and activities undertaken during the variance period,
 - B. The date(s), time(s), and duration that the emission control equipment was offline,
 - C. Documentation of the visible emissions observations, including the name of person(s) responsible for conducting the visible emission evaluation and copies of their CARB certification, and
 - D. The required certification of truth and accuracy, and completeness, signed by the designated responsible official of the limited liability company, as required by Sections 9.13.1 and 10.0 of District Rule 2520 – *Federally Mandated Operating Permits*.

Petitioner Vitro Flat Glass LLC
Docket No. C-26-08S
Date April 15, 2026
Page 6

12. The end of variance summary report shall be submitted to the attention of:

Will Coon
SJVAPCD, Compliance Department
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue
Fresno, CA 93726
Telephone: (559) 230-5878
E-mail: will.coon@valleyair.org

13. Failure to comply with any condition of this variance may render the variance null and void with the possibility of enforcement action taken that may include monetary penalties.

THE FORGOING DECISION IS APPROVED:

MOTION: Robertson **SECOND:** Goodwin

Ayes: Robertson, Goodwin, Hartwig, Soldani
Noes: None
Abstained: None
Recused: None
Absent: Mulligan

THE FOREGOING DECISION IS APPROVED:

Signed by:


Daniel Hartwig, Chair
Hearing Board – Central Region
San Joaquin Valley APCD

4/21/2026

Date

ATTEST:

Signed by:


Katrina Rojas, Deputy Clerk to the Boards

4/21/2026

Date

Certificate Of Completion

Envelope Id: C1919D71-4E03-4131-94B5-C4F19415DC6F

Status: Completed

Subject: Complete with Docusign: Docket C-26-08S.pdf

Source Envelope:

Document Pages: 6

Signatures: 2

Envelope Originator:

Certificate Pages: 5

Initials: 0

Diseree Alvarez

AutoNav: Enabled

1990 E GETTYSBURG AVE

Envelopeld Stamping: Enabled

FRESNO, CA 93726

Time Zone: (UTC-08:00) Pacific Time (US & Canada)

Diseree.Alvarez@valleyair.org

IP Address: 12.219.204.245

Record Tracking

Status: Original

Holder: Diseree Alvarez

Location: DocuSign

4/21/2026 4:08:28 PM

Diseree.Alvarez@valleyair.org

Security Appliance Status: Connected

Pool: StateLocal

Signer Events

Signature

Timestamp

Daniel Hartwig

dthartwig@gmail.com

Security Level: Email, Account Authentication
(None)

Signed by:

F1EBF8A9B30346F...

Sent: 4/21/2026 4:09:28 PM

Viewed: 4/21/2026 4:14:22 PM

Signed: 4/21/2026 4:14:49 PM

Signature Adoption: Drawn on Device

Using IP Address: 2a04:4e41:2603:9d81::b0ac:8d81

Signed using mobile

Electronic Record and Signature Disclosure:

Accepted: 4/21/2026 4:14:22 PM

ID: aace1de9-f936-4ad7-8e0f-1dd6f6fc79f7

Katrina Rojas

katrina.rojas@valleyair.org

Operations Support Supervisor

Security Level: Email, Account Authentication
(None)

Signed by:

5A5039220E1D454...

Sent: 4/21/2026 4:14:50 PM

Viewed: 4/21/2026 4:20:21 PM

Signed: 4/21/2026 4:20:29 PM

Signature Adoption: Drawn on Device

Using IP Address: 12.219.204.250

Electronic Record and Signature Disclosure:

Not Offered via Docusign

In Person Signer Events	Signature	Timestamp
Editor Delivery Events	Status	Timestamp
Agent Delivery Events	Status	Timestamp
Intermediary Delivery Events	Status	Timestamp
Certified Delivery Events	Status	Timestamp
Carbon Copy Events	Status	Timestamp
Witness Events	Signature	Timestamp
Notary Events	Signature	Timestamp
Envelope Summary Events	Status	Timestamps
Envelope Sent	Hashed/Encrypted	4/21/2026 4:09:29 PM
Certified Delivered	Security Checked	4/21/2026 4:20:21 PM

Envelope Summary Events	Status	Timestamps
Signing Complete	Security Checked	4/21/2026 4:20:29 PM
Completed	Security Checked	4/21/2026 4:20:29 PM
Payment Events	Status	Timestamps
Electronic Record and Signature Disclosure		

ELECTRONIC RECORD AND SIGNATURE DISCLOSURE

From time to time, SJVAPCD (we, us or Company) may be required by law to provide to you certain written notices or disclosures. Described below are the terms and conditions for providing to you such notices and disclosures electronically through the DocuSign system. Please read the information below carefully and thoroughly, and if you can access this information electronically to your satisfaction and agree to this Electronic Record and Signature Disclosure (ERSD), please confirm your agreement by selecting the check-box next to 'I agree to use electronic records and signatures' before clicking 'CONTINUE' within the DocuSign system.

Getting paper copies

At any time, you may request from us a paper copy of any record provided or made available electronically to you by us. You will have the ability to download and print documents we send to you through the DocuSign system during and immediately after the signing session and, if you elect to create a DocuSign account, you may access the documents for a limited period of time (usually 30 days) after such documents are first sent to you. After such time, if you wish for us to send you paper copies of any such documents from our office to you, you will be charged a \$0.00 per-page fee. You may request delivery of such paper copies from us by following the procedure described below.

Withdrawing your consent

If you decide to receive notices and disclosures from us electronically, you may at any time change your mind and tell us that thereafter you want to receive required notices and disclosures only in paper format. How you must inform us of your decision to receive future notices and disclosure in paper format and withdraw your consent to receive notices and disclosures electronically is described below.

Consequences of changing your mind

If you elect to receive required notices and disclosures only in paper format, it will slow the speed at which we can complete certain steps in transactions with you and delivering services to you because we will need first to send the required notices or disclosures to you in paper format, and then wait until we receive back from you your acknowledgment of your receipt of such paper notices or disclosures. Further, you will no longer be able to use the DocuSign system to receive required notices and consents electronically from us or to sign electronically documents from us.

All notices and disclosures will be sent to you electronically

Unless you tell us otherwise in accordance with the procedures described herein, we will provide electronically to you through the DocuSign system all required notices, disclosures, authorizations, acknowledgements, and other documents that are required to be provided or made available to you during the course of our relationship with you. To reduce the chance of you inadvertently not receiving any notice or disclosure, we prefer to provide all of the required notices and disclosures to you by the same method and to the same address that you have given us. Thus, you can receive all the disclosures and notices electronically or in paper format through the paper mail delivery system. If you do not agree with this process, please let us know as described below. Please also see the paragraph immediately above that describes the consequences of your electing not to receive delivery of the notices and disclosures electronically from us.

How to contact SJVAPCD:

You may contact us to let us know of your changes as to how we may contact you electronically, to request paper copies of certain information from us, and to withdraw your prior consent to receive notices and disclosures electronically as follows:

To contact us by email send messages to: imtiazh.haq@valleyair.org

To advise SJVAPCD of your new email address

To let us know of a change in your email address where we should send notices and disclosures electronically to you, you must send an email message to us at imtiazh.haq@valleyair.org and in the body of such request you must state: your previous email address, your new email address. We do not require any other information from you to change your email address.

If you created a DocuSign account, you may update it with your new email address through your account preferences.

To request paper copies from SJVAPCD

To request delivery from us of paper copies of the notices and disclosures previously provided by us to you electronically, you must send us an email to imtiazh.haq@valleyair.org and in the body of such request you must state your email address, full name, mailing address, and telephone number. We will bill you for any fees at that time, if any.

To withdraw your consent with SJVAPCD

To inform us that you no longer wish to receive future notices and disclosures in electronic format you may:

- i. decline to sign a document from within your signing session, and on the subsequent page, select the check-box indicating you wish to withdraw your consent, or you may;
- ii. send us an email to imtiazh.haq@valleyair.org and in the body of such request you must state your email, full name, mailing address, and telephone number. We do not need any other information from you to withdraw consent.. The consequences of your withdrawing consent for online documents will be that transactions may take a longer time to process..

Required hardware and software

The minimum system requirements for using the DocuSign system may change over time. The current system requirements are found here: <https://support.docusign.com/guides/signer-guide-signing-system-requirements>.

Acknowledging your access and consent to receive and sign documents electronically

To confirm to us that you can access this information electronically, which will be similar to other electronic notices and disclosures that we will provide to you, please confirm that you have read this ERSD, and (i) that you are able to print on paper or electronically save this ERSD for your future reference and access; or (ii) that you are able to email this ERSD to an email address where you will be able to print on paper or save it for your future reference and access. Further, if you consent to receiving notices and disclosures exclusively in electronic format as described herein, then select the check-box next to 'I agree to use electronic records and signatures' before clicking 'CONTINUE' within the DocuSign system.

By selecting the check-box next to 'I agree to use electronic records and signatures', you confirm that:

- You can access and read this Electronic Record and Signature Disclosure; and
- You can print on paper this Electronic Record and Signature Disclosure, or save or send this Electronic Record and Disclosure to a location where you can print it, for future reference and access; and
- Until or unless you notify SJVAPCD as described above, you consent to receive exclusively through electronic means all notices, disclosures, authorizations, acknowledgements, and other documents that are required to be provided or made available to you by SJVAPCD during the course of your relationship with SJVAPCD.